



L A N D M A R K S
P R E S E R V A T I O N
C O M M I S S I O N

S T A F F R E P O R T

FOR COMMISSION ACTION
APRIL 2, 2015

Campanile Way, UC Berkeley Campus

Consideration of City of Berkeley, Landmark designation

I. Application Basics

A. Land Use Designation:

- General Plan: Institutional

B. CEQA Determination: The designation qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15061 of the Public Resources Code, Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

C. Parties Involved:

Designation Initiation: Application of Residents

Property Owner: Regents of the University of California
1111 Franklin Street, FL 6
Oakland, CA 94607

Figure 1: Campanile Way and Surrounding Landmarks



Figure 2: Campanile Way, the UC Berkeley Campus, and Surroundings



I. Background

At the November 6, 2014 LPC meeting the LPC reviewed the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) for the 2211 Harold Way Mixed-Use Project, including the Historic Resources Technical Report (HRTR)
http://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Planning_and_Development/Level_3_-_ZAB/Draft%20EIR_Appendix_part3.pdf .

During the public comment period on the Draft EIR, community members raised concerns about potential impacts of the high-rise project to views from Campanile Way. The DEIR included the consideration of potential impacts to the views from Campanile Way under *Cultural Resources*. The Draft EIR identifies Campanile Way as a contributor to the Classical Core of the UC Berkeley Campus and therefore as a historical resource whose views are character-defining features, finding that the project would introduce new construction into the view, but not destroy it; in particular the formal view, from the center of the base of the Campanile, over the City below. As a result, the analysis found that impacts would be less than significant, and as such no mitigation measures were identified (CR-3).

During the Commission discussion on the Draft EIR, including potentially significant impacts and appropriate mitigation measures and alternatives to reduce or avoid those impacts, a community member suggested the Commission declare the view itself a historical resource, separate from Campanile Way and the Campus. A motion was made (Wagley, Pietras) that the Draft EIR was deficient because the view corridor from the Campanile to the Golden Gate should be considered a historical resource that is impacted by the project and alternatives should be provided for its preservation (6-1-1-0; Nay: Schwartz, Abstain: Beil). The motion, along with commissioner and public comments, were submitted as comments to be addressed in the Response to Comments document.

On November 25, 2014 a Landmark Initiation for Campanile Way roadway and environs was submitted by at least fifty residents of the City. Pursuant to Section 3.24.130 the public hearing was set in January within seventy days of the initiation. Absent an application, the item was continued to February and March, and finally to April 2, 2015 to allow for review of the application submitted at the end of February.

Table 1: Project Chronology

Date	Action
November 25, 2014	Landmark Initiation Application Submitted by at Least Fifty Residents of the City
December 10, 2014	Property Owner Notice of Application to Initiate Landmark Designation
December 29, 2014	Public Notice: LPC Public Hearing on January 8, 2015
January 8, 2015	LPC Opens Public Hearing
January 8, 2015	LPC Continues Public Hearing to February 5, 2015 Meeting
February 5, 2015	LPC Continues Public Hearing to March 5, 2015 Meeting
February 26, 2015	Landmark Application Resubmitted
March 5, 2015	LPC Opens Public Hearing and Continues Item to April 2, 2015 Meeting

II. Property Description

The landmark application describes the property as follows. Campanile Way and its immediate environs, occupy a zone approximately 1,200 to 1,300 feet in an east / west direction, and approximately 100 feet wide in a north / south dimension. The roadway width within this zone varies, but was originally approximately 25 feet wide, bordered by planting zones on either side that extended back to the facades of the adjacent buildings. The roadway descends in elevation approximately 100 feet from east to west, at a relatively uniform grade. For context, the base of the Campanile is at an elevation of about 325 feet above sea level. Beginning at its western end, Campanile Way is terminated and anchored by a circa 1908 masonry bridge over the south branch of Strawberry Creek. From the 1908 Bridge, Campanile Way proceeds in a slight curve to the north/northwest between the Valley Life Sciences Building (VLSB, completed 1930) on the north, and a grove of California Live Oaks to the south. The road then ascends at a gentle grade and in a straight line to the east, centered on the Campanile. Eastward of the California Live Oak grove and a lawn area is a parking lot. The next uphill section is flanked on the south by Dwinelle Hall (c. 1950s), and on the north by a landscaped area east of VLSB. Harmon Way, runs at right angles to Campanile Way and extends north across this landscaped area from the entrance of Dwinelle Hall. East of Dwinelle Hall a diagonal pathway from the southeast enters Campanile Way, followed by Durant Hall (originally Boalt Hall, c. 1911). A non-contributing modern sunken plaza is located at the west side of Durant Hall. East of the Harmon Way landscaped area California Hall (c. 1905) sits on a low terrace, symmetrically aligned north of Durant Hall. The massing of the northern end of Durant Hall and the southern end of California Hall correspond. Immediately east of California Hall and Durant Hall is Sather Road, a north / south axial roadway that crosses Campanile Way at right angles. Immediately east of, and uphill from, Sather Road are sloped hillside landscape zones rising to the massive blocks of Doe Library (c. 1908-11) on the north and Benjamin Ide Wheeler Hall (c. 1917) on the south. Beyond these buildings the eastern end of Campanile Way is flanked by the Doe Annex (c. 1950, informally known as Bancroft Library building) on the north and South Hall (c. 1873), the original building constructed on the campus, on the south.

III. Existing Designations

(1982) National Register of Historic Places

<http://pdfhost.focus.nps.gov/docs/nrhp/text/64000062.PDF>

The UC Berkeley Campus was listed on the National Register as a Multiple Resource Area in 1982, and includes Campanile Way and the Esplanade, located on the central campus. “By their location, orientation toward major and minor axes, and Neo-Classic architectural style, they define the formal, turn-of-the-century concept of the University.” The nomination breaks the resources down into two main types: a. Individual Buildings or Structures, and b. Buildings or Groups of Buildings and Their Landscaped Settings. Campanile Way and the Esplanade are included under the second category as one of four such groups, with Sather Tower and the Esplanade, South Hall, Wheeler Hall, Durant Hall, Doe Memorial Library, and California Hall contributing to the group. Found significant for their associations with architecture and events, this group of buildings, “together with the landscaped setting defined by the district boundaries, comprises the original core of the permanent campus of the first State University in California. The buildings are grouped and sited in accordance with the first official plan for the Berkeley campus, the Phoebe Apperson Hearst Architectural Plan, adopted by the Regents in 1914. ... Campanile Way, running east-west on axis with the Golden Gate, has symbolized its link with what was then the country’s principal western gateway. Two minor north-south axes further define the grouping of the buildings, create vistas, and provide major circulation paths for the campus as a whole. The lower axis continues through Sather Gate to Sproul Plaza and Telegraph Avenue, the campus’ main public gateway on the south side and an historically famous intersection of ‘town and gown’. On the eastern edge of the district, the Esplanade of Sather Tower is the most important formally designed and landscaped space on the campus.”

(2004) Landscape Heritage Plan, University of California Berkeley

http://www.cp.berkeley.edu/lhp/index_flash.html

The UC Berkeley 2004 Landscape Heritage Plan (LHP) is referenced both in the Landmark Application and the Historic Resources Technical Report (HRTR) for the 2211 Harold Way Mixed-use Project Draft EIR. The LHP identifies Campanile Way as a contributing element to the Classical Core of the UC Berkeley Campus historic designed landscape, as a major pedestrian access in the heart of the Classical Core and a strong east-west visual axis, connecting the tower with the Golden Gate.

Section 2 of the LHP details the significance of the Classical Core’s cultural landscape, its context within the evolution of American campus design, and its historical chronology; in order to provide a foundation for making decisions regarding the restoration, rehabilitation, and enhancement of the Core’s sensitive landscape. Regarding National Register of Historic Places criteria, this section states that: under Criterion A (Events), UC Berkeley demonstrates national significance as the first federal land grant public university in the state of California; the first Agricultural Experiment Station in the state of California; and for its early collection and study of exotic botanical plant specimens; under Criterion B (People), UC Berkeley has a distinguished list of master landscape architects and architects whose collective work has defined the campus: Frederick Law Olmsted, Sr.; William Hammond Hall; John Galen Howard; John W. Gregg; Lawrence Halprin;

Garret Eckbo; Robert N. Royston, and Thomas D. Church; and under Criterion C (Architecture), the classical core retains a layered collage of three significant internationally recognized landscape design movements: the picturesque era (approximately from the 1820s); the beaux-arts neoclassical era (approximately from the 1897-1899 Phoebe Hearst Competition) ; and the modern era (approximately from the 1929 Depression to the 1970s).

(2005) UC Berkeley 2020 Long Range Development Plan

http://www.cp.berkeley.edu/LRDP_final/section_9.3.pdf

The UC Berkeley 2020 Long Range Development Plan (LRDP) approved by the Regents of the University in 2005, guides UC Berkeley staff in managing campus stewardship and development programs (LRDP EIR Vol. 1 page 1-1). The LRDP includes the objective “Maintain and enhance the image and experience of the campus, and preserve our historic legacy of landscape and architecture.” In part to accomplish that end, the 2020 LRDP includes design guidelines for the Campus Park, within which Campanile Way is designated a “View & openspace preservation zone” (page 64). Campanile Way is an exterior space with developed edges, and both minimum and maximum setbacks are defined on either side in order to protect the landscape element; and to reinforce the continuity of its spatial enclosure.

Although the University is constitutionally exempt from local regulations when using its property for educational purposes, projects are evaluated for consistency with local plans and policies. In accordance with CEQA, historical resources which have been locally designated but are not on the California or National registers are considered Secondary Historical Resources, and are presumed significant unless a preponderance of evidence demonstrates otherwise.

IV. Analysis

Landmarks Preservation Ordinance Designation Criteria

To designate a property as a landmark, the LPC must find that the property meets one or more of the criteria delineated in Landmarks Preservation Ordinance (LPO) Section 3.24.110. In order to analyze potential findings the application needs to include: the location and boundaries of the landmark (legal description); and accompanying data required by the commission, including the characteristics which justify its designation and the particular features that should be preserved.

The Landmarks Preservation Ordinance (Section 3.24.110) lists the following criteria which the commission shall use when considering structures, sites and areas for landmark designation:

1. Architectural merit:

- a. Property that is the first, last, only or most significant architectural property of its type in the region;
- b. Properties that are prototypes of or outstanding examples of periods, styles, architectural movements or construction, or examples of the more notable works or the best surviving work in a region of an architect, designer or master builder;

- c. Architectural examples worth preserving for the exceptional values they add as part of the neighborhood fabric.
2. Cultural value: Structures, sites and areas associated with the movement or evolution of religious, cultural, governmental, social and economic developments of the City;
3. Educational value: Structures worth preserving for their usefulness as an educational force;
4. Historic value: Preservation and enhancement of structures, sites and areas that embody and express the history of Berkeley/Alameda County/California/United States.

History may be social, cultural, economic, political, religious or military;

5. Any property which is listed on the National Register described in Section 470A of Title 16 of the United States Code.

The application is evaluated pursuant to the relevant Ordinance criteria below:

1b) Architectural Merit: *Properties that are prototypes of or outstanding examples of periods, styles, architectural movements or construction, or examples of the more notable works or the best surviving work in a region of an architect, designer or master builder.*

Consistent with National Register criterion C (architecture) the classical core of the UC Berkeley Campus, designed and constructed in accordance with the 1914 Master Plan as an example of the Beaux Arts campus architectural style designed by preeminent Supervising Campus Architect John Galen Howard within the period of 1897 through 1924. Campanile Way is significant as a contributing landscape element and exterior space within the classical core.

2) Cultural Value: *Structures, sites and areas associated with the movement or evolution of religious, cultural, governmental, social and economic developments of the City.*

Consistent with National Register criterion A (events) Campanile Way is associated with the development patterns of the University of California Berkeley campus, the first federal land grant public university in the state of California; beginning with the picturesque framework established in the 1870s by Frederick law Olmsted, overlaid with the dominant classical forms and axes of the Phoebe Hearst Architectural Plan by Benard and John Galen Howard's master plan of 1914, and interlaced with the modern interventions of Thomas Church in the mid-20th century.

5) National Register: *Any property which is listed on the National Register described in Section 470A of Title 16 of the United States Code.*

Consistent with the UC Berkeley Campus Multiple Resource Area listing in the National Register for its association with architecture and events, it is presumed that Campanile Way would be eligible for listing as a City landmark for its architectural merit and cultural value as a historical landscape element within the original core of the permanent campus of the first State University in California, running east-west on axis with the Golden Gate, and along which the buildings are grouped and sited in accordance with the first official plan for the Berkeley campus, the Phoebe Hearst Architectural Plan, adopted by the Regents in 1914.

Character-defining Features

Consistent with Section 3.24.100 of the Landmarks Ordinance, the Landmark Application identifies the following significant features of Campanile Way that should be preserved:

1. **Roadway.** The presence of a central, linear, roadway, slightly crowned in the center, extending from South Hall Road to the 1908 Bridge, approximately 20-25 feet wide and running straight, without deviation from South Hall Road to north of the center of the Valley Life Sciences Building. At that point the road curves slightly south/southwest in order to intersect with the eastern end of the 1908 Bridge. The curve appears, from early photographs, to mark the point where an original native oak grove of the campus began; thus the road was straight, until it passed into the grove and curved. The one exception to the straight, crowned, roadway evident in some early photographs is the crossing of Sather Road, where the Sather Road surface and sidewalks interrupted Campanile Way, but did not rise above the ground plane.
2. **Statue.** The Tilden Football Players Statue and Class of 1911 marble bench, and associated flagstone pathways, adjoining the south side of the western end of Campanile Way and dating to 1900, 1911, and the 1920s respectively.
3. **Gutters.** Red brick gutters (both original, and restored) found intermittently along portions of the roadway, particularly portions of the edges near the Valley Life Sciences Building. The gutters are significant not only for their composition, but for their location; they exactly define the Howard-era northern edge of Campanile Way.
4. **Plane trees.** London Plane trees, planted in the first quarter of the 20th century and pollarded (trimmed back annually or semiannually to knobby branch ends). These trees form two parallel rows, flanking the original roadway. There were, originally, probably as many as 40 or more trees, but a number were removed for the eastern plaza and at other points along the Way, and some have died and been replaced with younger specimens of the same species.
5. **Class memorial.** The Class of 1940 memorial, north of the northeast corner of Wheeler Hall. Significant features include a multi-trunked white flowering plum tree dating to circa 1940, a stone drinking fountain with bronze basin, and a hexagonal arrangement of bench seating around the tree, on original concrete piers.
6. **Bridge.** The 1908 Bridge, a single arched, reinforced concrete, structure, including original gutters / drains, and wrought iron railings, each containing a six pointed star reflecting the University's original emblem.
7. **Views.**

- **East, towards Sather Tower and the undeveloped slope of upper Charter Hill, beyond.** The undeveloped character of this hillside is an essential feature of the significance since it allows the natural hill to stand as a backdrop to the Campanile, rather than a site for buildings that would visually compete with the view of the tower to those walking east / up Campanile Way.
 - **(Unobstructed), west, from the ground plane of Campanile Way towards San Francisco Bay and the Golden Gate;**
 - **(Unobstructed), south, along Sather Road, towards Sather Gate;**
 - **(Unobstructed), north, along Sather Road,** across the landscape panel of “Sophomore Lawn” between California Hall and Doe Library, to the southern edge of the original “central glade” area north of Doe Library.
8. **Entrance connections. Original entrance connections via formal pathway at right angles to Campanile Way, between the roadway proper and doorways / entrances to pre-1960s buildings;** Durant (Boalt) Hall; California Hall; Doe Library; Wheeler Hall; Valley Life Sciences Building. Although in all cases the paving surface and the constructed entry approaches have been altered, so no original materials appear to be present, the presence of these entrances to five major campus buildings, arranged at right angles to the roadway, emphasizes the formal and central character of not only Campanile Way but the Beaux Arts era on campus. Durant and California Halls each have one entrance; Doe Library has two (one near each corner of the building); Wheeler Hall also has two, also near each corner of the building.
9. **Landscaping. A general landscape character of:** paved central, linear roadway, connected at right angles to formal building entrances / plazas; two rows of pollarded London Plane trees flanking the roadway on either side; low evergreen shrub plantings and low groundcover plantings between the roadway and a zone extending about 20 feet from the adjacent building facades; intermediate “foundation plantings” of somewhat higher shrubs and narrow, columnar, evergreen trees arranged symmetrically close to the facades and at the corners of some of the buildings.
10. **Western end. The relationship, at the western / lower end of Campanile Way** to two flagstone paths (re-set and refurbished in 2014) that date to the 1920s and align with earlier walkways, the Tilden Football Players statue, installed in 1900, and a small marble memorial bench given to the campus about a decade later, south of the Tilden statue. All of these features—statue, bench, flagstone paths, and Campanile Way—are in the same relationship to each other that they were a century ago, and form an important and historic cluster.

3.24.180 Landmarks, Recording Required

The Landmarks Preservation Ordinance (Section 3.24.180) states that when a landmark has been designated, the commission shall cause a copy of the designation to be recorded on the legal description for the property in the Office of the County Recorder. A view corridor is a line of sight (height, width, and distance) of an observer looking toward an object as seen from a route that directs the viewer’s attention. The landmark designation would be linked to the route with the majority of the character-defining features located on the campus, including views south, north, and east from the route. The University is responsible for the preservation of Campanile Way and is exempt from

local land use regulations, yet considers impacts to historical resources on or eligible for the California and National registers under CEQA. The line of sight for multiple views west, however, falls out over the City of Berkeley down below.

Campus Plan Topography. The landmark application notes that because Benard's winning scheme was developed without direct personal reference, he aligned the main axis for the campus with University Avenue and the City street grid, while John Galen Howard's successive revisions returned to the alignment of the axis with views of the Bay. In addition to this analysis, the Commission may want to consider the fact that the unique topography of the campus site was also a key factor in the axis. The guidelines for the competition were specifically amended to request competitors to "respect the general topography of the grounds and to follow it as closely as possible..." (*John Galen Howard and the University of California*) Because Benard's scheme did not address the amended guidelines, it would have resulted in extensive grading of the natural site. Both architects were schooled in the Beaux Arts planning principles of the day, but Howard was able to revise the Plan in a manner that met the programmatic and budgetary needs of the University. "To retain the effect of Benard's plan, Howard proposed a new axis that called for a much smaller expenditure of money and less risk to the natural beauties of the site. The new line, which corresponded to natural drainage and emphasized the view to the Golden Gate, extended from Center Street past the northern edge of the eucalyptus grove and up through the gully that divided North and South Halls and eastward to the great hill above Ben Weed's amphitheatre. This line, Howard noted, had 'the advantage of preserving the entire middle portion of the grounds at approximately their present grade.'" In plan, this line ran from Sather Tower out to the west, while in section the topography was utilized to construct buildings on terraces stepping along an exterior space with a developed edge.

Campus Plan and City Grid. Due to the shift in the alignment of the Classical Core from that of the City grid below, the line of sight spans out over multiple private parcels beyond the campus, rather than over an open public right-of-way. Because of this relationship, both the formal view on-axis from Sather Tower and the dynamic views to be had as one moves north-south along Sather Road and east-west along Campanile Way have changed along with the development of the City. The c.1950 Berkeley Community Theater located on the Berkeley High School campus punctuated these views, as did Campus development such as the c.1988 addition to the Valley Life Sciences Building. Given the evolving nature of these views the term unobstructed proposed in the application may be problematic in describing these features.

Campus Plan and Downtown Height Restrictions. The Downtown Area Plan (DAP) incorporates considerations for height in the Downtown Core Area by limiting the number (three) and height (180' consistent with the historic Chamber of Commerce building) of high-rise buildings allowed. The DAP also includes policies and design guidelines to avoid completely blocking vistas. The vistas studied in the DAP EIR were from prominent outlooks such as the top of the Campanile, which at an approximate elevation of 632 feet, is well above the established height limits in the Downtown Area Core. More specifically restrictive view corridors are most commonly regulated within public parklands; or with zoning overlays on private property fronting malls to maintain views of public monuments and/or buildings.

V. Recommendation

Recognize the significance of Campanile Way as a currently designated historical resource contributing to the significance of the UC Berkeley Campus and decline to individually designate the property as a City Landmark.

Attachments:

1. Findings
 - a. For Approval
 - b. For Denial
2. Landmark Application
3. Public Hearing Notice
4. Correspondence

Preservation Planner: Sally Zarnowitz, AIA, LEED AP, Principal Planner (510) 981-7410