The Duncan and Jean McDuffie House
THE DUNCAN & JEAN MCDUFFIE HOUSE

1. **Street Address:** 22 Roble Rd.
   County: Alameda    City: Berkeley    ZIP: 94705

2. **Assessor’s Book:** Block#: 064 4255    Parcel#: 01300
   Dimensions: Approx. 284 feet by 140 feet
   Cross Streets: Tunnel Rd, Roble Ct.

3. Is property on any survey? Neighborhood Conservation Survey

4. Application for Landmark Includes: Building, Garden, Designed Landscape

5. **Historic Name of Property:** Duncan McDuffie House
   Current Commonly Known Name: the McDuffie House, 22 Roble Rd., the Moncharsh house

6. **Date of Construction:** 1925
   Factual: yes, 7/25/25 permit with City of Berkeley in BAHA archives

7. **Builder:** Mason-McDuffie, Berkeley, W. C. Cone, Oakland, Manager of Construction
   Architect: Willis Polk
   Landscape Architect: Olmsted Brothers (James Frederick Dawson, lead)

8. **Style:** Mediterranean

9. **Original Owner:** Duncan and Jean McDuffie (1909 – 1952)
   Original Use: Residential
   Present Landowner, address: Stewart and Rachelle Owen, 195 Cat Rock Road, Cos Cob, CT 06807

10. **Present occupant:** unoccupied

11. **Present Use**
    Residential: Single Family
    Current Zoning: R-1H    Adjacent Property Zoning: R-1H
12. Present Condition of Property:
   Exterior: Good
   Interior: Good
   Grounds: Good

13. Description: See Attached

14. History: See Attached

15. Significance: See Attached
   Period of Significance: 1909 – 1952, during McDuffie ownership
   Historic Value: All
   National, State, County, City, Neighborhood
   Architectural Value: All
   National, State, County, City, Neighborhood

16. Is the property endangered? Yes. Renovation of the property has been proposed.
   Depending on the project's specifics, some of the property's
   character-defining features could be destroyed or altered.

17. Photographs or copies of photographs: See Attached
   Repository: Berkeley Architectural Heritage Association

18. Bibliography: See Attached

19. Recorder: City of Berkeley Landmarks Preservation Commission
   Date: 3.3.11
The house and garden of the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House are closely related, and were completed for the same client. The original parcel was much larger, but the gardens that were designed and partially built were for the portion of the property that was subdivided as early as 1909, and the house and its formal terraced gardens, which are on the remaining parcel, were not designed until 1921. Willis Polk was the preeminent San Francisco architect for 35 years from the time he arrived in San Francisco in 1889 until his death in 1924. He enjoyed a reputation for innovative and excellence in his designs, and he had close relationships and interactions with his colleagues of the First Bay Tradition. His fine buildings set the benchmarks for others to follow. The garden design was the work of the Olmsted Brothers firm, established originally with their father (and step-father) Frederick Law Olmsted. The landscape architecture firm represented the highest standard for their time. This is nothing less than you would expect from Duncan and Jean McDuffie – two early 20th Century Berkeley residents who were extremely influential in shaping the city we know today, as well as the environment that we love. The residence and garden that they created function as a compound of indoor and outdoor spaces that are unified by their use of Mediterranean precedents.

For ease of understanding, the following description separates the residence and garden.

**DESCRIPTION, RESIDENCE**

The McDuffie residence is a Mediterranean style house, and includes a low-pitched roof, with little eave overhang, red tile roof covering, arched prominent windows and doors, multi level form, and stucco clad walls.

**Site**

The Duncan and Jean McDuffie House is situated at the west side of Roble Road between Tunnel Road and Roble Court in a suburban setting in the Claremont area of Berkeley, California. Designed by Willis Polk beginning in 1921, the Mediterranean style residence was constructed by the Mason-McDuffie Company in 1925 just a few months after the death of Willis Polk. The property is sloped from east to west and features a T-shaped plan building that has been terraced to accommodate the natural topography. The house is integrated into the site’s garden that includes courtyard, formal gardens, and service areas. As per letters between Duncan McDuffie and James Frederick Dawson, the terracing for the formal garden began a few years before the construction of the house.

**Exterior**

**Structure and Materials**

The three-story-and-basement wood frame building features a heavy reinforced concrete foundation, smooth stucco walls, and is capped by tile gable roofs with multiple stucco chimneys. The building features wood multiple-light windows, and wood doors. Decorative details include wood and metal balconies, wood shutters, and decorative tile work.

**Massing and Composition**

The building has a T-shaped plan with intersecting rectangular masses that feature similar roof pitches. The house is terraced and features multiple stairs in order to accommodate the grade of the site. The building has façades with fenestration that relates to the purpose of the interior spaces. The house was designed to convey a sense of the passage of time, as if the house were built in steps over a period of centuries. This is easier to understand if you see the interior, but it is also evident in the plan, massing, and details of the exterior.
Roble Rd. Entry
Facing Roble Road is a board-formed concrete wall, with a pedestrian entry gate, and access to the property’s two car garage. The two-story garage is clad in stucco and is capped by a front gable clay tile roof. The first floor of the garage features two wood garage doors and the second floor includes a central blind window.

The entry gate is stucco and features a panel and turned spindle wood door with decorative metal hardware. The gate is capped by a clay tile roof. Once inside the gate, visitors descended the concrete entry stairs to reach the formal front door at the Entry Court Garden.

The private second floor entry is accessed by an exterior stair and covered walkway. The covered walkway leading to the entry is supported by wood piers with decorative brackets; the original tile shed roof that covered the walkway has been removed. The present doorway is arched, having in about 2007 been replaced by the original door and surround, which were rectangular. The family used the doorway as a private entrance.

Entry Court Facades
The east and south facing façades adjoining the entry court garden flank the prominent, arched entry doorway that is used by public visitors to the house. The door hardware is handmade. The balcony originally included a segment over the main entry doorway, but that segment was removed recently. The south facing façade to the right of the formal entry door features three large arched French doors on the first floor, and an iron balcony and five windows, two of which are arched with a decorative column in between, on the second floor overlooking the entry court garden. A decorative grille into between the two sets of windows was replaced @ 2007 with a window. The east facing façade to the left of the formal entry door façade features a central chimney that is flanked by two large rectangular French doors.

South End of Living Room Wing
The projecting main living room, which looks out over three unique formal garden spaces, features a central arched French door and is accessed by a curved concrete stair with metal railing.

South and West Façade of the Sitting Room Wing
The west façade of the sitting room includes a slight projection with decorative corbels that delineates the raised basement level and the first floor. There are three windows with shutters on the lowest level under the corbels. This projection’s south facing façade features five arched windows with decorative columns between each on the second level.

West Façade
The basement level features a loggia with wide arches. The two southernmost arches feature windows that are fronted by turned spindle wood screens. A rectangular door at the south end of the loggia’s open portion gives access to the basement’s southern part. The area above the door originally included an arched sculpture that has been since removed. The second floor features an iron balcony to the living room’s French doors, supported by decorative wood brackets.

North Façade
The north façade has three planes, each with a unique pattern of fenestration that relate to the building’s interior function, including a projecting angled bay, and a pass through into the Entry Court Garden.
**Interior**

The interior of the house can generally be divided into three zones.

The first zone, made up of the formal spaces, is located on the main level and includes the most refined decorative elements including wood paneling, wood ceiling beams, and carved wood elements that have been incorporated into the design. The formal spaces retain their original interior finishes including plaster walls and ceilings at the main hall, living room, and dining room, wood ceiling beams and panels in the living room, wood panel walls in the library, and terra cotta tile at the main hall stair. The second zone is comprised of the private living areas and is located on the upper floors. The third zone, located at the basement level, includes the service spaces, and historically included the most utilitarian areas of the building.

The kitchen and bedrooms in the main living area have been completely gutted, there are no historic photographic records submitted.

**DESCRIPTION, LANDSCAPE**

The Duncan and Jean McDuffie House landscape is designed in a Mediterranean style and includes indoor outdoor spaces, and common Mediterranean elements including the pergola, formal lawn, decorative stone and tile work, potted plants, metal work, outdoor furniture and ornamental objects. The site slopes from east to west; in order to accommodate the design, the site has been terraced and retaining walls have been constructed. Natural features on the site include the Coast Live Oaks and a rock outcropping. Site furnishings present in the garden include: Griffon table, metal gates, cast concrete columns, metalwork, and pots, vases and urns.

The landscape was designed to accommodate large scaled formal social events, gracious private living, and normal day-to-day functions simultaneously. Guests attending social events would likely enter the large scaled formal entrance and proceed into and through the South and West Gardens, experiencing the impressive axial design of the garden. The resident family would normally enter the house by the garage side gate and enter the house directly under a covered walkway. The Entry Court provides the formal front door entry as well as an outdoor room for residents. Utilitarian domestic uses occurred in the North Garden screened by plantings. A separate service gate and ramp provided access to the North Garden.

The original garden plan was begun many years before the house was built, and throughout the years that the McDuffies lived there, many aspects of it changed. Formal tennis courts were planned, and then the idea given up. A swimming pool built, and then that parcel subdivided. The garden project lead Landscape Architect, Frederick Dawson wrote to the distinguished horticulturalist Beatrix Farrand in 1939 “Jean and Duncan McDuffie cooperated with us and actually carried out every suggestion that was agreed upon and produced the results they now have.” Since then, the 3.6+ acres of gardens have become less than one acre, but that one acre is the area designed as formal gardens for the house itself. It is not the 1909 plan, but the 1921 plan that remains intact.

**Roble Rd. Entry**

The Roble Road walls are the garden's most immediately obvious sidewalk-level face to the street. These high, board-formed concrete walls run along the street for a total of about 200 feet. There are three wood-doored gateways. The main entry gate has vertical spindles at the top that allow limited views into the property from the sidewalk.

**The Entry Court Garden**

This 50 by 32 foot level, rectangular court lies at the bottom of the private entry stairs. It is bounded on two sides by the house, and connected to it with generous doors and windows. Metal grilled gates lead into the South Garden. This courtyard is a classic outdoor room of Mediterranean traditions. The concrete made forms; walls, stairs, pavings and pool are original. The wall fountain was never a working fountain, but is a decorative niche with a large urn beside the base of the entry stairs. The central fountain, metal work gates, and gravel paving detail are original elements of the courtyard.
The South Garden
Average 100 by 110 feet in size and comprised the upper shrubbery, public entry stair, the Pergola, the Great Lawn with its attendant stairs, walls and pool and the south screening plantings; this landscape space is full dress axial formalism reinforced by clear cut cast concrete forms and cut boxwood architecture. This formality is offset by vignettes of informal plantings, especially vines. The result is the cozier classicism current in the Mediterranean and Spanish Colonial Revival gardens of its day. It is interesting to note that an enormous Blue Gum (no longer present) once sat off axis in an erratic position at the south edge of the round stairs in this formal setting. The Pergola has had its wood work replaced (according to historic photographs, the original wood work was rustic pole wood construction). The informal planting components appear to be largely original as are the wisterias on the Pergola.

The West Gardens
Averages roughly 230 by 40 feet, this area of the garden has two distinct characteristics.

The wider, southern part is a fragment of the western wild valley garden. It has a hillside with many naturalistic stone elements and an assortment of screening plants. There is a circular stone patio centered on a vanished Live Oak that, with adjacent stairs, served as entry to both the wild garden and the more formal western garden area.

The West Garden’s northern part includes a 130 by 15 foot rectilinear lawn panel that extends from the circular stone patio to a gateway at the north end, and is now mostly bordered by boxwood hedges. It also includes – alongside the house’s loggia – a paved open terrace and pools bordered by low stone-faced walls. This area has a “cozy classicism” similar to the south gardens. Historically this area, now strongly north – south in orientation was an overlook terrace oriented to the large views west to Mt. Tamalpais.

The North Garden
The North Garden as a whole measures on the average roughly 75 by 120 feet. Portions of it, such as the laundry drying area, were significantly altered during the 1950s or 1960s in a mode that could be called a mid-century ‘California Garden Style’. Provisions for barbeque cooking and eating are adjacent to the house kitchen. A strong diagonal axis cuts through the space and organizes raised rose beds and provides access through the space. Original large screening Redwoods and Eucalyptus exist on the bounding northern edge driveway. Naturalistic pools for drainage and some secondary stone work survive. Possibly original plant material exists around the pools of the Water Garden.

DESCRIPTION: MEDITERRANEAN ARCHITECTURE
Letter from Duncan McDuffie to James Frederick Dawson at Olmsted Bros. 11/10/21

“Your telegram asking for prints of preliminary sketches for houses was received last Saturday. I have delayed in answering in the hope of getting something satisfactory to send you, but I find there is nothing better available than the enclosed blue print which merely gives an idea of the general lay-out. We have not attempted to secure elevations because we are not yet satisfied with the ground plan. I can say, however, that the house will be of the Mediterranean type architecture, that is to say, Italian or Spanish architecture with stucco exterior and tile roof, and that the sketch of floor plan enclosed shows the general arrangement of the rooms that will be adopted.”

The term “Mediterranean” invokes the architecture of Spain, Italy and North Africa, and has generally been used for larger grand houses and buildings of the 1920’s to 1940’s. Its roots were in the world travels of the wealthy owners, who wanted to live in the style they had admired abroad, and is often associated with the architect Addison Mizner, who grew up in Benicia, and apprenticed and was made partner in Willis Polk’s firm in the 1890’s. It was an exciting time, new architectural styles to explore – the BIG names of early 20th Century architecture were working in close proximity – colleagues and rivals, often intoxicated with ideas for a better way. The California State Building at the World’s Columbian Exhibition of 1893 brought to life Mission Revival for the first time (with Moorish influences thrown in), designed by A. Page Brown, who brought Willis Polk to San Francisco in 1889. Willis Polk created the first sketch of a possible Mission Revival Building in 1887. It was his innovative and imaginative spirit that breathed new life into old world timeless, gentle charm
of the Mediterranean style, as he designed large homes in affluent areas of the Bay Area. This was not a replication of grand estates in Europe, but an homage to the best qualities they had to offer that seemed so completely at home in the Bay Area’s gentle climate, rolling hills, and expansive views – indoor-outdoor living, expansive arch topped windows and exterior doors, interior tile floors and other decorative tile work, richly appointed interior spaces with plastered walls and warm wood details, engaged chimneys, expansive fireplaces, elegant interior staircases with iron railings, balconies on the second level overlooking the garden spaces, iron railings and fixtures, red tile roofs, stucco exteriors, corbelled overhangs, round attic vents that resemble the pigeon holes of houses near the Mediterranean, private garden spaces, luxurious wide gardens outside, usually terraced out to a breathtaking view.

- Appendix contains a 1914 article on Spanish Revival Architecture and Willis Polks’s S.L. Naphtaly House, 2960 Broadway, San Francisco
- Appendix contains an article from Architect & Engineer, 1930: Possibilities of Decorative Tile with Terra Cotta and Brick

**DESCRIPTION: MEDITERRANEAN GARDENS**

Mediterranean Gardens of the 1920s were seen as a continuation of the traditional California Garden that was based on precedents set during California’s early Spanish and Mexican history.

According to The California Garden and the Landscape Architects who Shaped It,

> “From the earliest times, the California garden was a patio, an enclosed space essential to the mission complex, as well as to the adobe ranch house. In the mild climate of Southern California, living and working out of doors for much of the year is possible and even preferable. It is also a tradition derived from Spain and Persia, reinforced through Mexican experience. It is a garden history based on the concept of garden as space – a functioning room – instead of an abstract luxury.”

Mediterranean Gardens continued the inward-focus of the California garden, with courtyards and patios that were an extension of the house and were seen as functional spaces that were not follies but functional outdoor rooms.

Mediterranean or Spanish Colonial Revival Gardens are characterized by David Gebhard et. al. in Architecture in San Francisco and Northern California 1985 edition. Gebhard states, “gardens large and small are axial and directly related to the symmetry of the building, its plan and interior spaces.” He continues, Mediterranean Gardens are, “Closely related to out doors through use of French doors, terraces and pergolas.” In essence, Mediterranean Gardens are formal gardens with axial orientations that serve as a continuation of the house and feature indoor-outdoor rooms that capitalize on the mild California climate.

Most larger Mediterranean style gardens balance their formal core with both picturesque details of plantings and materials, as well as more or less large areas of naturalistic plantings. The Olmsted Brothers’ style favored even larger areas of informal plantings. They brought a highly enriched eastern plant palette to the garden as well as using Mediterranean and California native plants. Mediterranean Spanish Colonial Gardens were often highly furnished with pottery of varying styles and sizes, cushioned outdoor furniture, eating tables, metal work, vases, pools, water-tanks, fountains and the like.

The garden at the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House exhibits many of the characteristics of the Mediterranean Garden including the pergola, fountains, relationship between indoor and outdoor spaces, decorative stone and tile work, potted plants, metal work, outdoor furniture and ornamental objects. The property’s garden works with a stripped down classicism in which the proportion of massing and void defines the spaces. Overt traditional details are rendered as ornamental objects in cast concrete, classical terra cotta work, glazed pottery, cast and wrought metal details of railings, hardware and support brackets.

*(Page & Turnbull, Inc)*

Bird’s eye view map of Claremont by W. H. Bull, from the promotional brochure, Claremont, A Private Residence Park at Berkeley, Mason-McDuffie Company, 1905. The meandering line of trees in the top center indicates the course of Harwood Creek. Courtesy Anthony Bruce.
HISTORY: CLAREMONT

The Claremont area (distinct from the Claremont residential subdivision) of Berkeley is composed of several distinct residential subdivisions in the vicinity of the Claremont Hotel. As early as 1882, the Claremont area was considered an affluent residential area: “There is a beautiful spot lying east of Telegraph Avenue beyond Temescal called Claremont… [the] elegant homes in this pleasant retreat are standing in the center of flower beds surrounded by shade trees.”

In the nineteenth century Claremont included large Victorian country estates and farms, but the area’s steep terrain delayed development until the introduction and expansion of Berkeley’s electric streetcar system in the 1890’s. Many of residential subdivisions in the East Bay are linked to the consolidation of independent railroad and streetcar lines facilitated by local developer and businessman Francis Marion “Borax” Smith. In 1905, the Claremont Park Company purchased an undeveloped 125-acre ranch east of Claremont Avenue. This area was developed by the Claremont Park Company. The site that would become the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House property was part of a nearly 193-acre subdivision at the far southeastern corner of the city, at the border with the City of Oakland that was annexed to the City of Berkeley in 1906.

By 1909, McDuffie had acquired close to ten acres of a steep wooded canyon above Claremont, southwest of Tunnel Road. McDuffie commissioned architect John Galen Howard to make plans for an estate on the northern boundary of his property along Tunnel Road. He also sought the services of the Olmsted Brothers landscape design firm founded by Frederick Law Olmsted in Brookline, Massachusetts.

The landscape at the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House is an Olmsted Brothers garden design. The initial parcel assembly, dubbed the Claremont Property by Duncan McDuffie was 7.65+ acres by 1908. Ironically this assembly did not include most of today’s the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House property until 1910, when it’s the latter was added to the land under planning consideration by McDuffie and John Galen Howard. John Galen Howard frequently worked with McDuffie on residential developments. He was asked by McDuffie to design a grand house sited on the northern central knoll of the property. In this design Beaux Arts terraces dropped axially to the south for six hundred feet. The design was developed over 1908 to 1911 with many elements: pools, gates, walls, pergolas, garages, out buildings realized, still extant or modified. These elements, many of which still exist but are not located on the subject property, have their alignment ordered by the Howard ghost project north-south axis line.

Howard’s design for the McDuffie property was influenced by his Beaux-Arts training and included a formal axial composition. The majority of Howard’s architectural plans for the estate dating from 1909 through 1911, shown in drawings at the Environmental Design Archives, were never realized.

However, Howard did design three ancillary structures that were constructed on the original estate. A pump house at the bottom of the estate was designed by Howard in 1909. The pump house was converted into a residence in the 1920s and was occupied by the McDuffie’s gardener, Giorgio Celestre, until 1973. The pump house (now 26 Roble Road) has been substantially altered. A garage designed by Howard was constructed on the McDuffie Estate in 1911. The garage was added onto into the 1920s and served as a dwelling (now 6 Roble Road). A second, large two-story garage west of the proposed mansion was constructed in 1910 and a year later the building was converted to a residence and occupied by McDuffie and his wife Jean (now 156 Tunnel Road). (See maps attached illustrating history of subdivision of property over the decades.)

The 1911 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map (available for view at Berkeley Architectural Heritage) does not include the subject property. However it shows the adjacent area including the two-story McDuffie residence at 156 Tunnel Road. The map shows that the curving roads, including Roble Road, Tunnel Road, and Alvarado Road were laid out and many lots were divided. However, the majority of the area remained undeveloped. Those lots in the immediate area that were occupied at this time include large houses with wide setbacks from the lot lines.
HISTORY: DUNCAN AND JEAN MCDUFFIE GARDEN DESIGN

The Claremont Property was designed as a larger garden that would eventually include the site of McDuffie’s residence and was developed in a manner that would facilitate subdivision at a later date. This 10 acre property had been subdivided by McDuffie by 1920, with McDuffie retaining 4.87 acres according to his November 14, 1921 letter to Frederick Dawson. Frederick Dawson was McDuffie’s long time contact with the Olmsted Brothers Landscape Architects of Brookline, Massachusetts. The Olmsted Brothers had been involved in the Claremont Property design work since before 1914. This design work included rose, vegetable and pool gardens with their plantings and walls. Extensive naturalistic screening shrubberies and tree groves were designed for privacy and enjoyment. During this period the Olmsted Brothers firm made extensive use of both California natives and Mediterranean climate species to create the groves and shrubberies. Landscapes using wildflowers, alpines, and flower borders were designed and developed by the Olmsted Brothers. One such planting was the one acre+ Blue Gum Eucalyptus (Eucalyptus globulus) grove that was planted circa 1910 on roughly the part of the large parcel that would be used for the house and formal gardens in the 1920’s. Also around 1914 the long design development process of the private access road that forms the northern edge of the present the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House began.

After selection of Willis Polk as architect for the new residence in 1921, Frederick Dawson received the charge from Duncan McDuffie to design a new garden for his new house of “Mediterranean Architecture.” This new house would be sited on a rock ledge at the eastern edge of the property with a western orientation toward Mt. Tamalpais. The new design would encompass about 3.6 acres of the remaining 4.87 acres of the Claremont Property and include the acre of the rose and vegetable gardens. The components of the new design were oriented differently from the old John Galen Howard axis. With this new orientation the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House takes on its own character distinct and apart from Howard’s “ghost project.”

HISTORY: DUNCAN AND JEAN MCDUFFIE HOUSE DESIGN

In an article in the Oakland Tribune dated 10/9/1921, it was announced that the McDuffies hired Willis Polk in 1921 to design their new home. The couple sold the house they had been living in, and moved to San Francisco, living in the Fairmont Hotel until the new house was complete. In correspondence to Dawson regarding the garden, McDuffie describes the general style and siting of the house November 10, 1921:

“The house will be of the Mediterranean type, that is to say, Italian or Spanish architecture with stucco exterior and tile roof…our quarters will be on the ground floor; guest quarters will be on the floor above, and servants’ rooms on the floor below. This floor on account of the slope of the ground will be entirely above ground on the south and west.

“It is planned to locate the house about 50 feet from the westerly line of Roble Road in the neighborhood of the projecting ledge of rock… The garage, which will be on the street line, will also be on the street level. The house will be approached by a flight of steps leading down into a court upon which will open the living room, dining room and main entrance. As I picture it, the hillside below the house will be terraced to a width sufficient to give the house a proper foundation. Below this terrace, there will be other terraces leading to the terraces in front of the gardener’s cottage. I trust that the formal part of the garden may be confined to these terraces which I hope may have a length not much greater than the north and south width of the house. The little courtyard is so placed as to be protected from the north and west.
winds. As the living room wing of the house will be but one story in height, it will have sunshine all day long. We desire to make this court a sort of outdoors living room."

A November 14, 1921 letter from McDuffie to Dawson clarifies the McDuffies’ reasoning for the location of the house:

“Our reason for keeping the house so high on the hill was in order that we might command a view of Mt. Tamalpais which would be cut off by the hill on the west side of the Uplands if we were to have the house further west.”

Giorgio Celestre recalled Willis Polk bringing a model of the planned residence to the McDuffie’s home (see model in Architect & Engineer, 1926)
HISTORY: CONSTRUCTION, PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE (1909 – 1952)

Historic photos from 1914 of the property are attached. Most of the original property was open land. The site occupied by the gardener’s cottage (since subdivided) is at the bottom of the hill.

The plans for a large house were abandoned by 1917. The McDuffies hired Willis Polk to design their new residence at the top of the hill in late 1921.

Volume Two of the Berkeley 1929 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map (which includes the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House) is not available digitally, but is on view at the Berkeley Public Library’s History Room. The 1929 map shows the house at the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House.

By 1933, Duncan McDuffie was sub-dividing the western portion of the property and by 1935, the Rose Garden was occupied by a William Wurster House and a Thomas Church garden. By 1949, Hans Ostwald had built number 16 Roble Road in the Olmsted Brothers Water Garden and Western Lawn while preserving some original garden elements.

The 1950 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map shows the subject property and a concrete block dwelling, with the address 22A Roble Road. Additional buildings include a third dwelling, a rectangular two-story poured concrete building with a two story entry porch, a one story garage, a one-story stable building, a one-story U-shaped building, and a rectangular lattice enclosure.

In 1951 when Duncan McDuffie died, the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House was on approximately 1.5 acres. Currently, the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House is on a parcel of approximately .9 acres.
(Historic photos of Willis Polk's model before construction, courtesy Leila Moncharsh)
See Historical Info attached for more plans and photos
HISTORY: PERMITS

The following timeline of the permit history of the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House, including major alterations. The timeline is based on permit information obtained from the City of Berkeley Planning Department and Berkeley Architectural Heritage Association.

The Duncan and Jean McDuffie House

- 1928 – April 20, 1928: Permit #30291: Garage for 3 machines constructed at a cost of $250.
- 1929 – August 13, 1929: Permit #331124: Addition of one bedroom to present 2 story chauffeur’s quarters.
- 1932 – November 1, 1932: Permit #37434: Sun Porch to be added to second floor – at 22 ½ Roble Road.
- 1940 – December 3, 1940: Permit #50067: Repair fire damage at Roble Road (rear), make clean out accessible.
- 1952 – June 5, 1952: Permit #71431: Remodel Kitchen. Remove existing wood cabinets; install new wood cabinets with clay tile tops and splash. 5 new transom windows in existing frames. 2 New plate glass windows in existing frames. 1 new double bowl sink. 1 new single bowl. 2 Waste King garbage disposals. New floor covering. 1 dishwasher. Patch plaster and paint complete. Owner: Geo. Moncharsh.
- 1980 – February 28, 1980: Permit #0228807431: Water well

HISTORY: OWNERSHIP

- 1909-1911: Duncan McDuffie
- 1911-1952: Duncan & Jean McDuffie
- 1952-2006: George & Helen Moncharsh
- 2006-2010: Kimberley Fullerton Nelson & Robert Rodriguez
- 2010-present: Stewart & Rachelle Owen
Duncan McDuffie was active as a residential developer in the first half of the 20th century, primarily in Berkeley. He was born in Iowa in 1877, moved to Santa Barbara as a young boy, and graduated from the University of California in Berkeley in 1899. After graduation, McDuffie clerked for Taft & Pennoyer, a large Oakland department store, in Oakland. During this period, he resided at 2403 Telegraph Avenue, a duplex on the south-east corner of Telegraph and Channing. In April 1905, McDuffie joined Louis Titus, a fraternity brother from the University, and Joseph J. Mason, an established insurance salesman and residential developer, in forming the Mason-McDuffie Company. McDuffie bought the slightly less than 10 acre property bordered by Tunnel Road and Roble Road in 1909 with the intention of building a grand house. The property was east of the “Claremont” neighborhood, a subdivision sold by the Claremont Park Company, the first of several residential subdivisions in the vicinity of the Claremont Hotel. He hired John Galen Howard, the University of California’s architect, to help him layout a plan for the property. Howard never did design the main house, but he did design other structures on the property (now subdivided off), including the first structure known as the “Pump House” which was home to (McDuffie’s gardener) Giorgio Celestre and his family until 1973.

Mr. Duncan McDuffie married Mrs. Jean Howard Schoonmaker (no relation to John Galen Howard) of Oakland, who had recently been widowed, in 1911. They sailed across the Atlantic on an extended honeymoon immediately, bound for Europe, where they had met the year before. They returned home to 156 Tunnel Rd. (also known as 6 Roble Rd.). Originally built as a garage, John Galen Howard was asked to convert it into a home. The plans for the grand house were delayed many times, meanwhile the work went on in the vast gardens. A few years into their marriage, the McDuffies told their landscape architect that since they would not be having children they had decided to build a much more modest home than the original grand plan, and subdivide more and more of the parcel.

During World War I, from 1917-1918, McDuffie volunteered his services to President Woodrow Wilson and the US Food Administration in Washington DC, along with Louis Titus from Mason-McDuffie. They were put in charge of making and distributing bread to the troops.

As a young man, McDuffie hiked and camped in the Sierras with the “Little Joe” LeConte family. He had met Little Joe while at U.C. This exposure proved to have a life long effect, for he remained committed to enhancing the suburban community by respecting and building in harmony with the natural environment.

He worked tirelessly with many early environmental groups over the decades – the Sierra Club (served as vice president in 1928, and from 1928 -31 and 1943 – 46 he was president, and served from 1931 – 1941 on the executive committee), Save the Redwoods (Director and President 1944 – 1951), the Yosemite National Parks Association (served as a member of the Coordinating Committee on National Parks and Forests), American Alpine Club, the National Parks Association, the California State Parks System, and was instrumental in the creation of the East Bay Regional Park System (it was McDuffie that brought the Olmsted Bros. into the process through a letter dated 6/3/1930). He also served the City of Berkeley on the City Planning Commission and the Civic Arts Commission in the early part of the century.

According to Berkeley Architectural Heritage Association:

“McDuffie remained committed to the highest ideals for Berkeley in the decades to follow. Not only did he instigate some Berkeley’s finest residence parks (San Pablo Park, 1906, Claremont Court, 1907, Northbrae, 1907), but he was instrumental in establishing the concepts of city planning and zoning in Berkeley before they were adopted elsewhere in the country.”

City planning stayed an active interest for his entire life. From a column of the Pine Cone, Carmel, 12/9/1922,
“On Tuesday afternoon the City Planning Commission held a meeting. This was for the purpose of hearing what Mr. Duncan McDuffie had to say on city planning commissions in general and the experiment in Berkeley in particular.

Mr. McDuffie laid much stress on the importance of zoning a city. By deliberately keeping the commercial part of the town centered in one district and the residential in another, the property values in both commercial and residential districts are bound to rise; also shops, tea-houses, garages, gain by being bunched together whereas private residences need room to spread.”

McDuffie’s conservation ethic was influenced by his economic perspective, and he believed that “preservation of scenic and recreational attractions was essential to the development of California’s tourism industry”. In 1925, he wrote this passionate plea:

“Next to our fertile soil, California’s greatest single asset is the opportunity it offers for outdoor life. No industry except agriculture puts as much money into circulation in California as do the hundreds of thousands of visitors who come here seeking health, recreation, pleasure, sport and out-of-door life generally. Yet gradually many of the attractions that have made the state famous are being destroyed like our redwood groves, or are passing into private ownership like the Monterey coastline. It would seem to be sound business for the state to see that its major opportunities for recreation and enjoyment of the out-of-doors are left open for the use and enjoyment of both its citizens and its visitors.”

Although California’s first state park, Yosemite, had been protected through a Federal Grant in 1864, McDuffie and his fellow historic preservationists fought to protect other threatened areas as well and bring them under one protective body. His particular focus began with the mighty redwood groves, but it was he who first suggested, as Chairman of the Committee of State Parks in 1923, that the only path to insure preservation would be a comprehensive statewide park program. He suggested a survey of all potential park lands – to be performed by the most knowledgeable and capable person for the job – Frederick Law Olmsted Jr. The State Bond Act of 1928 was an important milestone, and Olmsted was assured of the funds to prepare the survey of the parks.

The American Scenic and Historic Preservation Society presented its first awards in 1928, and McDuffie was given the Cornelius Amory Pugsley Silver Medal for service in the field of state parks. According to a publication by the National Conference on State Parks,

“Duncan McDuffie, of San Francisco, Calif., Chairman of the California State Parks Council, [was awarded] for his efforts in expanding the State park system in California, and in the successful campaign for a six million dollar bond issue for that purpose, approved by the voters in the last election.”

In addition to his work at the state level, McDuffie was influential in the development of the East Bay Regional Parks district. McDuffie was part of committee that surveyed open space in the East Bay hills and fought for the state law that created the parks from the watershed.

McDuffie’s historic preservation and conservation efforts were recognized by the Save the Redwoods League and the Sierra Club. Duncan and Jean McDuffie received the unique honor of having two redwood groves named in their honor by The Save the Redwoods League, one in Calaveras Big Trees State Park (1959) and one in Prairie Creek State Park (1951). Mt. McDuffie in Kings Canyon National Park, in the Black Divide Range was named for Duncan McDuffie by the Sierra Club to commemorate his interest in the national parks and his work as a conservationist.

In 1950, he was given an Honorary Doctor of Laws Degree by the University of California. The following is the citation, written by Professor Joel Hildebrand, a close friend, and read by President Sproul:
“Lover of gardens and mountains, pioneer in the application of beauty to urban development, and in the planning of California’s renowned system of state parks; a conservator of natural resources whose tireless, persistent leadership has assured our generation the giant redwoods of our forests and recreational values of our beaches; and intelligent volunteer in public service and a loyal alum’s of this university.”

McDuffie died on April 21, 1951 at age 73. He had suffered from Parkinson’s Disease for many years.

5 http://www.aapra.org/Pugsley/McDuffieDuncan.html

Jean Howard Schoonmaker McDuffie

Jean Howard was born in 1878, and raised in Oakland. On January 11, 1906, she married Charles M. Schoonmaker of San Francisco, and the two moved to Sausalito. In 1908 they traveled to Paris where Mrs. Schoonmaker was a student.

While in Paris, Jean Schoonmaker met Duncan McDuffie. In the spring of 1911, they were married. Some reports at the time said she was a widow, while others said she had an “unhappy marriage” – whichever it was, her marriage to Duncan McDuffie was her second.

She jumped right into garden and hiking activities with her husband. She was also compelled by the illness (ear infection) of Giorgio Celestre’s first child, finding out there was no medical care available for small children in the east bay, to use her influence to establish a “Baby’s Hospital” in Oakland. This became “Children’s Hospital” and Mrs. McDuffie sat on the Board as President for 2 years from 1914 when they opened until 1916. She then became Treasurer.

Between 1917 and 1922, she was on the board of a women’s suffragette movement in San Francisco, the California Civic League of Women Voters (predecessor to the League of Women Voters). She served with Willis Polk’s wife Christina. In the words of Ella Barrows Hagar, she (Mrs. McDuffie) was an amazing organizer. Supporting the troops, saving the redwoods, she poured herself into the role of civic activist.

She also served on the National League for Women's Service through World War I and the Town and Country Club in 1922 with Mrs. Polk. Jean McDuffie died in San Francisco in 1955, three years after selling her home.

See APPENDIX for more information about her good work.

Sidney Coe Howard

Brother of Jean, Sidney Howard was award winning playwright and screenwriter. He received the following awards:

• Pulitzer Prize for Drama for “They Knew What They Wanted”, 1925
• Oscar for Best Screenplay for “Gone With the Wind”, 1939

He grew up in Oakland, attended the University of California. When his marriage to stage actress Clare Eames ended in 1928, he came back to Berkeley to live with his sister in the McDuffie's home on Roble Road. He was so upset by the end of his marriage that he thought he would never write again. His daughter eventually joined him (she stayed on with the McDuffies for several years, and was later married at the house in 1950 to Samuel Goldwyn, Jr.). Two years later, he signed a contract with Samuel Goldwyn, Sr. in Hollywood, and moved on to become one of the most successful screenwriters in 1930’s Hollywood, nominated 3 times for an Academy Award for as screenwriter, culminating with the GWTW win. Sadly, he died in a tragic accident before the picture opened.

Sidney Coe Howard was inducted into the American Theater Hall of Fame in 1981, 42 years after his death.
No one has yet written a biography of Willis Polk, the most comprehensive study is the “On the Edge of the World: Four Architects at the Turn of the Century” by Richard Longstreth. Considering that Polk was reputedly a man of flamboyant character with immense talent and skill, a legendary architect, a founding member of one of the most creative pools of people that the Bay Area has ever known, and the designer of the first early modern building in San Francisco (Hallidie), that is not enough. Perhaps Longstreth, captures him best: “Volitile”, “Non-conformist”, “Dandy”, “Practical Joker”, and “always seeking to be the center of attention”.

Willis Polk was born in Kentucky, 1867, to a large family. His father was a carpenter who traveled far and wide to find work. Willis would travel along, learning the trade, as was common in the mid 1870’s. At age 8, he was made an apprentice to a carpenter. The family eventually moved to Kansas City, Missouri. At age 18, he was in partnership with his father, who by then was designing houses as well as building them. By age 20, he was a draftsman for the firm Van Brunt & Howe. But after six months, he left to travel the country, working in many firms in many cities, until he met A. Page Brown in New York City. This was an important life changing moment. A. Page Brown was headed for San Francisco, and asked the young man if he would like to go along and join his firm.

It was in San Francisco that the legendary names in the constellation of turn of the century arts and crafts architecture were beginning to swirl. Names like Polk and Brown met Schweinfurth, Maybeck (whom Polk had persuaded to move out from Kansas City in 1890), Coxhead, and the Reverend Joseph Worcester of the Swedenborgian Church. The architecture these men produced came to be known as the First Bay Tradition – building with nature, emphasis on craftsmanship, rustic natural materials, exposed beams, wood shingles. Willis Polk’s masterpiece of this style and period is the Williams-Polk House(s) at 1013-1019 Vallejo on the peak of Russian Hill in San Francisco.

There were many ups and downs in Polk’s early career in San Francisco. He completed many projects, but reportedly he was not a great businessman. He tried partnering with his father again (and with his brother), but the firm dissolved, and he went back to work for A. Page Brown, finishing the Ferry Bldg. project after Brown’s accidental death. But he could not get his head above water and then, humiliated, Polk was forced to declare bankruptcy. Economic times at the turn of the century were largely unpredictable, with many booms and many busts. He married Christina Barreda in 1899, and they headed to Chicago in 1901 for his two year stint working for famed Chicago architect Daniel Burnham, a leader of the City Beautiful Movement, and the architect responsible for laying out the World’s Colombian Exhibition in Chicago in 1893. Polk came back to San Francisco, followed soon by Burnham, who had been asked to layout a city plan. This was completed in 1906 after the earthquake, but the city was in such disarray it could not be implemented.

This was another life changing moment for Willis Polk. No one could have predicted what would happen that year in San Francisco. But when it did, Polk convinced Burnham to open a San Francisco office to assist with the rebuilding.

From that point on Polk designed commercial buildings and residential structures of enormous significance, and in 1915 was the supervising architect for the Pan-Pacific International Exhibition. The Palace of Fine Arts (Bernard Maybeck, rebuilt in 1962) is the only surviving structure of what was intended to be a temporary installation.

While Polk drew heavily from historicist styles for all of buildings, he judged none of them to be “slavish imitations – all of them typifying the magic touch according to my conception as a creative Artist.”

- Willis Polk to Pauline Jacobson, 12/20/1921, copy of letter in Willis Polk biographical file, SF Architectural Heritage
In 1909, Polk designed St. Clement’s Church on Claremont Blvd, his first of only a handful of projects in Berkeley.

In 1917, Polk was put in charge of restoring Mission Dolores (San Francisco de Asis). And at the same time, he also designed one of the first curtain wall structures in the world. The Hallidie Building at 130 Sutter St. in San Francisco is considered an early modern masterpiece. It was far ahead of its time, built for the University of California, and is still a marvel almost 100 years later. The onset of WWI meant building in the Bay Area all but stopped, and the war was followed by a deep recession. During the next few years, Polk designed the Beach Chalet at Ocean Beach, Kezar Stadium and Pavilion, and on October 9, 1921, this announcement ran in the Oakland Tribune:

“The Mason McDuffies (sic) have said a temporary adieux to the Berkeley hills and their charming home among the oaks along the ridge, going over to the Fairmont for a temporary tarrying – their home having been sold to the Hartman family.

And with the house went a part of the famous garden, but only a part. And on the remaining half of the estate a new home shall rise, that shall be designed by Willis Polk, and that is guarantee enough of its interesting character. Nothing that the architect does – or says, for that matter – is dull or commonplace.

Needless to say, the McDuffies will be much missed from the social and philanthropic activities of the East-bay, but the boats still ply between “that side” and this, and the loss is not a permanent arrangement.”

Willis Jefferson Polk died of a heart attack on September 10, 1924. His stepson stepped in to run the business and ensure the projects left uncompleted would be finished. Ground broke on the Duncan And Jean McDuffie House the next spring, destined to become one of the last homes Willis Polk designed.

The list of buildings and structures that Willis Polk designed is lengthy and will not be included here. Many are on the National Register of Historic Places, and many more are recognized as local landmarks.

Just a few highlights include:
- The Flood Mansion (now the Pacific Union Club), San Francisco - [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pacific-Union_Club](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pacific-Union_Club)

It should be noted that nearly all of Willis Polk’s archival record has been destroyed. Although the architect or his descendants donated all of his records to the University of California, Berkeley, they languished in the campanile for years, only to be remembered and retrieved after water damage had almost completely destroyed them. Richard Longstreth, On the Edge of the World: Four Architects in San Francisco at the Turn of the Century (Berkeley, 1983), 51-56
Willie Polk, just a taste:

the Williams-Polk House high up on Russian Hill, 1892

the Beach Chalet at San Francisco Beach, 1921

restoration of Mission Dolores, 1917-1920

McDyer House, 1925

Hallidie Building, 1917

Modern Revival home in Pacific Heights, 1913

the First National Bank, 1906

McDyer House, Atherton, 1912

Photos, historic or Carrie Olson, except as noted
into the countryside, both Howard and Polk experimented with references to regional work in schematic conceptions. Polk's Imaginary Mission Church (1887) is the first known design to be directly fashioned after these buildings (Fig. 204).

Los Angeles was a natural center for this activity, since the surrounding area was among the most richly endowed with Spanish-American buildings. By the early 1890s, however, the focus of interest had shifted to San Francisco. Polk spurned an appreciation for the missions among practitioners there. His short-lived Architectural News was the first professional magazine to publish an article on these buildings, and he may have conceived a more extensive essay about the missions serialized in two issues of the California Architect for 1891. Polk's idea for the 1900 world's fair was to have a vast building with interior courtyards, a notion inspired by the mission compounds and their Spanish antecedents. He was also among the first architects to urge that the missions serve as a source for the design of the California Building at the Columbian Exposition. A growing number of San Franciscans shared Polk's view. Further encouragement came from the Exposition's supervising architect, Daniel Burnham, who suggested that all southwestern states look to regional Spanish architecture for their buildings. By June 1891, members of the state committee in charge of California's exhibit indicated their partiality to the idea. When the competition for the building was formally announced seven months later, the program stipulated that the design be of the "Mission and Moorish type." A new regional mode was inaugurated. The project was unusually important to Californians. It provided the first opportunity for the state to assemble a major display of its achievements and potential before the rest of the country. Many citizens, self-conscious about California's newness and lingering reputation as a frontier culture, saw the event as an occasion for lavish display of material progress. The second-largest state pavilion, occupying a choice site, would stand as a unique symbol of abundant resources and promise. Previously, architects had refrained from making reference to the missions in actual projects, but now circumstances encouraged them to experiment. The competition, open to all practitioners in the state, drew entries from twenty-five firms, twenty-one of which were from San Francisco. Page Brown emerged the winner. For the next several years, he and Burnham would play the most conspicuous and influential role in championing the use of Hispanic precedent to create designs that would be seen as distinctly Californian.

A principal reason that Brown's entry was chosen may have been that it embodied the aspirations of the committee in a very literal manner. California's missions became the exterior display, just as California's products comprised the interior exhibition (Fig. 205). Grafted onto a five-part composition, then common in large public...
WILLIS POLK & CO. (ASSOCIATES)

James Herbert Mitchell was born in 1889 in Saint Helena, CA. He graduated from the University of California in 1911, working for John Galen Howard and William C. Hays before going to work for Willis Polk & Co. as General Manager in 1918. He left in 1930 to form his own firm. His firm designed the Redwood City Public Library in 1939.

Angus McSweeney was born in 1901 in Pennsylvania. After attending architectural courses in Oregon, he worked for the State Of California for two years, and he had just been hired by Willis Polk in 1924 (the year Polk died). He stayed with the firm until 1934, until it was closed and he established his own firm.

Austin Percy Moore was the stepson of Willis Polk. (Christine Barreda Polk’s son by her first husband Charles A. Moore) He took over the business operations of the firm when Polk died.

These men completed the projects designed by Willis Polk, including the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House, 2800 and 2808 Broadway, San Francisco, and the St. Francis Yacht Club in San Francisco.

MASON-MCDUFFIE COMPANY

The Mason-McDuffie Company is often misunderstood. When it was founded in 1905, it was primarily a real estate firm – selling land that had been already subdivided by development companies whose principals often overlapped. That said, there were individuals associated with the Mason-McDuffie Company, Louis Titus and Duncan McDuffie in particular, who were on the boards, usually as President and Secretary respectively, of these separate development companies. Additionally, there was a group of men who also invested in these separate companies.

Corporate history: Louis Titus had been left a sizeable fortune by his uncle

Mason McDuffie incorporated March 1, 1905. Joseph Mason, President, Duncan McDuffie, Secretary Louis Titus a stock holder, along with Elmer Rowell, Perry Tompkins and C.C. Young- all owning 30 shares

There were other investors with 10 or less shares.

Joseph Mason, who was a much older man, but came with a name and reputation was made president of the new corporation, but resigned in 1907 after only 18 months, saying he was too old (62 at the time of resignation). Titus assumed the duties of president, with McDuffie as secretary.

Sub-division companies with close ties to the principals that became Mason-McDuffie include:

- the West Berkeley Land Company (1900)
- the University Development Company (1904)
- the Berkeley Development Company (1904) This company bought 2000 acres in North Berkeley that became Northbrae and Thousand Oaks,
- the Northland Tract (1904)
  (However, Joseph Mason was not part of any of the companies above)
- the Claremont Land Company (Feb. 4. 1905)
- the Claremont Park Company (Feb. 4,1905)

The companies were set up with Louis Titus as president, and Duncan McDuffie as secretary, and included John Hopkins Spring, and Wickham Havens as share holders. Louis Titus was also an attorney and President of the Berkeley National Bank.

These companies were responsible for planning the subdivisions of Claremont Park (1907), Northbrae (1907), Hopkins Terrace No. 4 (1905) (Tamalpias and Shasta), San Pablo Park (1906)
In 1906 McDuffie took Perry Tompkins and C.C. Young, two UC Berkeley Phi Beta Theta fraternity brothers, into the firm. C.C. Young would become Governor of the State in 1927 and served until 1931. On November 11, 1912, the Mason-McDuffie Company became the successor to Claremont Court Co., Claremont Park Co., all unsold lots in Claremont, Oak Ridge, Upper Claremont, Eucalyptus Hill and Claremont tracts, The Berkeley Development Company and the Berkeley Realty Company.

Wickam Havens and John Spring were involved in the initial building of the Claremont Hotel in 1905, but it was not until 1915 that the hotel finally opened and Mason-McDuffie was involved in its completion.

Mason-McDuffie is the builder of record for the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House at 22 Roble Road.

○ JOHN GALEN HOWARD, ARCHITECT

Boston-born John Galen Howard (1864-1931) was MIT and École des Beaux Arts-trained. After working in the offices of Henry Hobson Richardson and McKim, Mead and White, Howard became the University of California at Berkeley campus architect from 1902 until 1924. He founded the Berkeley School of Architecture in 1903. A strong proponent of the Beaux-Art style, he championed a west coast regional variant of McKim, Mead and White’s east coast style. Howard’s gardens are overtly formal, right angled axial, with low lying French proportions and highly organized plantings that echo his architecture.

Howard and McDuffie had established a working relationship through multiple residential subdivision projects. McDuffie and his colleagues commissioned Howard to design the entrance gates and pillars for the Claremont District (1906), the Claremont Court entry gates (1907), and Marin Circle, the entrance pillars on the Alameda, stairways, benches, and stone pillars in Northbrae. The working relationship continued, and Howard designed the pillars, fountain, signage, and real estate office for Mason-McDuffie’s St. Francis Wood development in San Francisco (1912).

(Page & Turnbull, Inc)

○ OLMSTED BROTHERS, LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTS

Frederick Law Olmsted (1822-1903), known as the “father of American landscape architecture,” designed and planned parks and park systems throughout the United States. His earliest designs, completed with partner Calvert Vaux, include New York’s Central Park, Brooklyn’s Prospect Park, and Chicago’s South Parks.

Olmsted’s stepson and son, John Charles Olmsted and Frederick Law Olmsted, Jr. became landscape architects as well, working in Olmsted’s firm. The two formed the Olmsted Brothers firm in 1898, after the retirement of Frederick Law Olmsted, Sr. and the death of partner Charles Eliot. The Olmsted Brothers designed and executed numerous large projects, including comprehensive park systems, universities, exposition grounds, libraries, hospitals, and state capitols. In addition, the two were among the founding members of the American Society of Landscape Architects.

The Olmsted Brothers firm continued Frederick Law Olmsted, Sr.’s style that was influenced by the eighteenth century English landscape designer Humphry Repton’s style. The Olmsted Brothers firm’s designs strike a balance between formal rectilinear and informal, with naturalistic landscape areas serving to the balance the formal. At the time of their work with McDuffie, the firm’s west coast work embraced California regional styles; courtyard and outdoor living. California native or Mediterranean plants, and uses of common local materials as stone, stucco, and concrete. The House Beautiful Gardening Manual from 1926 shows Olmsted Brother’s designs that are similar in parti and finishes, such as pergolas with rustic log lintels and wrought-iron gates, to the garden at the McDuffie House.

(Page & Turnbull, Inc)
JAMES FREDERICK DAWSON, LANDSCAPE ARCHITECT

Born in Boston, James Frederick Dawson (1874-1941) studied agriculture and horticulture at Harvard's Bussey Institute. He apprenticed to the Olmsted firm in 1896 and traveled throughout England and Europe observing the landscape and studying design and plant material. In 1904 Dawson was chosen by John Charles Olmsted and Frederick Law Olmsted, Jr. as their first associate partner in Olmsted Brothers, Landscape Architects. Dawson spent his entire career with the firm. He supervised projects in Venezuela, Cuba, Canada and Bermuda, as well as throughout the U.S., designing in a wide range of landscape types – arboreta, parks and parkways, expositions, estates, resorts and country clubs, golf courses and subdivisions.

With his mentor, John Charles Olmsted, Dawson made numerous trips to the Pacific coast, developing designs for the parkway systems of Portland, Seattle and Spokane, the Alaska-Pacific- Yukon Exposition, the San Diego Exposition, and the campus of the Washington State Capitol. Private commissions resulted in over 2,700 designs in the Pacific Northwest as well as in Colorado, Kentucky, Alabama, Ohio, and Pennsylvania. Major development work included projects for Palos Verdes Estates, Lake Wales Land Company, and the British Pacific Properties in Canada. This 4,700 acre West Vancouver site encompassing designs for a highway and suspension bridge as well as residential development was the final work of Dawson's long and productive career.

Dawson was the lead landscape architect for the garden at the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House and corresponded with the McDuffies regularly. The correspondence regarding the design and planting of the property between the Olmsted Brothers and the McDuffies dates from 1914 to 1939.

GIORGIO CELESTRE

A Sicilian immigrant stone mason, Giorgio (George) Celestre (1883 -1975) came to America with his brother in 1906 at 23 years old. After caring for gardens at West Point, New York, he began as gardener for Duncan McDuffie at his Claremont Property in 1909. He is reputed to have worked into the late 1950's. His involvement at the Duncan and Jean McDuffie House is substantial but elusive. His work was primarily horticultural, but the extensive stone work of local quarry stone throughout the property’s garden is likely his and his brother’s work. Celestre is credited with overseeing the growing and planting of much of the design's plant fabric.

“It is interesting to note the quality of Duncan McDuffie. His gardener was a day-laborer, either Italian or Spanish, who had been a ditch-digger. McDuffie had gone up to one of the subdivisions in North Berkeley, which his firm developed to see how the thing was going, and he saw this young Italian spade up (because it was before the days of modern machinery) a clump of earth with a small flower growing on it. And the ditch-digging foreign imported man lumped the earth around the roots and set it aside so it wouldn’t Just die. He planted it where they weren’t digging the ditch. McDuffie said, “I thought about that for a week, and then I decided that I would have him as a gardener, I brought him here [to his estate], and he is the man who does all this.” McDuffie himself of course knew a great deal about gardening, and taught the Italian.”

http://www.archive.org/stream/lehmanrecollecti00lehmrich/lehmanrecollecti00lehmrich_djvu.txt
Page & Turnbull Report on 22 Roble Rd, 2011

PUBLISHED WORKS


PUBLIC RECORDS

• Berkeley Architectural Heritage Association (BAHA): Roble Road files and Building Permits
• Berkeley City Directories
• Berkeley Public Library, Berkeley History Room
• City of Berkeley, Municipal Code, Section 3.24.110: Landmarks Preservation Commission
• City of Berkeley Planning Department, Building Permit Applications
• Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps
• University of California, Berkeley, Environmental Design Archives
• University of California, Berkeley, Bancroft Library

NEWSPAPERS AND PERIODICALS

• “Berkeley Civic Leader Dies,” Oakland Tribune, April 22, 1951.
• “Duncan McDuffie Dies; Noted Conservationist.” San Francisco Examiner. April 22, 1951.
• “Key Berkeley partners met 100 years ago today,” Contra Costa Times (August 8, 2003).
• Oakland Tribune, November, 1921
UNPUBLISHED MANUSCRIPTS AND DRAWINGS


PHOTOGRAPHIC RESOURCES

• Page & Turnbull, Fischer Architects, Leila Moncharsh, Carrie Olson as noted. Special thank you to the National Park Service for providing historic photographs to Leila Moncharsh, including landscaping siteplans.

INTERNET SOURCES

• The Cultural Landscape Foundation “James Frederick Dawson.” http://tclf.org/content/jamesdawson
• http://www.aapra.org/Pugsley/McDuffieDuncan.html
• Finding Aid, Environmental Design Archives, University of California, Berkeley. “Willis Polk” http://ced.berkeley.edu/cedarchives/profiles/wpolk.htm
• “Save the Redwoods League, Dedicated Groves” http://www.savetheredwoods.org/give/grove_list.shtml
• History of Berkeley, http://historyofberkeley.org/chapter15.html
• (for more info on bread making in WWI, http://or.findacase.com/research/wfrmDocViewer.aspx/xq/fac./SCT/SCT3/1924/19240414_0040265.SCT.htm/qx) and http://www.oac.cdlib.org/view?docId=kt1n39r4r8&view=dsc&style=oac4&dsc.position=2501
• http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sidney_Howard
• http://www.museumstuff.com/learn/topics/Sidney_Howard::sub::Legacy
• https://digital.lib.washington.edu/architect/architects/3726/
• http://www.parks.ca.gov/pages/1054/files/sfmod.pdf
• (source: http://socialarchive.iath.virginia.edu/xtf/view?docid=Olmsted+Frederick+Law+1870-1957-cr.xml)
• http://www.archive.org/stream/treasureislandma00jamerich/treasureislandma00jamerich_djvu.txt
• http://www.archive.org/stream/lehmanrecollect00lehmrich/lehmanrecollect00lehmrich_djvu.txt
• http://www.archive.org/stream/lehmanrecollect00lehmrich/lehmanrecollect00lehmrich_djvu.txt
• http://www.archive.org/stream/lehmanrecollect00lehmrich/lehmanrecollect00lehmrich_djvu.txt
• http://www.ancestry.com
• http://books.google.com/books?id=T5lXAAACAAJ&pg=PA69&lpg=PA69&dq=%22baby+hospital%22+oakland+%22duncan+mcduffie%22&source=bl&ots=5WVjyw-wLW&sig=k90YuV3maVbxmY8Yd03JCroZjY0&hl=en&ei=O8RhTZ63KoG-sQQR05HFCA&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&sqi=2&ved=0CBcQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=%22baby%20hospital%22%20oakland%22%20duncan%20mcduffie%22&f=false
• http://books.google.com/books?id=zBTnAAAAMAAJ&pg=PA79&dq=%22spanish+architecture%22+arts+and+decoration&hl=en&ei=_sRhTYKtK4i6sQPrsunYCA&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&sqi=2&ved=0CDwQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false

Special thanks to Page & Turnbull, Fischer Architects, Leila Moncharsh, John English, Susan Cerny, Michael Corbett, Daniella Thompson, Christie O’Hara, Andy Carpentier, Berkeley Architectural Heritage Association, and the staff of the Landmarks Preservation Commission for providing their time and expertise to pull this information together.
APPENDIX: MISC. BACKGROUND MATERIALS

The Bancroft Library University of California/Berkeley Regional Oral History Office
CONTINUING MEMOIRS: FAMILY, COMMUNITY, UNIVERSITY An Interview Conducted by Suzanne B. Riess
VII WARTIME (Interview 8, February 22, 1973)
Ella Barrows Hagar: The Red Cross Auxiliary was another activity started in Berkeley immediately after Pearl Harbor. Mrs. McDuffie gathered six or eight women in her garden one afternoon and she said, "What is coming, we don't know, but I think we ought to organize a Red Cross branch here." So, that was the beginning of the Red Cross Auxiliary that she carried on in St. Clement's Church. That branch was permitted by the Berkeley Red Cross chapter, and through the generosity of St. Clement's Church--we took over the whole parish house! It included almost all of the war services and allowed people in this area, not having gasoline enough to go to the downtown branch every day, to work almost full time. Mrs. McDuffie was a catalyst. She had helped to start Children's Hospital in Oakland. Years before I knew her she had started the Women's City Club in San Francisco. She was an amazing organizer.

……Jean was an active member of the Garden Clubs of America. In fact, she was the unceasing worker who was responsible, I'm sure, for the gift from that organization that established the Garden Clubs of America's Redwood Grove. Yes, Heaven only knows what Jean McDuffie would have organized in behalf of ecology! She was the hardest volunteer worker I have ever known. She would never have wanted to be professional. The McDuffies had the most beautiful garden in Berkeley. It was one of their great interests. She had two or three gardeners, and George Sylvester, who was her head gardener, is still there. Indeed, sometimes she would go into her garden to direct the gardeners—in a chiffon gown, with a picture hat on, a veritable Helen Hokinson picture. She was greatly admired and loved, and the garden parties given by the McDuffies were rightly famous. A precious possession of mine is the silver tray and tea set, at which I often presided during these parties, and which Jean McDuffie left me in her will.
APPENDIX: MISC. BACKGROUND MATERIALS

From Case Study of Institution-Building by Nurse Bertha Wright and Colleagues Journal of Nursing Scholarship. Jeanette Nichols, Marjorie S. Hammer Article first published online: 2 OCT 2007


Purpose: To illuminate the history of nurses’ participation in institution-building in the early 1900s, using the Baby Hospital in Oakland, California (now called Children's Hospital Oakland) as a case.

Design: Historical research using a framework of women's history theory focused on the women who founded Oakland's Baby Hospital, 1910–1930.

Method: Data collection included studying original sources, archival material, and interviews. Data evaluation included external criticism for authenticity and genuineness, and internal criticism for accuracy and bias.

Findings: In 1912, nurse Bertha Wright and social worker Mabel Weed, with a circle of community women, including Jessica Peixotto and Jean Howard McDuffie, established the Baby Hospital. Their activism included home visits, education, research, publications, political lobbying, and state policy and program development. At the center of this activity, was the lifelong commitment of Wright and Weed, who created new definitions of family. With social changes in the late 1920s, the male Board of Directors seized control of the hospital, and relegated women to auxiliary roles.

Conclusions: Health and social issues of the United States at the turn of the century are still problematic as a new century approaches and pertain to maternal-child health, foster care, and immigration. Feminists, including nurses, have played a central role in creating solutions. Knowledge of some of their incredible effort has been lost, particularly nursing’s history in the western United States.
CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL PLANNED FOR OAKLAND

Charitable Women of City to Do Great Work for Needy

A number of representatives from the various trusts, committees, and organizations of the city have been appointed to form the board of managers of the children's hospital. The board will consist of men and women who have been active in the work of the hospital, and will be chosen from the ranks of the city's most prominent citizens.

The hospital will be located in Oakland, and will be under the management of the trustees, who will have the best medical and surgical equipment available. It is hoped that this hospital shall be a great success, and that it may become a model for other hospitals throughout the country.

Oakland has long been in need of a hospital, and this new institution will fill the gap. The hospital will be open to all races and religions, and will be of benefit to the entire community. Its success will depend upon the support of the people of the city, and it is hoped that every citizen will do his part to make it a success.
APPENDIX: MISC. BACKGROUND MATERIALS

History of Children's Hospital & Research Center Oakland

The year is 1912. William Howard Taft is President of the United States, and Congress has just come up with a newfangled source of revenue: the federal income tax. Locally, Oakland's mayor is battling San Francisco politicians over their proposal to annex his city. Women cannot vote, and have no official say in public policy. But an Alameda County nurse named Bertha Wright and a group of East Bay ladies have a very ambitious plan: to open "the first hospital on this coast where equipment and management would be exclusively for the care of babies..."—all babies, and children, no matter what their family circumstances.

The ladies turned their plan into reality within two years. They began by founding the Baby Hospital Association and added a male Board of Directors to facilitate business transactions. They raised $12,500 to buy an old estate on one and one-third acres at Fifty-first and Dover Streets in Oakland. They pinned up their skirts and rolled up their sleeves to scrub the floors and windows of the mansion's former stable, where on September 6, 1914, the Baby Hospital opened its doors.

In 1967, Miss Wright recalled those early days: "...We had to fight our way. The doctors opposed us, as they thought we were taking their patients away. We had to educate the people to feel that the hospital would help their children... I remember the difficulty I had so many times in convincing them that a baby needed special care..."

During its first year of operation, the Baby Hospital charged $1 per day for ward beds and $2.50 for private rooms. Those who could not pay were treated for free. The average monthly cost of operation was $2,000, with about $800 covered by patient fees and funds from the city and county. The ladies went door to door, collecting donations to make up the deficit, and the hospital was able to grow and serve more children. No family was ever turned away for lack of ability to pay.

The practice of medicine and the delivery of healthcare have undergone vast changes since 1914, and so has the Baby Hospital. We've changed our name and expanded our services. Today, Children's Hospital & Research Center Oakland is a 191-bed regional and global resource for advanced pediatric care, research and medical education, with more than 200,000 patient visits per year. Children's has Northern California's most active pediatric trauma center, the region's busiest pediatric intensive care unit, and one of the largest sickle cell treatment and research centers in the world. Children's 166 hospital-based physicians provide expert care in 30 pediatric subspecialties, from adolescent medicine to urology.

APPENDIX: MISC. BACKGROUND MATERIALS

Town and Country Club 1922
Club House: 218 Stockton Street, San Francisco.

OFFICERS
President Mrs. DUNCAN McDUFFIE
Vice President Mrs. WILLIAM KENT
Treasurer Mrs. CURTIS SWAIN
Secretary Mrs. FREDERIC MAGEE

ASSOCIATE DIRECTORS
Mrs. WILLIS POLK
Mrs. DUANE BLISS, Jr.
Miss MABEL PIERCE
Mrs. DOUGLAS WATSON
Mrs. HERMAN PHLEGER
Miss BETTY GAYLEY

WHO’S WHO AMONG THE WOMEN OF CALIFORNIA 1922

California Civic League of Women Voters

OFFICERS
Mrs. Parker S. Maddux, President Mrs. Jesse H. Steinhart, First Vice-President Mrs. Alfred McLaughlin, Second Vice-President Miss Eliza May Willard, Corresponding Secretary Mrs. Andrew E. Neuenburg, Recording Secretary Miss Mabel Pierce, Treasurer Miss Margaret Mary Morgan, Auditor Mrs. Genevieve Allen, Business Secretary

BOARD OF DIRECTORS
Mrs. Ludwig Frank
Mrs. Ida Finney Mackerille
Mrs. Henry Harris
Mrs. Willis Polk
Mrs. Franklin Harwood
Mrs. M. Silverberg
Mrs. Ernest Wallace
Mrs. Duncan McDuffie

The San Francisco Center is a non-partisan organization devoted to the establishment of equality for women in citizenship; to the study of civic problems; to the discussion of public questions; and to constructive civic work. After ten years of existence it has a membership of over 2400 women, with four special committees doing active work, the Public Health, City Government, Public Dance Hall and Public Speakers groups, and one more, the City Planning Committee, organized, but not yet functioning. The standing committees include a very active Legislative group working in conjunction with the Women’s Legislative Council and the California Civic League of Women Voters, with both of which state organizations the San Francisco Center is affiliated.

In addition to monthly membership meetings for the transaction of business, legislative endorsements and so on, the Center runs a continuous program of afternoon discussion; lectures; teas; luncheons and very rarely a dinner, with addresses from distinguished guests. The scope of these meetings is suggested by a partial list of the past eight months, when our local subjects have included “A Better and Greater San Francisco,” “Marketing in San Francisco,” “Proposed Reduction in the Minimum Wage for Women in Industry” and, upon our tenth anniversary of the granting of suffrage to the women of California, “Is the Time Ripe for a Woman Supervisor?”
APPENDIX: MISC. BACKGROUND MATERIALS

THE NATIONAL LEAGUE FOR WOMEN’S SERVICE CLUB
San Francisco

OFFICERS

Mrs. Harry Staats Moore, President
Mrs. Marcos S. Koshland, Vice-President
Mrs. A.S. Baldwin, Treasurer
Miss Edith Black, Recording Secretary
Mrs. Henry Crocker, Corresponding Secretary
Mrs. R.P. Hankerson, Executive Secretary

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Mrs. A.S. Baldwin
Mrs. S.G. Chapman
Mrs. Katherine Phillips Edson
Mrs. William B. Hamilton
Miss Gail Laughlin
Mrs. William Palmer Lucas
Mrs. F. S. Moody
Miss Lillian Palmer
Miss Edith Slack
Mrs. Wm. Warren
Mrs. George Kelham

Mrs. A.P. Black
Mrs. Henry Crocker
Miss Anna L. Fetherstone
Mrs. Wendell Hammon
Miss Marion Whitfield Leale
Mrs. Parker S. Maddux
Mrs. H. S. Moore
Miss Esther Phillips
Mrs. H. A. Stephenson
Miss Ethel A. Young

Dr. Adelaide Brown
Miss Jean Doub
Mrs. Cleveland Forbes
Mrs. Marcus S. Koshland
Mrs. Alexander Lilley
Mrs. Ernest Meiere
Mrs. J. R. K. Nuttall
Mrs. Willis Polk
Mrs. H.L. Terwilliger
Mrs. Duncan McDuffie

The San Francisco branch of the National League for Women’s Service was formed in June, 1917 and performed much valuable work during the war.

After the crisis caused by the war had passed, it was decided to carry on the work at the National League for Women’s Service Club and through its activities meet certain community needs not covered by other organizations.

The aim is to promote a big democratic organization—democratic enough to satisfy members of every industry, profession, business and social affiliation. Every effort has been put forth to make quarters of the League comfortable and attractive, and yet, inexpensive enough to come within the reach of all, and general enough, to allow for its use by smaller, more definite groups.

The Volunteer Service department is kept in action by service rendered within the league—in the lounge, shop and restaurant.

The League maintains a restaurant for the convenience of its members where attractive lunches and dinners are served at moderate prices.

The Shop is one of the most popular activities but must be seen to be fully appreciated.

The Vocational Guidance Bureau is the one only kind in San Francisco where women may go for information concerning any employment open to women—where they may count on receiving wise counsel without cost.

(signed) Elizabeth Hogue Moore
SAN FRANCISCO CENTER
California Civic League of Women Voters

OFFICERS

President
MRS. PARKER S. MADDOX, 708 Valencia

First Vice-President
MRS. JESSE H. STEINHARDT, 2400 Steiner

Second Vice-President
MRS. ALFRED MILLERICH, 1512 Clay

Corresponding Secretary
MISS ELSA MAY WILLARD, 854 Francisco

Recording Secretary
MISS ANDREW E. NEUMANN, 746 California

Auditor
MISS MARIE PIETRO, 1000 Chestnut

Business Secretary
MRS. CONSTANCE ALLEN, 117 10th Avenue

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

MRS. LUTHER FRANK
MRS. HENRY HARRIS
MRS. FRANKLIN HAMMOND
MRS. ERNEST WALLACE

CHAIRMAN OF SPECIAL COMMITTEES

MRS. HENRY HARRIS, Public Health
MRS. ALFRED E. KANE, Public Speaking

CHAIRMAN OF STANDING COMMITTEES

MRS. TIMOTHY HEALY, Publicity
MRS. WILLIAM KIGHT, Education
MRS. ALICE BURKE, Headquarters

THE San Francisco Center is a non-partisan organization devoted to the establishment of equality for women in citizenship; to the study of civic problems; to the discussion of public questions; and to constructive civic work. After ten years of existence it has a membership of over 2,100 women, with four special committees doing active work; the Public Health, City Government, Public Dance Hall and Public Speakers groups; and one more, the City Planning Committee, organized, but not yet functioning. The standing committees include a very active Legislative group working in conjunction with the Women's Legislative Council and the California Civic League of Women Voters, with both of which state organizations the San Francisco Center is affiliated.

In addition to monthly membership meetings for the transaction of business, legislative endorsement and so on, the Center runs a continuous program of afternoon discussions, lectures, teas, luncheons and very rarely a dinner, with addresses from distinguished guests. The scope of these meetings is suggested by a partial list of the past eight months, when our local subjects have included "A Better and Greater San Francisco," "Marketing in San Francisco," "Proposed Reduction in the Minimum Wage for Women in Industry" and, upon our tenth anniversary of the granting of suffrage to the women of California, "Is the Time Ripe for a Woman Supervisor?" (Incidentally we would add that San Francisco voted that it was, and one of our officers became our first Woman Supervisor). Gertrude Atherton has told us of the "Movie World at Close Range," Dr. Wm. R. P. Emerson has stated "What's Wrong with Our Children," and the Norris, Charles and Kathleen, have discussed "Woman's Adjustment to a Career and the Home" and "Divorce." Julius Kuhn brought us the latest word from Washington on difficult taxation matters, and while Mlle Alexandrovitch Schwartz spoke from recent experience on "The Menace of Bolshevism," Washington Vunderlich told us that Lenin ranks with Lincoln. In the juxtaposition of ten days came Arthur Brisbane and H. Wickham Steed, as well as, later, Francis W. Hirst, former editor of the London Economist. "The Awakening of Women in the Orient," with graduates in native costume from Oriental colleges in India, Japan and China, and a notable series of our own Dissuasion Conferences gave us international points of view, capped by the most delightful good will when General Diaz came to us with his staff, for tea, and gave us a wonderfully inspirational talk. Such an outline necessarily omits many of the topics discussed at Center meetings; however it at least suggests the cosmopolitan interest of an eager intelligent woman citizenship, the only requirement for membership.

Esell Walker Madden
President
1936, THE MAGIC CITY

More than two years before the gates of Treasure Island opened, nine women from the Bay area were invited to serve as a central committee to advise in matters of potential interest and attraction, to assist with hospitality and to organize and carry out a widespread task, namely to interest the women of the Western states particularly in what the Golden Gate International Exposition would offer. Mrs. George T. Cameron of Burlingame was named chairman of the group, which included Mrs. George Creel, Mrs. William Denman, Mrs. John F. Forbes of Ross, Mrs. Walter A. Haas, Mrs. E. S. Heller, Mrs. Duncan McDuffie of Berkeley, Mrs. Alfred McLaughlin, Mrs. Henry Potter Russell of Burlingame. The group represented far more than geographical distribution and social prestige. Every member was a leader in the cultural, artistic or educational life of the community women whose benefactions extended well beyond the boundaries of their own localities. It was to such a group that the officials of the 1939 Exposition turned for suggestions and assistance in their efforts to create an Exposition which should be record-making, both artistically and financially.

http://www.archive.org/stream/treasureislandma00jamerich/treasureislandma00jamerich_djvu.txt

Architecture, November, 1921
Charles Scribner's Sons
New York, NY

Willis Polk
“Artistic Building is an Obligation”
http://www.archive.org/stream/architectureprof44newyuoft/architectureprof44newyuoft_djvu.txt

In any structural problem, be it a bridge or a building, a warehouse or a cathedral, a given amount of labor and material may, for the same capital expenditure, be made to assume either agreeable or disagreeable form the result may possess every element of economy and practical utility, but that great, elusive, ever-sought-after quality, artistic charm, may be totally missing!

Artistic treatment need not add to cost of construction nor detract from pure utility, therefore why not have it?
Every structural problem carries with it the obligation that it will not become an eyesore in a community.

Artistic result, being desirable, why do we not always get it?
The architect strives to combine beauty with economy and utility. Beauty is his beacon and in quest thereof, if successful, he has to overcome the obstacles of utility and economy. Failure to achieve artistic results is therefore not always the fault of the architect.

The engineer, proverbially indifferent to all intangible elements, complacently relegates artistic effect to the realm of chance. He strongly resents the intrusion of the artist, and from his viewpoint the less artistic the result the greater his triumph. Utility, he argues, is beauty, and that is all there is to it.

Nevertheless, the artistic appearance of all structures, whether public or private, is an obligation which rests alike upon all in authority, whether he be architect, engineer, or owner.

Architecture is the art of creating an agreeable form.
In the days of Rameses artists had their problems, and art as well as artists languished. In these days artists have their problems, and art as well as artists languish as usual.

In the course of time yea, even until the end of time I opine that art and artists will continue to languish, but that will not prevent the artist from striving. Such conditions, rather than deterring the artistic spirit, will only urge it on. Art is a domineering mistress, a mistress that never relents, and once one of her votaries falls under her thrall there is no hope but the hope of success at the expense of sacrifice, a hope that makes a votary renounce all other aims and forever cling to his mistress. Such an act of renunciation is a sacred sacrifice one that is rarely commercialized.

We can always commercialize the old masters, we can always fatten and thrive on the prowess of a dead genius, we can always feel complacent over the hunger cravings of a living artist, and that without registering a single compunction of conscience, but notwithstanding that genius, though rare, is a constantly recurring manifestation of the divine spirit, we nearly always fail to recognize it in less than two hundred years. Living artists have no sales agents, no chambers of commerce, nor well-defined avenues of approach to the milk and honey of patronage the halls of commercialized art are not open to them and will not be unless they die.

All that the living artist has is a mythological winged steed "Pegasus."

As Mr. Burnham said:
"Make no little plans; they have not magic to stir men's blood and probably themselves will not be realized. Make big plans; aim high in hope and work, remembering that a noble, logical diagram once recorded will never die, but long after we are gone will be a living thing, asserting itself with ever-growing insistency. Remember that our sons and grandsons are going to do things that would stagger us. Let your watchword be order and your beacon beauty."

---

Architect & Engineer
April, 1930
George W. Kelham, Architect

**Possibilities of Decorative Tile with Terra Cotta and Brick**

While a great amount of promotional work is being done by the ceramist, he is vitally interested in just what the architect wants.

Not so many years ago Willis Polk returned from abroad. He was convinced that the same picturesqueness and artistry of color of the tile roofs of Latin countries could be obtained in a modern medium. His thought was expressed to the head of one of California's largest ceramic concerns, who undertook the solution of the problem.

This culminated in the creation of a new roof tile far removed from the drab mechanical monotony of tile roof then prevalent. This is co-operation to the fullest extent between the architect and the ceramist. It is productive of the greatest bond of sympathy in the development of new and interesting work in the field of architecture and ceramic art.
**REMEMBER WHEN?**

**50 YEARS AGO:**

From The Pine Cone, December 9, 1922:

CARMEL HAS LOST both garbage can and garbage man! The Board of Trustees will give a lollipop - whatever that may be - to the ingenious person who can furnish either or both. Carmel garbage is like Bartley Fallon’s hayfork - we’ve got it but we’ve got no place to put it - and now, Mr. Smith, the accommodating gentleman who has been so faithful in removing our tin cans and potato peelpings refuses to continue longer in his office as a public carrier and resigns. It took the Trustees most of last Tuesday evening to get over the double blow.

At Tuesday afternoon the City Planning Commission held a meeting. This was for the purpose of hearing what Mr. Duncan MacDuffie had to say on city planning commissions in general and the experiment in Berkeley in particular.

Mr. MacDuffie laid much stress on the importance of zoning a city. By deliberately keeping the commercial part of the town centered in one district and the residential part in another, the property values in both commercial and residential districts are bound to rise; also shops, tea houses, garages, gain by being bunched together whereas private residences need room to spread.

Gone is the old time Carmel Postoffice; the new modern one has descended upon us. It is just like every other postoffice in the United States, only it fairly bristles with neatness, much plate glass and imposing window and box space.

However, Postmistress Stella Vincent and her co-workers must enjoy the additional space; up-to-date equipment and the sunshine which pours in through the south windows. We’ll all get used to it, even though it does not fit in to our scenery.

**25 YEARS AGO:**

From The Pine Cone, December 6, 1967

DOGS, COWS and burros got embroiled in a public hearing before the city council which would permit veterinarians grooming parlors to operate under right the C-2 zone of the city.

Last night Dr. James E. Gilchrist, Constitution, a raft of legal citation discrimination at the city council proposed amendment to the code prohibiting doctors, lawyers and other professionals from operating demonstrably illegal beards to earn a livelihood without classes.

So much conversation it almost becomes meaningless. However, answer lies in our evidence. This could be variation in its...
APPENDIX: MISC. BACKGROUND MATERIALS

World War I Draft Registration Cards, 1917-1918 record for Duncan Mcduffie

Record Index
- **Name:** Duncan Mcduffie
- **City:** Berkeley
- **County:** Alameda
- **State:** California

Source Information
- **Source Citation:**
  Registration Location: Alameda County, California;
  Roll: 1530662; Draft Board: 1.
APPENDIX: MISC. BACKGROUND MATERIALS

Samuel Goldwyn Jr. to Wed Jennifer Howard in August

February, 1977

DUNCAN McDUFFIE

Even as a novice in the real estate business Duncan McDuffie exhibited an inordinate amount of vision. At the same time he recognized the ultimate need to preserve California's natural wonders.

A man ahead of his time? Certainly he was a man who reached the scene at the right time with unusual talent.

A good listener who quietly considered the viewpoints of others, Duncan McDuffie was...
AN ARCHITECTURAL LEGACY FROM SPAIN
A NOTE ON SPANISH DERIVATIONS IN AMERICAN ARCHITECTURE

By C. Matlack Price

THE interest in a national style of architecture seems to spring perennially in popular fancy—possibly because some critics periodically acclaim its discovery with much fanfare, and partly because, after it has been "discovered" it appears to be something else, and not "national" at all—merely another derivation. Thus with the California type, or some of its manifestations, of which, however, the success is measurable rather in terms of colloquial appropriateness than of scholarly accuracy.

This magazine has published articles discussing, under the title of "Foreign Derivations in American Architecture," the several parts of our architectural expression which we owe to Italy, to England, and to France. It remains to outline, as lucidly as possible, to what degree we are architecturally indebted to Spain, and to bring out the point that, curiously enough, we have made the least use of that European style to which we would appear to have been most logically entitled.

The scarcity of Spanish derivations, however, is due to a number of perfectly logical reasons, not entirely architectural. In the first place, the entirely Spanish house was evolved in a hot country, and to meet the needs of a certain social life quite different even from that of other European countries, and very different from that of this country.

To keep heat and glare from the rooms within, the outer windows were always small, and in a country where, in the outlying districts, there were always brigands and dangerous tramps, these windows, especially on the lower floor, were always guarded by iron grilles. Each house, even in the cities, was, in its external appearance, a small domestic fortress. Its inmates dwelt within-doors, there was no "street life" for the better classes, the women of the house being sedulously guarded from outside influences with an inflexible strictness which must have come to the Spanish people as part of their legacy of Orientalism from the Moors.

As a rule, then, there was little pretense at exterior architectural embellishment, the most attractive part of the house becoming apparent after the
visitor had passed behind the heavy iron-studded entrance door.

The exterior of the Spanish house is really in the interior—that is, in the patio or enclosed court. The patio is an essential part of the Spanish house—as characteristic as the “great hall” of the early English house.

Here it was possible for the dwellers within the house to spend such time as they spent out doors, usually in the cool of the late afternoon and evening, and here were usually beautiful flowers and birds and fountains—all quite as romantic as one has always been led to imagine from story books. Thus many a grim and unprepossessing Spanish house held behind its stern outer walls, a beautiful courtyard, open to the cloudless sky, yet perfectly secure from either chance or intended molestation.

Ordinarily such service rooms as kitchens, servants’ hall and sleeping quarters and the like were on the ground floor, and the living and sleeping apartments of the owner were upon the second, or premier étage of the house.

Obviously a house designed along these lines could never have taken root in New England, where the severe northern climate and the entirely different social scheme would not have accepted it, nor yet in the estates of Virginia or Carolina, where there existed manners and customs differing from those of New England, but also differing essentially from Spanish ideas.

That the peasant, or farm development of the Spanish type as seen in Spain never took root in this country is a little strange, though there are a few examples in certain remote parts of our South.

west. In this type the patio is not a beautiful space of flowers and fountains, presided over by a dark-eyed senorita, but is nothing more than a farm yard, with carts backed under the gallery, chickens enlivening the court itself, and various farm beasts housed on the ground floor, where hay and grain are also stored, and all, after dark, secured from thieves by the shutting of the great main door.

Eliminating the danger from thieves, there was, of course, no necessity of locking up all the farm beasts in the house itself, and even at a time when hygiene and sanitation were not as popular as they are today, the farmers of this country did not regard the idea as being highly commendable, and kept their livestock in outbuildings.

Essentially the patio was developed from an idea that the house was a fortress and every passerby an enemy, so that it is really an idea outgrown by modern safety. It is however architecturally delightful that we are to hope that it may never entirely vanish. Merely from the considerations of privacy and shelter from a glaring sun, and quite forgetting its original idea of safety, it seems that California architecture should faithfully perpetuate it.

Returning once more to locale, the pure Spanish type, built by Spanish colorists, is to be found throughout those parts of South America once settled by Spain, and in New Orleans, where the Spanish Creoles built their new homes. Also it is to be found in the southwest, usually in the form of the hacienda, or ranch-house, and in Southern California.

By no means should it be supposed that the
Spanish type of house, because it is one of our earliest importations, should be generally adopted as a national "American" type. It would be miserably and absurdly inappropriate, architecturally and practically. It would be as absurd to build a real Spanish house in Maine as it would be to build a New England farm-house in Southern California.

The residence of S. L. Naphaly, Esq., in San Francisco, illustrated in this article, is an interesting development of the Spanish idea of a house. The architect, Willis Polk, of San Francisco, has, of course, handled the design with due consideration of the fact that the actual necessity of fortification in the private house of today is unnecessary.

The exterior presents an interesting aspect, with rather more architectural detail in evidence than usually embellished the Spanish house, but with this detail applied and handled in a manner essentially characteristic and expressive of general type and this particular house.

The enrichment of the windows on the second floor conveys the fact that here are the important rooms within. The door is detailed with a well-studied iron grille of Spanish feeling, and the lower windows are subordinated to those above. In the original Spanish house there might well have been no windows on this floor, or if any, they would have been small, high in the wall, and forbiddingly protected with iron grilles.

Within the house there is a splendid patio, open to the sky, and of a design which will make it an excellent architectural background for planting and flowers. It is a trifle more "architectural" than most Spanish patio—that is, there seems to be a little more classicism in the detail, a little more of the Italian than of the Spanish Renaissance.

There is in the design of this patio a good deal of suggestion for the treatment of a large city house, or for a house whose site does not command any pleasing views.

In emphasizing the point that the patio is a characteristic of the Spanish house, it should not be supposed that it is peculiar to it. Moorish and other Eastern houses, such as these of Persia, have from the earliest times been developed around the idea of an enclosed court-yard, or a walled garden. The Greek atrium was an early expression of the idea, which found favor with the Romans and reached an apex of architectural expression under the hands (Continued on page 79.)

An interior in which the architectural treatment and the selection of the furniture have been made with a view to expressing Spanish derivation in modern terms. Willis Polk, architect
The S.L. Naphaly House at 2960 Broadway today

(photo, Carrie Olson)
Oriental Rugs
A varied selection in
EXCLUSIVE COLORS AND DESIGNS
completely on hand at very lowest
prices consistent with quality.
SPECIAL SIZES MADE TO ORDER
ANTIQUE AND MODERN CHINESE RUGS
The most famous and distinctive collection in America.
JONES & BRINDISI
452 Fifth Avenue, cor. 40th St., New York

Acquaintance, In Grecian Draperies, A Sketch, Giri Dancing, and Bust of Mrs. Francis B. Sayre.
This collection will be shown in the Art Institute of Chicago after the exhibition in Pittsburgh.

The Children’s Hour held under the auspices of the Department of Fine Arts, Carnegie Institute, was inaugurated for the season 1914-1915 on Saturday, Nov. 7, Mr. Charles J. Taylor, illustrator, member of the faculty of the Carnegie Institute of Technology, gave a chalk talk on illustrations of interest to children. He was assisted by Norman Kennedy and J. W. Thompson, both of Pittsburgh.

Many interesting subjects have been selected for demonstration to the children during the year. There will be exhibitions of modelling, plaster casting, and wax cast, as well as talks, illustrated by lantern slides, on various periods of painting and architecture. The permanent collections and special exhibitions in the Department of Fine Arts will be utilized for the benefit of the children.

AN ARCHITECTURAL LEGACY FROM SPAIN.

(Continued from page 59.)

One of the best adaptations of the Italian patio or courtyard in this country is in the Boston Public Library, while one of the best adaptations of the Spanish patio is to be seen in that remarkable building of the South American Republics in Washington, D. C. The rich and beautiful detail of the Spanish Renaissance, of which little is generally understood and appreciated, is excellently rendered in the patio of the Hispanic Museum in New York City.

Certainly Spain, like the other European countries, has given us an architectural legacy of the greatest value, but one which is, perhaps, less understood than some of the others. There is more to Spanish architecture than a red tile roof and an iron balcony, and there are more unknown treasures of detail in the storehouse of the Spanish Renaissance than have ever been taken out by our architects, even in those parts of the United States which are the logical home of Spanish American architecture.
THE BABY HOSPITAL AND CLINIC IN OAKLAND

I wish that all nurses just starting out in welfare work might visit the new Baby Hospital and clinic in Oakland; I wish this because of the inspiration they would gain, because it all came from the need that our Miss Wright felt when she was engaged in school nursing and visiting nursing in Berkeley.

In her personal touch with the people in their homes it could not but become apparent that there was a crying need for a hospital where poor, little sick babies could be taken and cared for, as many could not be in their homes, and in many instances that we all know of. You must just pause and think about what it means for a family of very modest income on which it can at best barely make ends meet, to have added expense of sickness with its attendant sadness and worry; and so, in June, 1912, with a firm faith in her human kind, Miss Wright just went around among the doctors and the people whom she knew in Alameda County and placed her needs before them. She met great encouragement, for in September, 1912, a board of managers was formed, with Mrs. Duncan McDuffie as its president. In January, 1913, the McElrath property at Fifty-first and Dover streets was purchased by the Baby Hospital Association. At that time there were on the property a large dwelling house and a barn. The barn was speedily converted into convenient quarters for a free clinic, which was accordingly opened to the public. By the end of 1913 the property had been paid for by the earnest women of the association, and renovation was then begun and the house turned into an up-to-date hospital, which was formally opened and dedicated on the 16th day of September, 1914.

On the first floor of the hospital are the board of directors' and managers' rooms,
two large, sunny wards, and two sun rooms, with a capacity of twenty beds; a diet kitchen, a utility room, a dining room, a kitchen, a laundry, and a large hall, the end of which is used as an office. A dumb waiter facilitates service from the diet kitchen to the upper floor.

On the second floor are a large, sunny ward, with a capacity of ten beds, five private rooms, an operating room, an anesthetic room, a laboratory, a sterilizing room, a utility room, a physicians' lavatory, and a bath room.

The third floor contains eight bed rooms and two bath rooms for the use of employees, a large store room, and a mothers' rest room for the use of mothers who wish to remain near the children.

Miss von Heygendorff of New York City is in charge as superintendent and everything about the hospital testifies to the efficiency and interest of both superintendent and managers.

The hospital is now equipped with thirty-six lovely little white beds and tables, and the one great hope is that the people of the east bay cities shall all know of the splendid facilities for care of sick babies that have been provided in this Baby Hospital, where already fifty-six children have been cared for; and I wonder how many of us ever stop to think what one little sick baby made well means in the life of its family.

This, however, is but one side of the work, for there is the clinic, where Miss Wright and two physicians are busy three mornings in the week and where thirty to forty babies receive individual attention and sixty to seventy new babies are brought every month. Miss Wright and her assistant have, in the past year, made 5505 house visits, and in the eighteen months since the clinic opened 665 babies have been cared for.

On account of limited finances, an assistant is provided for only half a day, and the work is increasing so tremendously that the association is most anxious for subscriptions sufficient to provide a regular assistant. Is there not some nurse who reads these pages anxious to help with this work?

A clinic has also been started for the prenatal care of mothers, and at present there are twenty on the list. It is held once a week on Wednesday afternoons. The clinic provides medical care at confinement, and a kit with sterilized sheets, towels, dressing, and all supplies needed at the time, and for the use of which patients are expected to pay $1. The baby is under the care of the clinic as long as necessary.

The Social Service Club of East Oakland has furnished a branch clinic at the East Oakland Settlement, on Dennison Street, thus saving mothers with babies a long street car trip. Miss Wright takes personal charge of this branch on Tuesday and Thursday mornings.

Naturally the opening of the hospital has been a great help to the work of the clinic, as all operative cases are now referred to the hospital, where after care may be had, which would be impossible in the clinic or the home.

East bay physicians and surgeons who have accepted positions on the staff are performing golden service in helping the Baby Hospital Association realize its ideal—"taking sick or delicate infants whose wasted bodies are hungry for food, and giving them the power to live."