



Office of the City Manager

January 28, 2019

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

From: *Dee* Dee Williams-Ridley, City Manager

Subject: Refer to the City Manager to consider boycotting Amazon for its role in tracking immigrants in cooperation with ICE

Amazon was selected to provide the hosting of cloud storage to federal agencies as there are limited software vendors which are Federal Risk and Authorization Management Program (FedRAMP) certified. The FedRAMP is a government-wide program that provides a standardized approach to security assessment, authorization, and continuous monitoring for cloud products and services. This approach uses a “do once, use many times” framework that saves cost, time, and staff required to conduct redundant Agency security assessments. While roughly 60% of Amazon’s revenue comes from their North America e-Commerce (amazon.com) division and less than 15% comes from their AWS division (being contracted by ICE and DHS). The two major players that provide the infrastructure are Amazon and Microsoft Azure Cloud.

If the recommendation to boycott Amazon is incorporated, the potential fiscal impacts could include the following:

1. Impact to many housing programs applications;
2. Loss of revenue from critical grant applications due to lack of access to AWS services;
3. Staff time to research possible methods to replace the existing contracts including various grant based programs and, if alternatives are found, the costs to terminate the contracts, including payment of “reasonable profit” to the terminated vendor; the costs to locate and contract with compliant vendors; and the potential termination of grants or clawback of monies from grantors if deadlines are missed;
4. Daily reviewing all purchases by all departments for compliance with the boycott;
5. Daily monitoring for community member complaints of potential compliance matters and to ensure proper investigations occurs.

The referral to Council for boycotting Amazon and refrain from using its services to purchase goods for city use, if adopted, will have significant impact to the citywide technology operations.

Page 2

January 28, 2019

Re: Refer to the City Manager to consider boycotting Amazon for its role in tracking immigrants in cooperation with ICE

**Please refer to application list attached:** In preliminary research the staff has identified the programs and applications which will be impacted. While this is not comprehensive list of all applications, it explains the significance of the impact to citywide operations of this recommendation.

1. If adopted, the proposed referral will result in massive paper based interactions due to lack of technology infrastructure backend requirements. This would be in contradiction with Berkeley's Zero Waste and Climate Action Plan goals.
2. Adoption of the proposed Amazon boycott would have a huge negative impact to the citywide operations. It would impact Berkeley businesses, community members, and City staff in various ways. Implementation and enforcement will require and force us to replace our many critical applications and impact our future purchasing power for technological solutions to support the City needs. It will impact the cyber security operations and would create many challenges for technology infrastructure needs.
3. In addition to the proposed boycott, the Report also recommends three actions namely, "ending: (1) contracts that allow unfettered information sharing technologies and biometric collection to and from ICE; (2) contracts with private data brokers that work with ICE, and (3) predictive policing programs."
  - a. This recommendation would restrict and delay the City's monitoring of San Pablo Park since almost all CCTV systems today use predicative analytics to ensure reduced policing costs: hiring and paying someone to view the feed 24x7x365, lowering the number of alert errors, etc. The City has also recently enacted its Surveillance Ordinance which effectively and more clearly addresses this matter than the Report's recommendation.

For questions about the tool, please contact Savita Chaudhary, Director, Department of Information Technology, 510-981-6541, [schaudhary@cityofberkeley.info](mailto:schaudhary@cityofberkeley.info)

Attachment

cc: Paul Buddenhagen, Interim Deputy City Manager  
Jenny Wong, City Auditor  
Department Directors  
Assistants to the City Manager

**City Applications and Programs affected by Amazon Boycott**

<b>Application</b>	<b>Use of Amazon Services/Products</b>	<b>Impact Statement</b>	<b>User Groups</b>
Adobe	Adobe Systems use AWS cloud to provide digital media solutions to customers around the world including consumers, enterprises, and government agencies.	<p><b>Program Impact:</b>                      Adobe is a Core application that is used Citywide for pdf files.</p> <p>Various departments uses many Adobe products such as Adobe Pro, InDesign, Photoshop, Illustrator to conduct many City functions for document production</p>	Citywide
Airbnb	Airbnb benefits from the scalability, agility and reliability provided by Amazon Web Services, including Amazon EC2, Elastic Load Balancing, Amazon S3, Amazon EMR, Amazon CloudFront, Amazon CloudWatch, and Amazon RDS.	<p>Airbnb is a community marketplace for unique vacation spaces (short term rentals) around the world.</p> <p><b>Program Impact:</b>                      City utilizes Airbnb for the short term rental management</p>	Citywide
Acquia	Acquia uses AWS in a variety of ways, such as managing and provisioning the IT infrastructure necessary to host its customers' websites and web applications.	<p><b>Program Impact:</b>                      Council recently approved Acquia as a website hosting platform for the new website replacement project.</p> <p>The City needs the website to be hosted offsite so the community can get to the necessary information in case of the disaster and we have the redundancy when needed the most.</p>	Citywide

**City Applications and Programs affected by Amazon Boycott**

<b>Application</b>	<b>Use of Amazon Services/Products</b>	<b>Impact Statement</b>	<b>User Groups</b>
City Data Services	Utilize Amazon's cloud storage for storing uploaded documents in CDS system.	<p>City Data Services: Would not be able to electronically receive and manage over \$10 million in community agency applications, payments and contract requirements.</p> <p><b>Program Impact:</b>                      Community Agency Allocations &amp; Contract Management;                      Rehab Programs;                      Housing Trust Fund;                      Mental Health Division Contracts; and                      Sugar Sweetened Beverage Grant Program</p>	Housing & Community Services, Mental Health Division, and Pubic Health Division
ClaimRemedi Clearinghouse (eSolutions)	AWS is used for processing some products (Titan and Dorado).	<p>Public Health Clinics would not be able to use the Claims Clearinghouse to run eligibility checks, submit medical claims, download remittance transactions, and generate reports.</p> <p><b>Program Impact:</b>                      Claims, Remittance, Eligibility</p>	Public Health Division
Emphasys Elite	Elite utilizes Amazon S3 for applications including: HQS Touch, Work Order Touch, UPCS Touch, MyHousing and EDocs	<p><b>Program Impact:</b>                      Staff rely on Elite to generate approximately \$387,000 in rental payments monthly and it is an integral part of staff's work in calculating income re-certifications and automatically generating payment subsidy amounts.</p> <p><b>Low Income Housing Administration</b> -- Tenants, Inspections, Work Orders, Vouchers, Shelter Plus Care Program, Rental Assistance, etc.</p>	HHCS Community Services & Housing Division Berkeley Housing Authority

**City Applications and Programs affected by Amazon Boycott**

<b>Application</b>	<b>Use of Amazon Services/Products</b>	<b>Impact Statement</b>	<b>User Groups</b>
Efforts to Outcomes	ETO is hosted on Amazon Web Services. That is the extent of our relationship with Amazon products/services	<p>Not using ETO could threaten ongoing receipt of Alameda County funding. Participation in the evaluation and submission of data to ETO is a condition of the contract. City does not have direct contract with Social Solutions, but access to ETO is a condition of annual contract with Alameda County.</p> <p><b>Program Impact:</b></p> <p>Data is identified and submitted to UCSF to conduct regional evaluations of school based health centers for all clinics funded by the Alameda County Center for School Based Health.</p>	Public Health / Berkeley High School Health Center
My Senior Center	Images for the MySeniorCenter touchscreen and staff system are served up using the Amazon CloudFront delivery network.	<p><b>Program Impact:</b></p> <p><b>MySeniorCenter registration system:</b> would be unable to facilitate touchscreen registration for our senior center participants, which enables staff to collect senior center activity data required by our funder for reporting purposes. Also would be unable to track safety incident notes for each participant.</p>	Aging Services Division, Senior Centers
State TCM System	Pending receipt of information from State	<p><b>Program Impact:</b></p> <p>State's information management system for Targeted Case Management Program encounters, claiming, and invoicing.</p>	Aging Services Division, Public Health Division
NextGen EPM-EHR System	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>NextGen Ambulatory (if hosted by NextGen or use our SaaS solution)</li> </ul>	The HIPAA-compliant Electronic Health Record (EHR) captures patient's medical services, and key administrative clinical data that includes demographics, problems, medications, vital signs, past medical history,	Ann Chandler Public Health Clinic, and

**City Applications and Programs affected by Amazon Boycott**

Application	Use of Amazon Services/Products	Impact Statement	User Groups
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NextGen Connected Health Solutions (for hosted or SaaS clients)</li> <li>• NextGen Health Data Hub (Built on AWS only)</li> <li>• NextGen Office (Analyzing AWS)</li> <li>• Dental QDW (will migrate to AWS late 2019)</li> <li>• Patient Portal (Migrating to AWS now)</li> <li>• NextGen Mobile Solutions (Migrating to AWS early 2019)</li> <li>• NextGen Pop Health Solutions (Build on AWS only)</li> <li>• NextGen Enterprise API (Built on AWS only)</li> <li>• RCxRules (AWS only for SaaS clients)</li> <li>• RTS (for NextGen Eligibility and Response Services) migrated to AWS</li> </ul>	<p>immunizations, laboratory data, etc. It manages electronic billing, revenue collection, and custom grant reporting. The EHR automates access to information and streamlines the clinician's workflow. It supports care-related activities through electronic interfaces, including e-Prescribing, lab test orders and results, immunization registry data exchange, health quality measures data reporting. The system allows secure electronic communication with patients (Patient Portal) and other providers (NG Share).</p> <p><b>Program Impact:</b> Public Health Clinics would not have a secure HIPAA compliant electronic health information management system that supports Clinic services and workflow, billing and revenue collection, required reporting, and electronic communication with patients and other providers.</p>	<p>BHS Health Centers</p>

**City Applications and Programs affected by Amazon Boycott**

<b>Application</b>	<b>Use of Amazon Services/Products</b>	<b>Impact Statement</b>	<b>User Groups</b>
Nextdoor	Nextdoor is a rapidly growing private social network that connects people with their neighbors. The Nextdoor website and a data analytics solution is hosted on AWS, powering more than 69,000 neighborhoods across the United States.	<p><b>Program Impact:</b> City uses Nextdoor as communication tool with the Community</p>	Citywide
Tableau	Tableau Online is hosted by AWS. (Tableau also capable of integrating with AWS services and of direct connections to Amazon data sources including Amazon Redshift, Redshift Spectrum, Amazon Aurora, Amazon Athena and Amazon EMR.)	<p>The Public Health Division uses tableau to do data cleaning, data analysis and data visualization through the creation and use of dashboards</p> <p><b>Program Impact:</b> If we were unable to use Tableau, we would have to adjust workflows and identify suitable alternative product options. We have conducted reviews of other products before selecting Tableau and it has emerged as an industry leader. Alternative product options would likely be less efficient and effective than Tableau.</p>	Office of Vital Statistics
TrendMicro	Trend Micro is one of the largest independent enterprise IT security companies and hosts the deep security as a Service on AWS	<p><b>Program Impact:</b> City uses TrendMicro for the desktop and Server anti- virus protection. If we are unable to use TrendMicro this will impact the security of our core technological infrastructure</p>	Citywide