INFORMATION CALENDAR
January 23, 2018

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council
From: Dee Williams-Ridley, City Manager
Submitted by: Phillip L. Harrington, Director, Department of Public Works

INTRODUCTION
The Office of the City Auditor presented to the City Council a September 20, 2016 Report: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity¹. The City Auditor conducted the audit to assess whether the City of Berkeley is correctly billing customers based on their actual refuse collection levels; whether all Berkeley residents are signed up to receive refuse, recycling and plant debris collection service as required by the Berkeley Municipal Code; and whether there are opportunities for improving both refuse and service delivery operations. The City Auditor requested the City Manager report back to Council on the status of recommendations until fully implemented or otherwise addressed.

CURRENT SITUATION AND ITS EFFECTS
The Audit Report included twelve recommendations for the Office of the City Manager; and Departments of Finance, Information Technology, and Public Works to review, implement, and report to Council regarding the status of recommendations. This is the initial status report on those recommendations: six have been implemented; one has been partially implemented; one has been alternative implemented; and four have not been implemented.

The Public Works Zero Waste Division’s progress toward implementing the audit recommendations has been hindered due to staff vacancies, including management positions, and competing priorities. Since September 2016, both the Solid Waste & Recycling and Recycling Program managers have been hired. Both have extensive solid waste industry experience and many initiatives and programs are being reviewed,

¹ [https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level_3_-_General/A.2_RPT_Refuse%20Billing_Issue%20Fiscal%20Year%202016.pdf](https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level_3_-_General/A.2_RPT_Refuse%20Billing_Issue%20Fiscal%20Year%202016.pdf)
updated and/or revised. The next status report to Council is scheduled to be submitted in July 2018.

Below is a summary of the implementation status of those recommendations pertaining to the City Manager’s Office and the Finance, Information Technology, and Public Works departments:

Recommendation 1.1

Status: Implemented. Since late 2015, Zero Waste, 311, and IT (collectively the Customer Solutions Group or Group) have met on a monthly basis to discuss operational issues that affect the three divisions. Given that this Group was already in place and per the Auditor’s recommendation, the Group opted to include Finance as a participant instead of creating a separate team and meeting.

The meetings’ monthly agenda identifies the Group’s primary focus is the development and continuous implementation of a common approach by all members to ensure a unified vision for zero waste operations for all community members. In addition, the meetings’ agenda details customers’ issues as they occur, so that Group members may resolve them. These resolutions are applied by the Group to continue its efforts to strive towards the City’s zero waste goals and the initiatives needed to attain these goals.

Recommendation 1.2

Status: Implemented. Since late 2015, the Group has met monthly to discuss operational issues that affect its three divisions. Given that this Group was already in place and in October 2016, the Group opted to include Finance as a participant instead of creating a separate team and meeting.

Recommendation 1.3

Status: Partially Implemented. The Customer Solutions Group is constantly reviewing and updating standard operating procedures for refuse and recycling services; reconfiguring and updating webpages; and creating technical assistance tools for its zero waste customers.

In July 2016, the Group participated in an IT Strategic Plan Workshop to review the start of service process using the Rapid Workflow Process Model. And as of this date, the ERP implementation schedule hasn’t reached its scheduled timeline to integrate CX and RouteSmart systems. Nonetheless, the Group will use this Model to review other critical workflow processes to ensure that updates are developed in layman’s terms in its monthly updates.
Recommendation 1.4

**Status:** Implemented. As detailed in the response to Recommendation 1.2, the Customer Solutions Group expanded its existing monthly meeting to include Revenue Collections Manager and, as needed, staff from Finance Department. The purpose of these monthly meetings is to share information to all division and department staff about operational and staff challenges, such as, temporary truck constraints due to maintenance and repairs and manpower shortages due to sick or emergency employee leaves.

The meeting’s agenda designates specific staff members to develop solutions for each agenda item to implement of this recommendation. This initiative will be a continuous process with the meetings to continue for the foreseeable future to ensure that the dialogue continues to assist the management for the operations of Zero Waste, IT/311, and Finance towards customer, community members and businesses, oriented solutions.

Below is a summary of the implementation status of those recommendations pertaining to both the Finance and Public Works departments:

Recommendation 1.5

**Status:** Not Implemented. The current Customer Relationship Management (CRM) system will not integrate with RouteSmart™ due to both FUND$ and CRM system limitations. The City is currently engaged in the Enterprise Resource Planning process to replace the FUND$ and then integrate the CRM system, which according to the current schedule by July 2019.

The long term solution will be to procure a new customer management, operations and billing software that will fully integrate the RouteSmart™ with the new ERP.

Recommendation 1.6

**Status:** Implemented. The Departments of Public Works and Human Resources have reviewed the process of development of job announcements, such as, the recent hiring of Zero Waste Division Operations Manager to directly address the issues noted in this Recommendation.

With this job description for the Operations Manager and future Zero Waste management, administrative and operation staff positions will include a description of the interdepartmental nature of zero waste operations, and highlight cross-functional responsibilities.

Below is a summary of the implementation status of those recommendations pertaining to the Department of Finance:
Recommendation 1.7

**Status:** Implemented. The initial base rates were approved by Resolution No. 66,600-N.S. effective July 1, 2014 for FY2015. The Department of Public Works administration calculates the next Fiscal Year's rates based on the previous Fiscal Year's rates. The rates are calculated utilizing the current CPI, the published April annual rate, or 3% whichever is greater. These new FY rates and calculations are verified and signed off by Zero Waste Division Manager. The completed approved Rate Tables are then forwarded to the Finance Department Revenue Collections Manager for final verification and FUND$ system input for billing.

Below is a summary of the implementation status for each recommendation pertaining to the Department of Public Works:

Recommendation 1.8

**Status:** Not implemented. The CX module data utilized for this Audit was specifically designed to support the data request and this is what is called a bolt-on module, which means, it retrieves specific data requested from the CRM. Any module development requires IT to code, test and implement these bolt-on modules for a specific request. To analyze all appropriate data to identify a critical Zero Waste Division business need(s) would require the utilization of data residing in RouteSmart™. The Current CRM system will not integrate or auto-populate with RouteSmart™ due to CRM system limitations. Per the current IT ERP implementation schedule, the City is scheduled to upgrade and/or replace the CRM system in June 2019.

The long term solution will be to procure a new customer management, operations and billing software that will integrate and fully utilize the RouteSmart™ data. An RFP for an application that delivers the most efficient financial and operational software system specific to the Zero Waste Division operational and the solid waste industry requirements is scheduled to be developed in FY2018 as part of Phase 2 of the ERP project.

Recommendation 1.9

**Status:** Not implemented. IT has created a table for monthly routing development that extracts customer information from the FUND$ and provides the data to be then downloaded into RouteSmart™. Due to the FUND$ system limitations, this link takes hours to download information into RouteSmart™. The company, RouteSmart™, has stated that this integration process should take minutes. The City is currently scheduled to replace the existing ERP system in July 2019 and then the CRM system would be upgraded or replaced. With these two new systems operating, the next step in the process would be to integrate the RouteSmart™ system with them.
Recommendation 1.10

**Status:** Implemented. The Zero Waste drivers are reminded monthly to verify actual service levels with the route books for their collection routes by the Zero Waste Management Team. The Zero Waste dispatcher(s) are in constant communication with the drivers to ensure service levels are correct. If service levels are not corrected, Zero Waste Supervisor(s) undertake appropriate corrective actions to ensure verification.

Recommendation 1.11

**Status:** Not Implemented. The City Council approved a recommendation to replace the current non-exclusive franchise collection system for commercial refuse and recyclables with in-house commercial refuse and recycling collection services except for roll-off service. In FY19, Public Works’ will be issuing an RFP to solicit a consultant to review all Transfer Station and residential and commercial community members’ rates. Once contracted, the consultant will assess development and implementation costs related to redesigning the franchise commercial hauling system to provide for roll-off and compactor services. Then, the consultant will evaluate the financial and operational impacts of that system on the City and on existing commercial customers.

Recommendation 1.12

**Status:** Alternative Implemented. At its May 26, 2015\(^2\), the City Council approved a Department of Public Works Action Calendar Item to replace the current non-exclusive franchise collection system. The Council’s approved Public Works’ long-term plan for in-house collection of these non-exclusive commercial waste collection services except for roll-off and compactor services. This in-house commercial waste collection by Zero Waste Division is scheduled to start March 1, 2018 as detailed at the October 10, 2017 Council Worksession\(^3\).

Given the approved action with the non-exclusive franchisees termination, it would be neither practical nor cost-effective to undertake the task of investigating the past fee calculations. ZWD staff agrees for any future franchise hauler agreements for roll-off and compactor services that staff will have written procedures in place that describe the correct calculations to determine what that owe the City, and that staff will review invoices for accuracy in comparison to those calculation requirements.

**BACKGROUND**

Berkeley’s community members, residential and commercial, have reduced waste that is landfilled from 86,000 tons in 2007 to approximately 67,000 tons in 2015. The materials not landfilled have been reallocated from being buried in the landfill to

---


recyclable material streams. Therefore, the Department of Public Works’ Zero Waste Division’s Transfer Station is managing almost the same volumes. For example, plant debris and food waste have been moved from the gray/black refuse container to the green container for collection and is now turned into compost for beneficial reuse.

In 2015, the Solid Waste Management Facility Transfer Station accepted and transported to its contractors: approximately 67,000 tons of refuse (landfilled), 33,000 tons of plant debris and food waste (composted), 15,000 tons of fibers (diverted) and 30,000 tons of construction and demolition debris (diverted for sorting and reuse). This illustrates how materials that were once bound for the landfill have been successfully separated by community members, residential and commercial, into materials that are now recycled, reused and diverted from the landfill.

This relocation of these materials; refuse, recyclables and plant debris/food waste; that are collected is an essential service to protect the community member’s health. This effort also moves the City towards its goal of zero waste and its 2009 Climate Action Plan goal to reduce the landfilling of materials. The departments of Public Works, Finance and Information Technology have overlapping roles that should be seamlessly integrated to support this zero waste goal and reduction of landfilling materials.

In addition, Zero Waste’s operations; that is, collection of four different material types, delivery and collection of carts and/or bins, customers’ complaints, service levels, etc.; is a complex operation involving various departments’ systems that include various service delivery, manual and automated collection services, and revenue collection partners.

Therefore, it is vital to the Customer Solutions Group’s and City’s goal of zero waste and its objectives to direct, educate and advise all City departments and Zero Waste Division’s community members not directly involved of the City commitment zero waste and the always evolving approaches to accomplish it.

This coordinated and integrated customer directed service approach rather than a silo approach, i.e. departments’ work not integrated, to customer service will ensure the City’s goal and customers’ equity can be achieved.

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY
With the implementation of the Audit’s recommendations, Zero Waste Division’s opportunity to ensure all community members adequately and appropriately service levels are in line with the City Zero Waste Goal.

In addition, the implementation of this opportunity would in turn potentially reduce the volume of wastes landfill and:

- Increase residential composting, recycling, and source reduction.
- Increase commercial composting, recycling, and source reduction.
• Increase recycling of construction and demolition (C&D) debris.
• Expand efforts to eliminate waste at its source.
• Increase waste diversion in public buildings.

All of these above noted items promote the City’s zero waste goal and are included the approved Climate Action Plan Goals for Waste Reduction and Recycling.

POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION
Department of Public Works will continue to take timely and focused action(s) to address those recommendations that remain outstanding and partially implemented.

FISCAL IMPACTS OF POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION
The Department of Public Works will update Council on a periodic basis on the progress, resources available or additional funding needs to address those recommendations that remain outstanding and partially implemented.

CONTACT PERSON
Greg Apa, Solid Waste & Recycling Manager, (510) 981-6359

Attachments:
  1. Public Works Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations Summary Table
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Finding and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Finding: Integrated thinking about zero waste operations will help ensure accurate billings and customer equity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Agree to a common and unified vision for zero waste operations. Discuss the long-term zero waste goals, objectives, and key initiatives and share that information with those responsible for day-to-day operations. Use meetings and informal communications to regularly encourage staff to embrace a unified view of zero waste operations.</td>
<td>City Manager’s Office and Team Response: Public Works, Finance, and Information Technology</td>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>12/2016 October 2016</td>
<td>January 23, 2018 Update Implemented Since late 2015, Zero Waste, 311, and IT (called collectively the Customer Solutions Group or Group) have met on a monthly basis to discuss operational issues that affect the three divisions. Given that this Group was already in place and per the Auditor’s recommendation, the Group opted to include Finance as a participant instead of creating of a separate team and meeting. The meetings’ monthly agenda identifies that the Group’s primary focus is the development and continuous implementation of a common approach by all members to ensure a unified vision for zero waste operations for all community members. In addition, the meetings’ agenda details those customers’ issues as they occur, so that, the Group’s members resolve them. These resolutions are applied by the Group to continue its efforts to strive towards the City’s zero waste goals and the initiatives needed to attain these goals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Form a zero waste team comprised of managers and line staff involved with zero waste operations (i.e., waste collection, billings, customer calls, systems)</td>
<td>Team Response: Public Works, Finance,</td>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>10/2016</td>
<td>September 20, 2016 Update Implemented Zero Waste, 311, and IT meet on a monthly basis to discuss operational</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>support). Include a diverse pool of people who can share ideas, resources, and knowledge. Have the team members work collectively to evaluate their respective functions; the interrelationships among their departmental activities; and the practices, policies, and procedures they use to perform their zero waste account management and operations functions. Ensure that the team understands that their goal is to develop and support a holistic approach to zero waste operations not only to ensure billing accuracy, but also to help accomplish zero waste by 2020 and ensure continued efficient and effective operations beyond that achievement.</td>
<td>and Information Technology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>issues that affect the three divisions. This meeting schedule has been in existence for over one year. Since there was already a setup in place, we decided to include Finance as a participant versus create a separate team. We expanded the group and meeting scope to accommodate the Auditor’s recommendations. At every meeting, it will be the first agenda item to make sure all participants are made aware of the team’s concept. We will consider this completely implemented by October 2016, as at that time we will have met twice within the capacity required by this audit recommendation. This will be a regular meeting for the foreseeable future. The team members do understand that the Zero Waste operation is an enterprise with different parts and that the success of the operation depends on each of these distinctive units working together.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Require the zero waste team formed in response to recommendation 1.2 to develop written procedures that clearly support cross-departmental strategies and help staff perform their work, as well as understand how their work contributes to success. Include information that helps promote the unified view of zero waste operations, while also explaining the individual</td>
<td>Team Response: Public Works, Finance, and Information Technology</td>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>12/2017</td>
<td>September 20, 2016 Update Staff from the Zero Waste Division, 311 Customer Service Center, Information Technology, and Finance Revenue Collection are reviewing and updating standard operating procedures for refuse and recycling services; reconfiguring and updating webpages; and creating technical assistance tools for zero waste customers. In July 2016, the group participated in an IT Strategic Plan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Tasks that take place within the departments and how those connect. Examples include, but are not limited to, describing the process for routing customer cases from 311 calls, and detailing in layman’s terms the monthly updates that take place to align the CX and RouteSmart systems. Also see recommendation 1.2. |            | June 2019                                                           | Workshop to review the start of service process using the Rapid Workflow Process Model. The group will use this model to review other critical workflow processes. | **January 23, 2018 Update**  
**Partially Implemented**  
The Customer Solutions Group is constantly reviewing and updating standard operating procedures for refuse and recycling services; reconfiguring and updating webpages; and creating technical assistance tools for its zero waste customers. An example of this effort is Zero Waste and 311 identified issues related to responding to the community members complaints related to collection services. Zero Waste and 311 developed 311’s scripted response and Solid Waste Supervisor response flow chart to ensure these issues were addressed within a 48 hour time frame. In July 2016, the Group participated in an IT Strategic Plan Workshop to review the start of service process using the Rapid Workflow Process Model. And as of this date, the ERP implementation schedule hasn’t reached its scheduled timeline to integrate CX and RouteSmart systems. Nonetheless, the Group will use this Model to review other critical workflow processes to ensure that updates are developed in layman’s terms in its monthly updates. |
## Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.4 Require the zero waste team formed in response to recommendation 1.2 to have regular meetings, e.g., quarterly, to share information about their operations and the known or expected changes and events that may impact cross-functional efforts. These meetings may need to be more frequent at first and less frequent over time. The team should use their meeting time to:  
- Identify continued barriers to change.  
- Decide on solutions that will help overcome barriers.  
- Share information about the challenges preventing staff from meeting operational objectives.  
- Make cross-departmental decisions to improve processes and customer service.  
Also see recommendation 1.2. | Team Response: Public Works, Finance, and Information Technology | Agree | 10/2016 | September 20, 2016 Update  
Implemented. As we mentioned in response to recommendation 1.2, we expanded our existing monthly meeting to include Finance. The purpose of those meetings has always been to share information about operational and staff challenges. We expanded the meeting to include the specific suggestions of this recommendation. This initiative will be a continuous process that will be put in place for years to come as it becomes part of managing the operations of Zero Waste. |
| 1.5 In collaboration with Information Technology and as part of Enterprise Resource Planning, budget for, select, and install an account management system designed for zero waste activities. Use information from the zero | Team Response: Public Works and Finance | Agree | 07/2019 | January 23, 2018 Update  
Not Implemented  
The current Customer Relationship Management (CRM) system will not integrate with RouteSmart™ due to both FUND$ and CRM system limitations. The City is currently engaged in the Enterprise Resource Planning process to replace the |
### Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>waste team evaluation (recommendation 1.2) and zero waste strategy analyses (recommendation 1.8) to identify the critical business needs that should be included in the purchase of new zero waste account management system, or that should be considered when determining whether sufficient middleware options exist to fully integrate existing systems with the new account management software. Also see recommendations 1.2 and 1.8.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FUND$ and then integrate the CRM system, which according to the current schedule by June 2019. The long term solution will be to procure a new customer management, operations and billing software that will fully integrate the RouteSmart™ with the new ERP. Zero Waste Division and the Customer Solutions Group is actively engaging with IT to ensure that the new ERP system recognizes that Zero Waste Division is an enterprise funded operation. That is, it would be desirable to utilize RouteSmart system’s capabilities to generate customer driven service requests (work orders), whereas the current ERP system is a City staff internally generated system input. IT has recognized that to provide seamless CRM service that a Request for Proposals (RFP) for an application that delivers the most efficient financial and operational software system that specifically handles the Zero Waste collection services will be written in FY2018 as part of Phase 2 of the ERP project.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1.6 Incorporate systems thinking into the hiring process for both competitive and promotional recruitments:
- Describe the interdependent nature of zero waste operations in job announcements.
- Highlight the cross-functional responsibilities

| Team Response: Public Works and Finance | Agree Difficult to implement I and II because some classifications are not specific to Zero Waste operations but | September 20, 2016 Update | Public Works is currently recruiting for zero waste and using the interview techniques described. Finance and IT, however, are not in the process of, or able to identify when they will be, recruiting for a position for which this recommendation applies. Therefore, we cannot identify a future implementation date. However, both IT and Finance applied these concepts in | |

---

**Rate Dept.**

**Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan**

**Expected or Actual Implementation Date**

**Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary**

---

**Public Works**

**Finance**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree</th>
<th>Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>and relationships in job descriptions. Discuss cross-functional experiences during job interviews to gain an understanding of an applicant’s mindset about shared accountability.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>October 2016</td>
<td>recent hires. Additionally, all the departments intend to use the concepts described in the recommendation as much as allowable and consider this recommendation implemented. During the interview process, candidates are provided an overview of Zero Waste Division operations including relationships with other departments, the strategic priorities used to guide our everyday thinking and application of resources, and owning the commitment to excel in the areas of courtesy, knowledge, promptness, and teamwork. To the extent possible and allowable by the City’s recruitment practices, we will include in our recruitment materials information that conveys to applicants for general classifications that their work will include cross-functional responsibilities and shared accountability.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**January 23, 2018 Update**

**Implemented**

The Departments of Public Works and Human Resources have reviewed the process of development of job announcements, such as, the recent hiring of Zero Waste Division Operations Manager to directly address the issues noted in this Recommendation. With this job description for the Operations Manager and future Zero Waste management, administrative and operation staff positions will include a description of...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Require that someone other than the person who manually calculated the zero waste rates and entered the updated rates into the CX module perform an independent review of the calculations and data entry for accuracy. Have the reviewer report back on any errors. Ensure that management is also notified of the errors, verifies that the corrections were made, and signs off on the review.</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>07/2015</td>
<td>September 20, 2016 Update</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Completed. For FY 2016 updates, which was input in 2015, Finance implemented a Quality Assurance process in which an error report was produced by IT. The Supervisor reviewed the report and made corrective changes. The report was re-produced two other times to make sure all the error were fixed and the Manager of the unit signed off on the final report before finalizing system changes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

May 2017

January 23, 2017 Update: Implemented

The initial base rates were approved by Resolution No. 66,600-N.S. effective July 1, 2014 for FY2015. The Department of Public Works administration calculates the next Fiscal Year’s rates based on the previous Fiscal Year’s rates. The rates are calculated utilizing the current CPI, the published April annual rate, or 3%, whichever is greater. These new FY rates and calculations are verified and signed off by Zero Waste Division Manager. The completed approved Rate Tables are then forwarded to the Finance Department Revenue Collections Manager for final verification and FUND$ system input for billing.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.8 Request that Information Technology use the CX module data extracts, such as the one used for this audit, to provide Public Works staff with the data they need to analyze zero waste strategies. Use the data extracts to further identify the critical business needs for new zero waste account management software. Also see recommendation 1.5. | Public Works | Agree | 12/2016 | September 20, 2016 Update  
We will ask IT to provide our fiscal services and zero waste strategy staff with CX data using existing data extracts, and use that for data analytics using software such as Excel. We will use these extracts to help identify the reporting needs of a new zero waste account management system.  
If needed, IT staff can provide reports or training to Public Works staff so they are able to run the reports themselves or extract the information in the format needed, if feasible.  
December 2019 |
| Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity |
|---|---|---|---|
| Findings and Recommendations | Lead Dept. | Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan | Expected or Actual Implementation Date | Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary |
| | | | | The long term solution will be to procure a new customer management, operations and billing software that will integrate and fully utilize the RouteSmart™ data. An RFP for an application that delivers the most efficient financial and operational software system specific to the Zero Waste Division operational and the solid waste industry requirements is scheduled to be developed in FY2018 as part of Phase 2 of the ERP project. |
| 1.9 Perform, or contract for, a fully comprehensive route audit to align service delivery with billing rates. Use the route audit to: | Public Works | Agree | 07/2018 | September 20, 2016 Update |
| | | | | As part of the route audit, actual service levels will be compared against data in the CX module and appropriate updates made to ensure that all residential and commercial accounts are receiving required services and billed correctly for those services. Route books will also be updated to reflect the results of the route audit. |
| | | | | December 2019 |
| | | | | January 23, 2018 Update |
| | | | | Not Implemented |
| | | | | IT has created a table for monthly routing development that extracts customer information from the FUND$ and provides the data to be then downloaded into RouteSmart™. Due to the FUND$ system limitations, this link takes hours to download information into RouteSmart™. The company, RouteSmart™, has stated that this integration process should take minutes. The City will be replacing the ERP system in June 2019 and then the CRM... |
## Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.10 Enforce the requirement for zero waste drivers to compare actual service levels against route books and addenda during their collection routes, and report any variances to the Zero Waste Division supervisor for correction. Ensure that the drivers’ efforts are supported by taking action to correct the discrepancies. | Public Works | Agree. | 07/2018 | September 20, 2016 Update  
We agree that the actual service levels should be compared against route books but believe that enforcing the policy to have drivers do onsite comparisons is no longer an efficient use of our drivers’ time. We are exploring other options, such as using student interns to do the comparisons.  
January 23, 2018 Update  
Implemented  
The Zero Waste drivers are reminded monthly to verify actual service levels with the route books for their collection routes by the Zero Waste Management Team. The Zero Waste dispatcher(s) are in constant communication with the drivers to ensure service levels are correct. If service levels are not corrected, Zero Waste Supervisor(s) undertake appropriate corrective actions to ensure verification. |

The long-term solution is to integrate the new customer management, operations and billing software with RouteSmart™. With RouteSmart™ full utilization and the integration of a work order system, the invoicing system could be customer based, i.e. customers’ billing and services are directly linked with the new EFP implementation, to allow the City to more easily reconcile services provided with customers’ invoices.
### Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **1.11** When drafting new franchise hauler agreements:  
  - Clearly define the fee calculation requirements.  
  - Clearly define the type of financial data and reports that the haulers must submit to support their fee calculations. Create and enforce the use of standardized forms for the franchise haulers to use when remitting their fees to facilitate Public Works staff’s review. | Public Works | Agree | 12/2017 | September 20, 2016 Update  
The City has contracted with a consultant to assess development and implementation costs related to the City’s planned in-house commercial hauling system, and evaluate the financial and operational impacts of that system on the City and on existing commercial customers. The study will look at future franchise agreements for waste collection services and will include these factors.  
July 2019 |
| **1.12** Continue to investigate whether the franchise hauler erroneously | Public Works | Partially Agree | 12/2016 | September 20, 2016 Update  
City Council Approved a Public Works Action Calendar Item¹ to replace the current non-exclusive franchise collection system for commercial refuse and recyclables with in-house commercial refuse and recycling collection services except for roll-off service. In FY19, Public Works’ will be issuing an RFP to solicit a consultant to review all Transfer Station and residential and commercial community members’ rates. Once contracted, the consultant will assess development and implementation costs related to redesigning the franchise commercial hauling system to provide for roll-off and compactor services. Then, the consultant will evaluate the financial and operational impacts of that system on the City and on existing commercial customers. |
### Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree</th>
<th>Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Removed recyclables from its fee calculations and, if so, back bill as allowable, per state law and city code.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>June 2020</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>non-exclusive franchise collection system. Public Works’ long-term plan is for the department to take over all commercial zero waste services except for roll-off containers and compactors. Given the planned changes, it is not practical or cost-effective to undertake the task of investigating the past fee calculations. However, moving forward, for any franchise hauler agreements we may have, we will require that staff have written procedures in place that describe the correct calculations for determining what that haulers owe the City, and that staff review invoices for accuracy in comparison to those calculation requirements.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>January 23, 2018 Update</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Alternative Implemented</strong> At its May 26, 2015[^1], the City Council approved a Department of Public Works Action Calendar Item to replace the current non-exclusive franchise collection system. The Council’s approved Public Works’ long-term plan for in-house collection of these non-exclusive commercial waste collection services except for roll-off and compactor services. This in-house commercial waste collection by Zero Waste Division is scheduled to start March 1, 2018 as detailed at the October 10, 2017 Council Worksession[^2].</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings and Recommendations</th>
<th>Audit Title: Unified Vision of Zero Waste Activities Will Help Align Service Levels with Billing and Ensure Customer Equity</th>
<th>Lead Dept.</th>
<th>Agreed, Partially Agreed, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan</th>
<th>Expected or Actual Implementation Date</th>
<th>Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Given the approved action with the non-exclusive franchisees termination, it would be neither practical nor cost-effective to undertake the task of investigating the past fee calculations. ZWD staff agrees for any future franchise hauler agreements for roll-off and compactor services that staff will have written procedures in place that describe the correct calculations to determine what that owe the City, and that staff will review invoices for accuracy in comparison to those calculation requirements.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>