Page 1 of 14 20



CONSENT CALENDAR April 12, 2022

To: Members of the City Council

From: Mayor Jesse Arrequín, Councilmember Susan Wengraf, and

Councilmember Ben Bartlett

Subject: Assembly Bill 1944: Support and Seek Amendments

RECOMMENDATION

Adopt a Resolution approving a support and seek amendments position on Assembly Bill (AB) 1944 (Lee), which amends the Brown Act to permanently enable meetings of legislative bodies to be conducted through videoconference or teleconference with flexibility on noticing requirements. Send a copy of the Resolution to Governor Gavin Newsom, State Senator Nancy Skinner, and Assemblymembers Buffy Wicks and Alex Lee.

BACKGROUND

Under Executive Order N-29-20, signed by Governor Newsom on March 17, 2020, legislative bodies in California were able to hold public meetings via teleconferencing while removing provisions of the Ralph M. Brown Act that required that the agency post each individual address where agency members were teleconferencing from and enable the public to access those locations to observe and participate in the proceedings. Such flexibility is needed to enable social distancing and prevent the spread of COVID-19 and are still needed. Additionally, the need to shift to fully virtual meetings in response to the pandemic has demonstrated the ability of legislative bodies to have open and transparent meetings without the need to make a private address publicly accessible — many which are not able to accommodate people. Virtual meetings have resulted in greater attendance of elected officials and the public and more robust public participation all while protecting public health and safety.

Executive Order N-29-20 expired on September 30, 2021 and was replaced by AB 361 (Rivas). The bill amended the Brown Act to continue the flexibility afforded by EO N-29-20 during a state declared emergency. The bill also required that every 30 days the legislative body must vote to reauthorize based on findings around public health need. The authority granted under AB 361 for local government agencies expires on January 1, 2024. Therefore, there is a need for a permanent law to enable teleconference participation in government meetings.

The Berkeley City Council is currently piloting hybrid (in-person/virtual) meetings and will move to meeting in a full hybrid format soon. But to allow this flexibility permanently, further changes to state law are needed. AB 1944, introduced by Assembly member

Alex Lee, would make further amendments to the Brown Act to allow teleconferencing while suspending the noticing requirements for individual locations. Specifically, it will allow teleconferencing as an option for public participation in public meetings. The bill also allows for a member of the legislative body to teleconference from a private location without needing to notice the address or make it publicly available.

There are a couple of amendments that will help maximize the benefits of the bill. Under the current draft, legislative bodies would have to renew these changes every 30 days. This would require the Council (or any public agency) to call a special meeting, including during a recess period, just to be able to continue conducting meetings virtually under the streamlined authority in the Brown Act. One of the proposed amendments would be to strike the requirement that a vote must take place every 30 days to allow teleconferencing to continue under AB 1944. This would prevent the need to call special meetings to make findings every 30 days and ensure that there is no interruption in being able to hold virtual or hybrid meetings.

One other amendment proposes to change the bill to an "urgency" statute, which would take effect immediately upon passage, prior to the bill's current effective date of January 1, 2023. While this would require a two-thirds vote to pass, it is important that local governments can take advantage of the authority provided under AB 1944 immediately upon passage.

Overall, enabling teleconferencing capabilities for both the members of the legislative body and members of the public is beneficial in expanding accessibility and transparency.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

None

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY

There are no environmental impacts associated with the recommendations in this report.

CONTACT PERSON

Mayor Jesse Arreguín 510-981-7100

Attachments:

- 1: Resolution
- 2: Text of AB 1944

RESOLUTION NO. ##,###-N.S.

ASSEMBLY BILL 1944: SUPPORT AND SEEK AMENDMENTS

WHEREAS, the ability to attend and participate in public meetings is a vital part of our democratic process; and

WHEREAS, under the Ralph M. Brown Act, teleconferencing options are very limited, with only members of the legislative body able to participate remotely, along with the requirement that their location, often a private address, be publicly noticed and made publicly accessible; and

WHEREAS, during the start of the COVID-19 pandemic, Governor Newsom signed Executive Order N-29-20, which allowed legislative bodies to hold public meetings through teleconference and videoconference while suspending the requirement to post the teleconference locations of members of the legislative body; and

WHEREAS, the Executive Order expired in September 2021, but was replaced by AB 361 which allows a legislative body during the state of emergency to continue to meet via teleconferencing, if they vote to approve this policy every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, Assembly Bill (AB) 1944, introduced by Assemblymember Alex Lee, would make further amendments to the Brown Act making it easier for elected officials and the public to participate in meetings by allowing members of a legislative body to teleconference without needing to reveal a private address and make it accessible to the public, and require the livestreaming of such meetings and give the public the ability to participate by calling into the meeting; and

WHEREAS, enabling teleconferencing capabilities for both the members of the legislative body and members of the public is beneficial in expanding accessibility, and should be allowed under normal conditions, instead of only during a state of emergency.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Berkeley that it hereby adopts a support and seek amendments position on Assembly Bill (AB) 1944, and proposes the following amendments to the bill author, Assemblymember Alex Lee:

- 1) Strike the requirement that a vote must take place every 30 days to allow teleconferencing to continue; and
- 2) Change the nature of the bill to an "urgency" measure so that the provisions of the bill take place immediately without the need for a state of emergency to be in effect, instead of waiting until January 1, 2024.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that copies of this Resolution be sent to Governor Gavin Newsom, State Senator Nancy Skinner, and Assemblymembers Buffy Wicks and Alex Lee.

ASSEMBLY BILL

No. 1944

Introduced by Assembly Members Lee and Cristina Garcia

February 10, 2022

An act to amend Section 54953 of the Government Code, relating to public meetings.

LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

AB 1944, as introduced, Lee. Local government: open and public meetings.

Existing law, the Ralph M. Brown Act, requires, with specified exceptions, that all meetings of a legislative body of a local agency, as those terms are defined, be open and public and that all persons be permitted to attend and participate. The act contains specified provisions regarding the timelines for posting an agenda and providing for the ability of the public to observe and provide comment. The act allows for meetings to occur via teleconferencing subject to certain requirements, particularly that the legislative body notice each teleconference location of each member that will be participating in the public meeting, that each teleconference location be accessible to the public, that members of the public be allowed to address the legislative body at each teleconference location, that the legislative body post an agenda at each teleconference location, and that at least a quorum of the legislative body participate from locations within the boundaries of the local agency's jurisdiction. The act provides an exemption to the jurisdictional requirement for health authorities, as defined.

Existing law, until January 1, 2024, authorizes a local agency to use teleconferencing without complying with those specified teleconferencing requirements in specified circumstances when a

AB 1944 -2-

declared state of emergency is in effect, or in other situations related to public health.

This bill would specify that if a member of a legislative body elects to teleconference from a location that is not public, the address does not need to be identified in the notice and agenda or be accessible to the public when the legislative body has elected to allow members to participate via teleconferencing.

This bill would require all open and public meetings of a legislative body that elects to use teleconferencing to provide a video stream accessible to members of the public and an option for members of the public to address the body remotely during the public comment period through an audio-visual or call-in option.

Existing constitutional provisions require that a statute that limits the right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies be adopted with findings demonstrating the interest protected by the limitation and the need for protecting that interest.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

The California Constitution requires local agencies, for the purpose of ensuring public access to the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies, to comply with a statutory enactment that amends or enacts laws relating to public records or open meetings and contains findings demonstrating that the enactment furthers the constitutional requirements relating to this purpose.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: yes. State-mandated local program: no.

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

- SECTION 1. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as amended by Section 3 of Chapter 165 of the Statutes of 2021, is amended to read:
- 4 54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted
- 6 to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency,
- 7 except as otherwise provided in this chapter.
- 8 (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the
- 9 legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for
- 10 the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20 21

22

23

2425

26

27

28

29 30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all otherwise applicable requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.

- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rollcall.
- (3) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations and conduct teleconference meetings in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public, public, except as provided in subparagraph (A). During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in subdivisions (d) and (e). The agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 at each teleconference-location. location, except as provided in subparagraph (A).
- (A) If a member of a legislative body elects to teleconference from a location that is not public, the address does not need to be identified in the notice and agenda or be accessible to the public when the legislative body has elected to allow members to participate via teleconferencing.
- (B) If a legislative body elects to use teleconferencing, they shall provide both of the following:
 - (i) A video stream accessible to members of the public.
- (ii) An option for members of the public to address the body remotely during the public comment period through an audio-visual or call-in option.
- (4) For the purposes of this section, "teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or

AB 1944 —4—

video, or both. Nothing in this section shall prohibit a local agency from providing the public with additional teleconference locations.

- (5) For the purposes of this section, "video streaming" means media in which the data from a live filming or a video file is continuously delivered via the internet to a remote user, allowing a video to be viewed online by the public without being downloaded on a host computer or device.
- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.
- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is

established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other 2 requirements of this section. 3

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11 12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

- (3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members.
- (e) (1) A local agency may use teleconferencing without complying with the requirements of paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) if the legislative body complies with the requirements of paragraph (2) of this subdivision in any of the following circumstances:
- (A) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency, and state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing.
- (B) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency for the purpose of determining, by majority vote, whether as a result of the emergency, meeting in person would present imminent risks to the health or safety of attendees.
- (C) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency and has determined, by majority vote, pursuant to subparagraph (B), that, as a result of the emergency, meeting in person would present imminent risks to the health or safety of attendees.
- (2) A legislative body that holds a meeting pursuant to this subdivision shall do all of the following:
- (A) The legislative body shall give notice of the meeting and post agendas as otherwise required by this chapter.
- (B) The legislative body shall allow members of the public to access the meeting and the agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3. In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body

AB 1944 -6-

shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment. The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend via a call-in option or an internet-based service option. This subparagraph shall not be construed to require the legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.

- (C) The legislative body shall conduct teleconference meetings in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties and the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency.
- (D) In the event of a disruption which prevents the public agency from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the local agency's control which prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption which prevents the public agency from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.
- (E) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time. This subparagraph shall not be construed to require the legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.
- (F) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the local legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (G) (i) A legislative body that provides a timed public comment period for each agenda item shall not close the public comment period for the agenda item, or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (F), to provide public comment until that timed public comment period has elapsed.

1 (ii) A legislative body that does not provide a timed public 2 comment period, but takes public comment separately on each 3 agenda item, shall allow a reasonable amount of time per agenda 4 item to allow public members the opportunity to provide public 5 comment, including time for members of the public to register 6 pursuant to subparagraph (F), or otherwise be recognized for the purpose of providing public comment.

- (iii) A legislative body that provides a timed general public comment period that does not correspond to a specific agenda item shall not close the public comment period or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (F), until the timed general public comment period has elapsed.
- (3) If a state of emergency remains active, or state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing, in order to continue to teleconference without compliance with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), the legislative body shall, not later than 30 days after teleconferencing for the first time pursuant to subparagraph (A), (B), or (C) of paragraph (1), and every 30 days thereafter, make the following findings by majority vote:
- (A) The legislative body has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
 - (B) Any of the following circumstances exist:
- (i) The state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of the members to meet safely in person.
- (ii) State or local officials continue to impose or recommend measures to promote social distancing.
- (4) For the purposes of this subdivision, "state of emergency" means a state of emergency proclaimed pursuant to Section 8625 of the California Emergency Services Act (Article 1 (commencing with Section 8550) of Chapter 7 of Division 1 of Title 2).
- (f) This section shall remain in effect only until January 1, 2024, and as of that date is repealed.
- SEC. 2. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as added by Section 4 of Chapter 165 of the Statutes of 2021, is amended to read:
- 54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.

1

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20 21

22

23

2425

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

- (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.
- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rollcall.
- (3) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations and conduct teleconference meetings in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public, public, except as provided in subparagraph (A). During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in subdivision (d). The agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 at each teleconference-location. *location, except as provided in subparagraph (A).*
- (A) If a member of a legislative body elects to teleconference from a location that is not public, the address does not need to be identified in the notice and agenda, or be accessible to the public when the legislative body has elected to allow members to participate via teleconferencing.
- (B) If a legislative body elects to use teleconferencing, they shall provide both of the following:
 - (i) A video stream accessible to members of the public.
- (ii) An option for members of the public to address the body remotely during the public comment period through an audio-visual or call-in option.
- (4) For the purposes of this section, "teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different

- locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or video, or both. Nothing in this section shall prohibit a local agency from providing the public with additional teleconference locations
- (5) For the purposes of this section, "video streaming" means media in which the data from a live filming or a video file is continuously delivered via the internet to a remote user, allowing a video to be viewed online by the public without being downloaded on a host computer or device.
- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.
- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is

AB 1944 — 10 —

established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other requirements of this section.

- (3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members.
 - (e) This section shall become operative January 1, 2024.

SEC. 3. The Legislature finds and declares that Sections 1 and 2 of this act, which amends Section 54953 of the Government Code, further, within the meaning of paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the purposes of that constitutional section as it relates to the right of public access to the meetings of local public bodies or the writings of local public officials and local agencies. Pursuant to paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the Legislature makes the following findings:

This act is necessary to ensure minimum standards for public participation allowing for greater public participation in teleconference meetings.

SEC. 4. (a) The Legislature finds and declares that during the COVID-19 public health emergency, certain requirements of the Ralph M. Brown Act (Chapter 9 (commencing with Section 54950) of Part 1 of Division 2 of Title 5 of the Government Code) and the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act (Article 9 (commencing with Section 11120) of Chapter 1 of Part 1 of Division 3 of Title 2 of the Government Code) were suspended by Executive Order No. N-29-20. Audio and video teleconference were widely used to conduct public meetings in lieu of physical location meetings, and public meetings conducted by teleconference during the COVID-19 public health emergency have been productive, have increased public participation by all members of the public regardless of their location in the state and ability to travel to physical meeting locations, have protected the health and safety of civil servants

and the public, and have reduced travel costs incurred by members of state bodies and reduced work hours spent traveling to and from meetings.

(b) The Legislature finds and declares that Sections 1 and 2 of this act, which amend Section 54953 of the Government Code, imposes a potential limitation on the public's right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies within the meaning of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution. Pursuant to that constitutional provision, the Legislature makes the following findings to demonstrate the interest protected by this potential limitation and the need for protecting that interest:

By removing the requirement for each teleconference location to be identified in the notice and agenda, including the member's private home address, this act protects the personal, private information of public officials and their families while preserving the public's right to access information concerning the conduct of the people's business.