Action Minutes
Planning & Development Department
Land Use Planning Division

Zoning Adjustments Board
Thursday, November 14, 2013- 7:00 PM

City Council Chambers, 2134 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, Second Floor
Berkeley, CA  94704 (Wheelchair Accessible)

How to Contact Us:  Land Use Planning Division (Attn: Debbie Sanderson, ZAB Secretary), 2120 Milvia Street, Berkeley, CA 94704; (510) 981-7410; zab@ci.berkeley.ca.us

Roll Call:  7:00 PM

Present:
- Michael Alvarez Cohen (Chairperson), appointed by Councilmember Wozniak
- Deborah Matthews (Vice Chairperson), appointed by Mayor Bates
- Robert Allen, appointed by Councilmember Wengraf
- Shoshana O’Keefe, appointed by Councilmember Anderson
- Sophie Hahn, appointed by Councilmember Worthington
- Steven Donaldson, appointed by Councilmember Moore
- Prakash Pinto, appointed by Councilmember Maio
- Igor Tregub, appointed by Councilmember Arreguin

Excused:
- George Williams, appointed by Councilmember Capitelli

Substitutions:
- David Stoloff for George Williams

Members of the Public
- Present: 48
- Speakers: 32

Ex Parte Communication Disclosures
In the context of adjudicative matters that come before the ZAB, ex parte communications are those which occur outside the formal hearing process. ZAB members should avoid ex-parte contacts on matters pending before the ZAB as much as possible, as they may represent, or be perceived to represent, the receipt of evidence that can unfairly influence a Board member’s decision on a matter before the Board. If such contacts do occur, they must be placed in the record and disclosed to all interested parties sufficiently in advance of the decision to allow rebuttal.
I. Tregub – Received a call from Rebecca Saltzman to discuss the transit benefits of the 2701 Shattuck project. Received a call from Eugene Turitz to discuss ZAB procedures and when the 2701 Shattuck project was to go before the Board.

R. Allen – Received phone calls from the 2701 Shattuck project architect Ken Lowney and attorney Rena Rickles regarding the changes to the project since the last ZAB meeting.

M. Cohen – Exchanged emails with Dean Metzger regarding the 2701 Shattuck project.

P. Pinto – Went to a meeting with the applicant of the 2701 Shattuck project to discuss the recent changes to the project. Had a meeting with Councilmember Maio to discuss development projects in general.

Public Comment
Each Speaker is limited to a maximum of three minutes.
Gale Garcia – Encouraged ZAB not to approve projects that are detrimental to surrounding neighborhoods, specifically the upcoming project at the Landmark Bartlett Site, 2201-2205 Blake Street and related application at 2204 Dwight Way.

Agenda Changes
The Board Chairperson may reorder the agenda at the beginning of the meeting.

Consent Calendar:
The Consent Calendar allows the Board to take action with no discussion, on projects to which no one objects. The Agenda includes three types of Consent Calendar items: (1) Approval of previous meeting minutes; (2) Modifications of existing Use Permits (which have not been noticed for public hearings); (3) Items being continued to another meeting (Board action has been postponed to another meeting). The Board Chairperson will announce items for the Consent Calendar at 7:05 pm. The Board may place additional Agenda items on the Consent Calendar, if no one present wishes to testify on an item. Anyone present who wishes to speak on an item should raise his or her hand and advise the Chairperson, and the item will be pulled from the consent calendar. Modification Projects may be discussed by the Board at this meeting or set for a public hearing at a later meeting. Items already noticed for a public hearing will be heard following Continued Items, or, if necessary, posted for a public hearing at a subsequent meeting.

### 1. Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Minutes from 10/10/2013 meeting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Continued From:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motion / Second:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VOTE:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

VOTE: 6-0-3-0 (Abstain: R. Allen, D. Stoloff, P. Pinto)
Continued Public Hearing:

2. 2701 Shattuck Avenue

**Use Permit #12-10000039** to construct a 29,909 square foot, 60’/5-story, mixed-use building to include 67 dwelling units, a 1,956 square foot, full serve restaurant with incidental service of beer and wine, and 32 parking spaces.

**CEQA Action:** Categorically Exempt under Section §15332 ‘In-Fill Development’.

**Applicant:** Muhammad A. Nadhiri, Axis Development Group, 580 California St., 16th Floor, San Francisco, CA 94104

**Zoning:** C-SA, “Commercial, South Area District”; **Planner:** Greg Powell

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Continued From:</th>
<th>09/26/2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation:</td>
<td>HOLD a public hearing, and DENY the project for the reasons stated in Sections IV.B and IV.F of the staff report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action:</td>
<td>DENIED Use Permit #12-10000039, with revisions and additions to the Findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motion / Second:</td>
<td>S. Hahn / S. O’Keefe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Speakers:</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote:</td>
<td>6-3-0-0 (No: R. Allen, S. Donaldson, D. Stoloff)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

New Public Hearings:

3. 1608 Beverly Place

**Use Permit #2013-0038** to construct an 846-square-foot, second-story addition for a total of five bedrooms in an existing home located on a property that is non-conforming for lot coverage (project reduces coverage from 43% to 41.6% where 40% is the maximum).

**CEQA Action:** Categorically Exempt under Section §15301 ‘Existing Facilities’.

**Applicant:** Stacy Eisenmann, 853 Ramona Ave., Albany, CA 94706

**Property Owner:** Ben and Amy Chen, 1608 Beverly Pl., Berkeley, CA 94707

**Zoning:** R-1, “Single-Family Residential District”; **Planner:** Leslie Mendez

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Continued From:</th>
<th>None</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation:</td>
<td>APPROVE Use Permit #2013-0038 pursuant to Section 23B.32.040 and subject to the attached Findings and Conditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action:</td>
<td>APPROVED on consent.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motion / Second:</td>
<td>D. Matthews / S. Hahn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Speakers:</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vote:</td>
<td>9-0-0-0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. **1760 Solano Avenue**

**Use Permit Modification #13-70000004** to modify Use Permit #96-10000002 that approved a wireless telecommunication facility consisting of nine antennas and accompanying equipment on the roof of an office building. The application proposes to replace four antennas, two cabinets and one GPS antenna.

**CEQA Action:** Categorically Exempt under Section §15301 ‘Existing Facilities’.

**Applicant:** Misako Hill, for Sprint, 1075 45th St., Emeryville, CA 94608

**Property Owner:** Dorothy W. Intorf Trust, 5510 N. Camino Del Lazo, Tucson, AZ 85750

**Zoning:** C-SO, “Solano Avenue Commercial District”; **Planner:** Claudine Asbagh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Continued From</th>
<th>None</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recommendation:</strong></td>
<td>APPROVE Use Permit Modification #13-70000004 pursuant to Section 23B.32.040 and subject to the attached Findings and Conditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action:</strong></td>
<td>APPROVED on consent.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Motion / Second:</strong></td>
<td>D. Matthews / S. Hahn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong># of Speakers:</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vote:</strong></td>
<td>9-0-0-0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. **2517 Virginia Avenue**

**Use Permit # 12-10000035** to create one new 702 square-foot dwelling unit in an existing 8-unit apartment building.

**CEQA Action:** Categorically Exempt under Section §15301 ‘Existing Facilities’.

**Applicant:** Rene Cardinaux, 4233 Brown’s Ln., Petaluma, CA 94954

**Property Owner:** Adel Yassin, 2025 Rose St., Ste. 100, Berkeley, CA 94709

**Zoning:** R-3H, “Multiple Family Residential District, Hillside Overlay”; **Planner:** Claudine Asbagh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Continued From</th>
<th>None</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recommendation:</strong></td>
<td>APPROVE Use Permit #12-10000035 pursuant to Section 23B.32.040 and subject to the attached Findings and Conditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action:</strong></td>
<td>APPROVED on consent.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Motion / Second:</strong></td>
<td>D. Matthews / S. Hahn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong># of Speakers:</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vote:</strong></td>
<td>9-0-0-0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Additional Agenda Items:

The following agenda items may be discussed, but no action may be taken unless a specific item is listed on this agenda.

A. Information/Communication
   2014 Local Hazard Mitigation Plan Update
      i. The Board provided Staff with feedback and suggestions regarding the 2014 Local Hazard Mitigation Plan Update.

B. Discussion Item
C. Business Item
D. Chairperson’s Report
E. Current Business/Committee Appointment
F. Future Agenda Items
G. Other Matters
   Future Council Hearings on ZAB Decisions
      i. 596 Spruce Street, 11/12/2013
      ii. 3001 Telegraph Avenue, 11/19/2013

Adjourn: 10:45 PM
Correspondence and Notice of Decision Requests

- Communications to Berkeley boards, commissions or committees are public record and will become part of the City’s electronic records, which are accessible through the City’s website. **Please note: e-mail addresses, names, addresses, and other contact information are not required, but if included in any communication to a City board, commission or committee, will become part of the public record.** If you do not want your e-mail address or any other contact information to be made public, you may deliver communications via U.S. Postal Service or in person to the secretary of the relevant board, commission or committee. If you do not want your contact information included in the public record, please do not include that information in your communication. Please contact the secretary to the relevant board, commission or committee for further information.

- **To distribute correspondence to Board members prior to the meeting date** -- submit comments **by 12:00 noon, seven (7) days before the meeting.** Please provide 15 copies of any correspondence with more than ten (10) pages or if in color or photographic format.

- Correspondence received by 4:00 pm the Tuesday before the meeting will be posted on the ZAB web site for review by the Board and public prior to the meeting. Correspondence received later, and after the meeting, will be posted to the web site following the meeting.

- Any correspondence received after this deadline will be given to Board members on the meeting date just prior to the meeting.

- Staff will not deliver to Board members any additional written (or e-mail) materials received after 12:00 noon on the day of the meeting.

- Members of the public may submit written comments themselves early in the meeting. To distribute correspondence at the meeting, please provide 15 copies and submit to the Zoning Adjustments Board Clerk just before or at the beginning of the meeting.

- Written comments, or a request for a Notice of Decision should be directed to the ZAB Secretary at: Land Use Planning Division (Attn: Debbie Sanderson, ZAB Secretary), 2120 Milvia Street, Berkeley, CA 94704 OR at zab@ci.berkeley.ca.us.

**Accessibility Information / ADA Disclaimer**

This meeting is being held in a wheelchair accessible location. To request a disability-related accommodation(s) to participate in the meeting, including auxiliary aids or services, please contact the Disability Services specialist at 981-6342 (V) or 981-6345 (TDD) at least three business days before the meeting date. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting.

**SB 343 Disclaimer**

Any writings or documents provided to a majority of the Commission regarding any item on this agenda will be made available for public inspection at the Permit Service Center, Planning and Development Department located at 2120 Milvia Street, Berkeley, during regular business hours.

**Notice Concerning Your Legal Rights**

If you object to a decision by the Zoning Adjustments Board regarding a land use permit project, the following requirements and restrictions apply:

1. If you challenge the decision of the City in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues you or someone else raised at the public hearing described in this notice, or in written correspondence delivered to the Zoning Adjustments Board at, or prior to, the public hearing.
2. You must appeal to the City Council within fourteen (14) days after the Notice of Decision of the action of the Zoning Adjustments Board is mailed. It is your obligation to notify the Land Use Planning Division in writing of your desire to receive a Notice of Decision when it is completed.

3. Pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6(b) and Government Code Section 65009(c)(1), no lawsuit challenging a City Council decision, as defined by Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6(e), regarding a use permit, variance or other permit may be filed more than ninety (90) days after the date the decision becomes final, as defined in Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6(b). Any lawsuit not filed within that ninety (90) day period will be barred.

4. Pursuant to Government Code Section 66020(d)(1), notice is hereby given to the applicant that the 90-day protest period for any fees, dedications, reservations, or other exactions included in any permit approval begins upon final action by the City, and that any challenge must be filed within this 90-day period.

5. If you believe that this decision or any condition attached to it denies you any reasonable economic use of the subject property, was not sufficiently related to a legitimate public purpose, was not sufficiently proportional to any impact of the project, or for any other reason constitutes a “taking” of property for public use without just compensation under the California or United States Constitutions, the following requirements apply:
   A. That this belief is a basis of your appeal.
   B. Why you believe that the decision or condition constitutes a “taking” of property as set forth above.
   C. All evidence and argument in support of your belief that the decision or condition constitutes a “taking” as set forth above.
   If you do not do so, you will waive any legal right to claim that your property has been taken, both before the City Council and in court.