Development Goals and Parameters (Ashby BART, North Berkeley BART)

September 2020

The table below consolidates a range of existing goals and parameters for future development of the North Berkeley BART and Ashby BART Stations, organized by topic. It is intended to provide a starting point for the Community Advisory Group, the Berkeley community, and the City's elected officials when considering future zoning and development alternatives for both stations. "Known" goals and parameters come from established laws, policy statements, and planning documents. These include Assembly Bill 2923; the joint Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) agreed to by the City of Berkeley and BART in December 2019; the draft Adeline Corridor Specific Plan and the North Berkeley Objectives issued by the City of Berkeley, and also referenced in the City and BART MOU; and BART's TOD Policy, Station Access Policy, Housing Policy, and Draft Transit-oriented Development Goals and Objectives. The "Unknown" category identifies topics for which there is not established policy or design direction in existing guidance documents.

Topic	Ashby BART	North Berkeley BART
HOUSING DEVELOPMENT	**KNOWN (BOTH SITES):** • **MOU Affordability Goal.** Ensure that at least 35% of total units constructed at North Berkeley and Ashby are deed-restricted affordable for Low (51-80% AMI), Very Low (31-50% AMI), and/or Extremely Low (<30%) income households, with the City making a preliminary decision to set-aside local funding by December 2020 (MOU, Part IV, Page 17). • **BART System-wide Affordability Goal.** There is a BART system-wide goal of 35% affordable units (MOU, Part I, Page 3; BART TOD Policy, referenced in MOU). • **BART Project Affordability Minimum.** No less than 20% of units may be affordable on any given BART development property, with priority on Very Low and Low households (MOU, Part I, Page 4; BART Affordable Housing Policy, referenced in MOU). • **Project Feasibility Required.** A future project must generate long-term revenue to support BART operations. Feasibility analysis should include the cost of new BART infrastructure needed to accommodate the project, including parking replacement, BART access, and civic space capital and operating/maintenance costs. BART has recently amended its TOD policy to discount land for affordable housing projects by up to 60% from fair market value, which can be incorporated into the feasibility analysis (BART Goals and Objectives; BART TOD Policy). • **Project Schedule.** Complete all housing and other aspects of the project within five years of entitlement (assuming healthy economic activity and financial conditions) and by no later than 2030 in order to fall within the 2023-2031 Housing Element planning period. (BART Goals & Objectives). • **Rental Housing.** Offer BART property via long-term ground leases only, to account for operational needs BART may have in the distant future; permit rental housing rather than ownership housing on BART property (BART Development Parameters; BART TOD Policy). • **Labor Agreements.** Support the local economy and provide economic opportunity through project labor agreements for the construction of the project. (BART Goals & Objectives; North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).	
	KNOWN (ASHBY BART): • **Ashby Housing Goal.** There is a draft goal for at least 50% of total housing units produced at Ashby BART to be deed-restricted affordable at a range of income levels including Moderate (80-120% AMI), Low, Very Low, and Extremely Low (Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 1, referenced in MOU).	**KNOWN (NORTH BERKELEY BART):** • **North Berkeley Housing Goal.** Seek to exceed 35% affordability goal; consider possibility for up to 100% of units to be affordable (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU). • **North Berkeley Feasibility Analysis.** Feasibility analysis for North Berkeley should consider whether any building on the zone of influence over BART facilities is feasible for affordable and/or market rate housing (BART Goals and Objectives).
	UNKNOWN (BOTH SITES): • Total number of units, market rate and affordable? Since the affordability targets are stated as percentages, does that mean that adding additional market rate units will result in more affordable units? Should affordability targets continue to be stated as a percentage or as an absolute number of units based on feasibility analysis? • Range and mix of affordability levels (extremely low, very low, low, moderate)? • Specific types of residents served, prioritized, or recruited (such as those who have been displaced, local residents, those with disabilities, families, etc.)? • Housing types and formats? • Unit sizes? • Timing and phasing of future housing development? • Other types of guidance?	
USES AND COMMUNITY AMENITIES	**KNOWN (BOTH SITES):** • **Land Use Mix.** The land use on both sites is anticipated to be predominantly housing along with open space, but could also include small-scale retail, services, office, and/or other community-oriented uses and amenities. • **Active Ground Floors.** Create active ground floors where feasible, with a mix of uses that complements the surrounding area (BART Goals & Objectives). • **BART Ridership.** Given that ridership generates long-term revenue to support BART operations, the final project and mix of uses must result in a net gain in ridership, preferably at times BART has capacity outside of the peak trip window (BART Goals & Objectives). • **BART Infrastructure Needs.** Site planning and placement of amenities must account for BART's infrastructure needs, including: clearance from BART structures; reconfigured site access and circulation for patrons; maintenance and emergency vehicles and staff; new amenities for the development such as open space; and station enhancements triggered by the development such as elevators, stairs, and lighting (BART Goals & Objectives). • **BART Operations.** Development must maintain access for all patrons and staff during all operable times and ensure safety and security for its patrons (BART Goals & Objectives).	
	KNOWN (ASHBY BART): • **Desired Non-Residential Uses.** Encourage the following types of non-residential uses (Adeline Corridor Specific Plan Objective 3, referenced in MOU): o A new African American Holistic Resource Center o Flea Market space o Ground-floor retail, restaurants, and family-oriented entertainment o Affordable space for neighborhood non-profits o Small, affordable workspaces o Universally-accessible event, recreation, and/or performance venue(s)	**KNOWN (NORTH BERKELEY BART):** • **Non-residential Uses to Consider.** Consider the possibility of limited, small-scale community, non-profit, and retail space to serve the immediate neighborhood, including the potential tradeoffs of including this retail instead of housing units (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU). • **Green Space.** Include green space as an amenity that enhances the neighborhood's sense of place (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).
	UNKNOWN (BOTH SITES): • Overall land use mix? • Specific number, type, size, location, and orientation of potential non-residential spaces and community amenities? • Specific tenants, non-profits, businesses, or other community venues to be included? • Other types of guidance?	

BUILDING FORM AND CHARACTER

KNOWN (BOTH SITES):

- **Height Parameters.** Zoning cannot restrict height below 7 stories (AB 2923).
- **FAR Parameters.** Zoning cannot restrict Floor Area Ratio below 4.2 (AB 2923).
- **Density Parameters.** Zoning cannot restrict density below 75 dwelling units per acre (AB 2923).
- **BART Operations.** Development should not limit or interfere with BART operations, either during construction or after completion (BART Goals and Objectives).

KNOWN (ASHBY BART):

- **Desire for Step-Downs.** Seek to step down to lower heights where development fronts on MLK, Woolsey, Tremont, and Essex (Draft Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 3, referenced in MOU).
- **Ground-floor Active Uses.** Require ground-floor retail or active commercial along Adeline and Ashby; residential or commercial allowed on ground floor along MLK, Tremont, Woolsey, and Fairview (Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 3, referenced in MOU).

KNOWN (NORTH BERKELEY BART):

- **Desire for Step-Downs.** Step down in height around the perimeter of the station, with consideration of varying street widths around the station (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).
- **Site Design.** Include spacing between buildings, setbacks, and plantings at the perimeter of the site (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).
- **Neighborhood Orientation.** Create a visual and physical connection with the neighborhood through architectural design, height, and scale (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).
- **Universal Design.** Consider universal design features in housing and other public and private spaces (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).

UNKNOWN (BOTH SITES):

- Number of dwelling units or amount of non-residential space?
- Actual zoned height and FAR maximums? 7 stories (AB 2923 parameter) is similar to what has been achieved in other Berkeley projects along corridors and in transit-oriented locations, though it can be difficult to achieve 4.2 FAR (AB 2923 parameter) in a 6 or 7 story building.
- Actual zoned density? 75 dwelling units per acre (AB 2923 parameter) is lower than what has been achieved in other 6-7 story projects in Berkeley, and in transit-oriented projects developed by BART. More units per acre could increase project feasibility and the number of affordable and market-rate units produced, and is BART's preference. Unknown factors such as unit size will significantly impact the calculation of density (smaller units will tend to increase the calculation of dwelling units per acre; larger units will tend to decrease the calculation of dwelling units per acre).
- Type, placement, size, scale, spacing, massing, and setbacks of buildings?
- Resolution of potential conflict between AB 2923 required zoning for height (must "allow" at least 7 stories) and the City desire at both Ashby and North Berkeley to step down development height at some edges of the site?
- Architectural styles, colors, and materials?
- Facade design and placement of building entries and windows?
- Design of building interiors?
- Other types guidance?

STATION ACCESS AND TRANSPORT-ATION

KNOWN (BOTH SITES):

- **Station Access Plan.** A future BART Station Access Plan must provide access for all patrons of all abilities, prioritize sustainable access modes per BART's Station Access Policy, and ensure multi-modal access including for walking, biking, public transit, taxis, carpool, car share, ride share, van pools, driverless vehicles, and cars, including consideration for those who live further than ½ mile from the station (AB 2923; BART Station Access Policy; North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU). In June 2020, BART was awarded federal and state grants to assist with station access planning for several East Bay stations including Ashby and North Berkeley.
- **BART Patron Parking Goals.** Both stations are classified by BART's Access Policy and TOD Policy as "Urban with Parking," with a goal to minimize the need for replacement of on-site BART patron parking. To offset the loss of patron parking spaces, future development must incorporate non-auto, multimodal access alternatives to BART patrons and maximize use of existing parking capacity (BART Access Policy and TOD Policy).
- **Cost of BART Patron Parking.** New BART patron parking typically costs between $60K-$80K per space to construct; it usually requires a subsidy to build, and is usually not possible to finance with just the small amount of revenue it generates.
- **Residential Parking.** No more than 0.5 parking spaces per new residential unit is allowed (AB 2923; Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 5, referenced in MOU).
- **Office Parking.** No more than 1.6 parking spaces per 1,000 sf of new office space is allowed (AB 2923; Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 5, referenced in MOU).
- **Bicycle Parking.** At least 1 bicycle parking space required per new residential unit is required (AB 2923).
- **Unbundled Parking.** Shared or unbundled vehicle parking is allowed for new development (AB 2923).
- **Transportation Demand Management:** Include aggressive and innovative Transportation Demand Strategies and other best practices to reduce demand for parking, single-use car trips, traffic, and parking impacts in surrounding neighbohroods (Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 5 and North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).

KNOWN (ASHBY BART):

- **Bike/Ped Connections.** Provide pedestrian and bicycle connections to and through the site, including at least A) the connection of the Woolsey/Prince cycle track across the site, and B) an off-street protected bicycle facility along Adeline Street between Ashby and the intersection with MLK (Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 5, referenced in MOU).

KNOWN (NORTH BERKELEY BART):

- **Bike/Ped Access.** Support safe station access for bicyclists and pedestrians, including the bicycle and pedestrian access improvements currently underway (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).
- **Traffic.** Minimize neighborhood traffic and congestion impacts (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).

UNKNOWN (BOTH SITES):

- Future block and circulation structure?
- Location of future bicycle and pedestrian connections?
- Specific access strategies and priorities for various modes including: walking, biking, public transit, shuttles, carpool, on-demand transportation, scooters, passenger drop-off, driverless cars, access for those with disabilities and mobility impairments, and other types of station access?
- Amount of private parking to be provided for residential or non-residential uses?
- Amount of public parking to be provided for BART patrons?
- Amount and type of bicycle parking and storage to be provided?
- Other types of guidance?

PUBLIC SPACE

KNOWN (BOTH SITES):

- **Publicly Accessible Outdoor Space.** Development of both Ashby BART and North Berkeley BART will include provision of significant publicly accessible outdoor space (North Berkeley Objectives, Adeline Corridor Specific Plan Objective 2, referenced in MOU).

KNOWN (ASHBY BART):

- **Publicly Accessible Space(s).** Include one or more publicly accessible open spaces such as plazas, green space, pedestrian paseos, rooftop patios, flexible event space, or other public space (Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 2, referenced in MOU).
- **Flexible Civic Plaza.** Include a large, flexibly designed civic plaza that could accommodate the Flea Market as well as other potential uses like the Farmer's Market, Juneteenth, entertainment, and other civic events. The space could be on the west parking lot and/or in a nearby location such as Adeline Street (Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 2, referenced in MOU).
- **Public Art.** Incorporate permanent and/or temporary public art installations that celebrate neighborhood history, cultural heritage, and identify (Adeline Corridor Plan Objective 4, referenced in MOU).
- **Traction Power Station.** BART Traction Power Station at northeast corner of the west parking lot will remain, and may be reoriented and expanded; it should be accounted for in public space design and orientation.

KNOWN (NORTH BERKELEY BART):

- **Green Space.** Include publicly accessible green open space as an amenity that enhances the neighborhood's sense of place (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).
- **BART Tunnel Right-of-Way.** The diagonal stretch of land on the site above the BART tunnel right-of-way and zone of influence (around 28% of the gross site area) is not anticipated to include building construction on it, since it would present significant cost and engineering challenges; it provides a potential future alignment of the Ohlone Greenway and other public open space amenities through the station area.
- **Traction Power Station.** BART Traction Power Station at northwest corner of the site will remain in place and should be accounted for in public space design and orientation.

UNKNOWN (BOTH SITES):

- Specific location(s), size(s), dimensions, and design(s) of future public space(s)?
- Types of open space amenities to be included, such as recreation facilities, event space, garden space, plaza space, seating, or other amenities?
- Feasibility of different types of development to support the costs of construction, maintenance, operation, and management of public spaces?
- Activation, programming, management, and security of public space?
- Future potential outdoor programming or shared use such as the Farmer's Market, Juneteenth or other civic or entertainment activities?
- Types of vegetation, landscaping, trees, ecological performance, biodiversity, edible landscapes, native plants, and other natural systems?
- Other types of guidance?

SUSTAINABILITY

KNOWN (BOTH SITES):

- **State Building Code (CalGreen).** State building code requires baseline green building in a range of areas such as 30% energy efficiency reduction for residential and 40% reduction for non-residential; PV solar-ready rooftops; minimum water efficiency; construction waste reduction; and other features.
- **County Stormwater Requirements.** County "C3" stormwater regulations require stormwater treatment and retention through low-impact development strategies such as rain gardens, bioswales, retention basins, vegetated surfaces, and other strategies.

KNOWN (ASHBY BEART):

- **Electric Buildings and Chargers.** Adeline Corridor Specific Plan EIR Mitigations include a requirement for all-electric buildings, and electric vehicle chargers in future development; not referenced in MOU.

KNOWN (NORTH BERKELEY BART):

Electric Buildings and Net Zero Energy. All buildings should strive to incorporate green and sustainable features including at a minimum all-electric design, Net Zero Energy, and reduced parking (North Berkeley Objectives, referenced in MOU).

UNKNOWN:

- Energy performance beyond state code, such as improved energy efficiency, increased renewable energy production, district energy sources shared between buildings, or other energy goals?
- Water performance beyond state code, such as improved water efficiency, water reuse and recycling, and use of non-potable water in landscaping and building processes?
- Stormwater performance beyond existing County requirements ("C3" requirements) and BART requirements ("MS4" requirements)?
- Requirements for indoor air quality, green materials, and daylight?
- Zero waste strategies?
- Energy-efficient infrastructure?
- Other types of guidance?