



PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
LAND USE PLANNING DIVISION

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ACTION MINUTES

Date: Thursday, December 7, 2017
Time: 7:01 PM
Place: North Berkeley Senior Center, 1901 Hearst Avenue
Attendees: Approximately 22

The Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) packet is available for review at the Berkeley Main Library (2090 Kittredge St.) and the Permit Service Center (1947 Center St.)

The Commission consists of nine members appointed by City Council:

Christopher Adams, District 5
Phil Allen, District 2
Tom Beil, District 1
Shannon Brown, District 8, absent excused
Zach Carter, District 7, absent excused
Alfred Twu as substitute for Kathleen Crandall, District 3
Steven Finacom, (**Chairperson**), District 4
Carrie Olson as substitute for Becky O'Malley, Mayor
Paul Schwartz (**Vice Chairperson**), District 6



ACCESSIBILITY INFORMATION / ADA DISCLAIMER

This material is available in alternative formats upon request. Alternative formats include audio-format, braille, large print, electronic text, etc. To request alternative formats, please contact the Disability Services Specialist Ella Callow at: Email: ecallow@cityofberkeley.info; Phone: 1-510-981-6418; TTY: 1-510-981-6347, and allow 7-10 days for production of the material in an alternative format.

This meeting is being held in a wheelchair accessible location. To request a disability-related accommodation(s) to participate in the meeting, including auxiliary aids or services, please contact the Disability Services Specialist Ella Callow at: Email: ecallow@cityofberkeley.info; Phone: 1-510-981-6418; TTY: 1-510-981-6347, at least three business days before the meeting date. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting.

For inclusion in the Commissioners' agenda packet, please submit written comments by Wednesday the week prior to the meeting. One set of "late communications" will be distributed to the Commissioners two days before the meeting. Please submit any material for distribution as "late communications" no later than 12 noon on the Tuesday prior to the meeting. Please be advised: Commissioners do not have an opportunity to read written materials handed out at the meeting.

** INDICATES THAT THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION RECEIVED DOCUMENTS (NOTICES OF DECISION, STAFF REPORTS, APPLICATION MATERIALS OR CORRESPONDENCE) AS PART OF THE PACKET THAT WAS DELIVERED PRIOR TO THIS MEETING.

Correspondence and Notice of Decision Requests

- **To distribute correspondence to Commission members *prior to the meeting date* -- submit comments *by 12:00 noon, Thursday prior to the meeting*.** Please provide 15 copies of any correspondence with more than ten (10) pages or if in color or photographic format. This method is strongly preferred.
- Correspondence received by between noon the Thursday the week before the meeting and noon Tuesday the week of the meeting will be posted on the Commission web site for review by the Commission and public prior to the meeting. Any correspondence received after noon on Tuesday the week of the meeting and before noon on Thursday the day of the meeting, will be made available at noon that Thursday.
- Any correspondence received after this deadline will be given to Commission members on the meeting date just prior to the meeting. Correspondence received later, and after the meeting, will be posted to the web site following the meeting.
- Staff will not deliver to Commission members any additional written (or e-mail) materials received after 12:00 noon on the day of the meeting.
- Members of the public may submit written comments themselves at the meeting. To distribute correspondence at the meeting, please provide 15 copies and submit to the Landmarks Preservation Commission Secretary. **Please be advised: You are strongly advised to submit written comments *prior to the meeting date* as Commission members do not have an opportunity to read written materials handed out at the meeting.**
- Written comments or request for a Notice of Decision should be directed to the Landmarks Preservation Commission Secretary.

Communications to Berkeley boards, commissions or committees are public record and will become part of the City's electronic records, which are accessible through the City's website. **Please note: e-mail addresses, names, addresses, and other contact information are not required, but if included in any communication to a City board, commission or committee, will become part of the public record. If you do not want your e-mail address or any other contact information to be made public, you may deliver communications via U.S. Postal Service or in person to the secretary of the relevant board, commission or committee. If you do not want your contact information included in the public record, please do not include that information in your communication. Please contact the secretary to the relevant board, commission or committee for further information.**

Contact:

Fatema Crane, Senior Planner, Landmarks Preservation Commission Secretary
(510) 981-7413 | FCrane@CityofBerkeley.info | 1947 Center Street, Berkeley CA 94704

Request for initiation of Landmark designation on a future agenda lies within the range of action to be considered on each structure or property appearing at any place on the agenda.

Consent Calendar: The Consent Calendar allows the Commission to take action, without discussion, on Agenda items for which there are no persons present who wish to speak, and no members who wish to discuss. The Consent Calendar may include the following: (1) Approval of previous meeting minutes; (2) Items being continued to another meeting (action will be postponed to another meeting) or withdrawn by the applicant; and (3) Items noticed for public hearing which the Commission decides to move to the Consent Calendar. The Chairperson will announce any additional items proposed for the Consent Calendar at the beginning of the meeting. Anyone present who wishes to speak against one of these items should advise the Chairperson if they request the item be pulled from the Consent Calendar.

** Indicates that the Landmarks Preservation Commission received documents (notices of decision, staff reports, application materials or correspondence) as part of the packet that was delivered prior to this meeting.

1. **ROLL CALL** Please put all cellular phones and ringers on silent during the meeting.
Brown and Carter absent and not replaced by substitutes; Crandell absent, replaced by Twu as substitute, and O'Malley absent, replaced by Olson as substitute; all other Commissioners present.
2. **EX-PARTE COMMUNICATIONS:** In the context of adjudicative matters that come before the LPC, ex-parte communications are those which occur outside of the formal hearing process. LPC members should avoid ex-parte contacts on matters pending before the LPC as much as possible, as they may represent, or be perceived to represent, the receipt of evidence that can unfairly influence a decision on a matter before the Commission. If such contacts do occur, they must be placed in the record and disclosed to all interested parties sufficiently in advanced of the decision to allow rebuttal.
3. **PUBLIC COMMENT on Non-Agenda and Information Items** (Three minutes per person; five minutes per organization, or at the discretion of the Chairperson)
None.
4. **AGENDA CHANGES**
Action: Move item 6A to occur before item 5A.
M/S/C: Olson/Schwartz
Vote: 7-0-0-2
5. **ACTION**
 - A. **2740 Telegraph Avenue Structural Alteration Permit (LMSAP#2017-0002) – the Rose Garden Inn****
Open the continued hearing and then consider a request to make exterior alterations at a City Landmark property, in accordance with BMC Section 3.24.230.
Speakers: 3

10 minute Recess taken from 8:25 PM – 8:35 PM

Action: Approve the Structural Alteration Permit and adopt findings #1-4, 6, and 8 in the document provided by Finacom instead of staff's recommended findings. In finding #1, remove sentence "In cases where windows removed were leaded or stain glass, the applicant shall search for the original windows and if they cannot be located, have them replicated to reflect original appearance, using existing windows and historic photographs for guidance"; and make this an advisory comment. Delete "as illustrated in Figure 1, attached" in finding #6.
M/S/C: Olson/Schwartz
Vote: 7-0-0-2

Action: Form an Ad-Hoc Subcommittee consisting of Commissioners Adams, Beil, and Finacom to advise the ongoing renovation work; make Items #5, 7, and 9-10, and the sentence from item #1 advisory comments to the applicant.
M/S/C: Olson/Schwartz
Vote: 7-0-0-2

** Indicates that the Landmarks Preservation Commission received documents (notices of decision, staff reports, application materials or correspondence) as part of the packet that was delivered prior to this meeting.

6. DISCUSSION/REVIEW**A. Civic Center Park - maintenance and repair work underway**

The Parks, Recreation and Waterfront (PRW) Director will present a brief presentation summarizing the current PRW work.

Refer to previous memo and photos provided by the LPC Chairperson November 2, 2018

Speakers: 1

Action: Comment as follows: *The Commission is comfortable with painting the outer walls of the fountain area to protect it, with the expectation that it will eventually be restored and that the fountain will have a new top and will be filled with gravel and dirt, and planted, preferably with some bright colors and that benches can be painted. The Commission requests that more lighting be added to the fountain area, as well as two more porta pottys. And, in 2019 we look forward to the process for the second round of T-1 funding, and we would like the fountain be considered for restoration at that time.*

M/S/C: Olson/Schwartz

Vote: 7-0-0-2

7. ACTION**A. [2270 Acton Street](#) Landmark or Structure of Merit (LMIN#2017-0005) designation for the Berkeley Lawn Bowl Club site****

Open the continued hearing and then consider a request to grant designation status to this property, in accordance with BMC Section 3.24.130.

Speakers: 9

Action: Contine the public hearing to March to allow for additional research.

M/S/C: Olson/Schwartz

Vote: 6-0-1-2

Yes: Adams, Allen, Beil, Finacom, Olson, Schwartz; No: none; Abstain: Twu;

Absent: Brown, Carter.

B. [1120 Second Street](#) Structural Alteration Permit (LMSAP#2017-0005) for the City Landmark Municipal Incinerator site**

Open the public hearing and then consider a request to make exterior alterations at a City Landmark property, in accordance with BMC Section 3.24.230.

Speakers: 1

Action: Approve with Structural Alteration Permit with the screen wall design..

M/S/C: Twu/Olson

Vote: 5-2-0-2

Yes: Adams, Allen, Beil, Olson, Twu; No: Finacom, Schwartz; Abstain: none;

Absent: Brown, Carter.

C. Appointment of LPC Member to Design Review Committee

Appoint a Commission member as the LPC representative on the Design Review Committee in accordance with BMC Section 23B.08.C

Action: Nominate Commissioner Finacom as the LPC representative on the Design Review Committee.

M/S/C: Olson/Schwartz

Vote: 5-0-2-2

Yes: Adams, Allen, Beil, Olson, Schwartz; No: none; Abstain: Finacom, Twu;

Absent: Brown, Carter

** Indicates that the Landmarks Preservation Commission received documents (notices of decision, staff reports, application materials or correspondence) as part of the packet that was delivered prior to this meeting.

8. DISCUSSION/REVIEW**A. [Certified Local Government \(CLG\) Annual Report](#) to the Office of Historic Preservation****

Review and comment on the draft CLG Annual Report as part of the CLG reporting requirements.

9. AD HOC Subcommittee or Liaison Comments: Opportunity reports on status of projects for which the LPC has established a subcommittee or liaison. (Note: Site will come off the subcommittee list upon approval of a Certificate of Occupancy)**A. ZAB Design Review Committee (CL)****B. Berkeley Rose Garden (CA, PS)****C. Landmark Policies and Procedures (BO, SF)****D. BART Plaza Project (CA, SF)****E. Resiliency Strategy (CL)****F. CLG Annual Grant (CA)****G. Measure T-1 (PA, SB, SF)****H. 2524 Dwight Way - Structural Alteration Permit (CA, TB, SF)****I. 2740 Telegraph - Structural Alteration Permit (CA, TB, SF, CL)****10. ACTION: Approval of Action Minutes** - November 2, 2017 Meeting Action Minutes**

Action: Approve Draft Action Minutes with a correction to Ex-Parte Communications Item B and C, to include the date of the ex-parte contact as April 11, 2016.

M/S/C: Adams/Beil

Vote: 5-0-2-2

Yes: Adams, Allen, Beil, Finacom, Olson,; No: none; Abstain: Schwartz, Twu; Absent: Brown, Carter

11. INFORMATION REPORTS Commissioners may ask for discussion to be scheduled on a future agenda (per Brown Act, no deliberation or final action may be taken).**12. LATE COMMUNICATIONS****A. Graphic re: 2740 & 2744 Telegraph Structural Alteration Permit application – Commissioner Finacom****B. Draft findings re: 2740 & 2744 Telegraph Structural Alteration Permit application– Commissioner Finacom****C. Landmark Application for 2301 Bancroft Way (LMIN#2017-0006) – Commissioner Finacom****D. Memo to LPC re: CLG Grant Application– Commissioner Finacom****13. COMMISSIONER ANNOUNCEMENTS****14. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS****15. FUTURE COUNCIL CALENDAR ITEMS – tentative dates****A. 2526-30 Shattuck Avenue (LMIN #2017-0002) Landmark designation appeal to City Council – April 3, 2018****B. 2524 Dwight Way Structural Alteration Permit (LMSAP#2016-0007) Notice of Decision – TBD pending coordination with future ZAB action**

** Indicates that the Landmarks Preservation Commission received documents (notices of decision, staff reports, application materials or correspondence) as part of the packet that was delivered prior to this meeting.

- C. 4 Greenwood Common Mills Act Contract (LMMA#2017-0001) Notice of Decision** – January 30, 2018
- D. 2910-12 Telegraph Avenue Mills Act Contract (LMMA#2017-0002) Notice of Decision** – January 30, 2018

16. POTENTIAL INITIATIONS

The Commission may establish and maintain an ongoing list of structures, sites and areas having a special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value. After public hearings, the Commission may initiate landmark and historic district designations from the list.

- A.** 2362 Bancroft Way-Trinity United Methodist Church (3/1/99)
- B.** Berkeley High School, Building C, 1920; W. C. Hayes (LE 9/13/99)
- C.** John Galen Howard Power Station, UC Campus (CO 4/3/00)
- D.** H.C. Macaulay Foundry, 811 Carleton Street (4/3/00)
- E.** UC Storage Station, James Plachek, Architect (4/3/00)
- F.** "Kittredge Street Historic District" - 2124 Kittredge Street (Elder House and storefront),
- G.** 2138 Kittredge Street (Fitzpatrick House and storefront), and 2117 Kittredge Street (A.H. Broad House and storefront) (JK 11/5/2001)
- H.** 1842-1878 Euclid Avenue (CO 9-14-07)
- I.** Berkeley High School Campus Historic District (SW 1/3/08)
- J.** 2746 Garber Street (SW 3/5/09)
- K.** 1901 Bonita Avenue (CO 11/16/10)
- L.** 1920 Bonita Avenue (CO 11/16/10)
- M.** 1940 Channing Way (CO 11/16/10)
- N.** 1920 Haste Street (CO 11/16/10)
- O.** 2414 Shattuck Avenue (CO 11/16/10)
- P.** Terminal Place (alley) (CO 11/16/10)
- Q.** 2041 University Avenue (CO 11/16/10)
- R.** 1907 Walnut Street (CO 11/16/10)
- S.** 1922 Walnut Street (CO 11/16/10)
- T.** 1925 Walnut Street (CO 11/16/10)
- U.** 1930 Walnut Street (CO 11/16/10)
- V.** 2482-2498 Telegraph Avenue And 2445-2449 Dwight Way (CO 12/7/11)
- W.** 2301-2315 Telegraph Avenue / 2445-2449 Dwight Way (CO 12/7/11)
- X.** 2328-2346 Telegraph Avenue / 2441-2447 Durant Avenue (CO 12/7/11)
- Y.** 2400-2402 Telegraph Avenue / 2486-2498 Channing Way (CO 12/7/11)
- Z.** 2410-2422 Telegraph Avenue (CO 12/7/11)
- AA.** 3049 Adeline Street (CO 3/12/12)
- BB.** "Manoa Historic District"- 2530 Dwight Way, 2524 Dwight Way, 2503 Regent Street, 2509 Regent Street, 2511 Regent Street, 2515 Regent Street, 2517 Regent Street, 2506 Dwight Way, 2502 Dwight Way/2501 Telegraph Avenue, 2512–2516 Regent Street/2525 Telegraph Avenue (CO 3/12/12)
- CC.** 1400 Sixth Street (CO 6/7/13)
- DD.** 1409 Scenic Avenue (CO 9/3/15)
- EE.** 1301 Shattuck Avenue, Live Oak Park (CO 2/2/17)
- FF.** 2750-2770 Marin Avenue, Pacific Lutheran Theological Seminary (LPC 5/4/17)
- GG.** 100 Berkeley Square (SF 6/1/17)
- HH.** 741 Cedar Street (CO 7/6/17)
- II.** 745 Cedar Street (CO 7/6/17)
- JJ.** 749 Cedar Street (CO 7/6/17)
- KK.** 2212 Fifth Street (CO 7/6/17)

** Indicates that the Landmarks Preservation Commission received documents (notices of decision, staff reports, application materials or correspondence) as part of the packet that was delivered prior to this meeting.

- LL. 837 Folger Avenue (CO 7/6/17)
- MM. 1517 Fourth Street (CO 7/6/17)
- NN. 808 Gilman Street (CO 7/6/17)
- OO. 830 Gilman Street (CO 7/6/17)
- PP. 832 Gilman Street (CO 7/6/17)
- QQ. 836 Gilman Street (CO 7/6/17)
- RR. 1018 Pardee Street (CO 7/6/17)
- SS. 1336 Sixth Street (CO 7/6/17)
- TT. 1345 Sixth Street (CO 7/6/17)

17. CURRENT LAND USE PROJECTS (BMC SECTION 23B.24.030.B)

<http://www.cityofberkeley.info/ContentDisplay.aspx?id=62826>

Projects proposing demolition of buildings greater than forty years old

A. Non-Residential Structures (BMC Section 23C.08.050)

2556 Telegraph	ZP2015-0096
3000 Shattuck	ZP2015-0229
600 Addison	ZP2015-0238
2720 San Pablo	ZP2016-0014
2072 Addison	ZP2016-0020
2190 Shattuck	ZP2016-0117
2527 San Pablo	ZP2016-0207
1486 University	ZP2016-0216
2510 Channing	ZP2017-0003
2009 Addison	ZP2017-0004
1740 San Pablo	ZP2017-0014
2580 Bancroft	ZP2017-0083

B. Residential Structures

1155-1173 Hearst	ZP2016-0028
2229 Seventh	ZP2016-0098
2212 Tenth	ZP2016-0129
2129 Ninth	ZP2016-0179
2323 Eighth	ZP2016-0223
2621 Tenth	ZP2017-0043
2527 Glen	ZP2017-0060
912 Cedar	ZP2017-0109
2851 Buena Vista	ZP2017-0145

18. ADJOURN

Action: Adjourn (10:40 PM)

M/S/C: Schwartz/Olson

Vote: 7-0-0-2

** Indicates that the Landmarks Preservation Commission received documents (notices of decision, staff reports, application materials or correspondence) as part of the packet that was delivered prior to this meeting.